



THE UNIVERSITY *of* EDINBURGH

This thesis has been submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for a postgraduate degree (e.g. PhD, MPhil, DClinPsychol) at the University of Edinburgh. Please note the following terms and conditions of use:

- This work is protected by copyright and other intellectual property rights, which are retained by the thesis author, unless otherwise stated.
- A copy can be downloaded for personal non-commercial research or study, without prior permission or charge.
- This thesis cannot be reproduced or quoted extensively from without first obtaining permission in writing from the author.
- The content must not be changed in any way or sold commercially in any format or medium without the formal permission of the author.
- When referring to this work, full bibliographic details including the author, title, awarding institution and date of the thesis must be given.

AN EVALUATION OF THE QŪT AL-QULŪB OF AL-MAKKĪ WITH
AN ANNOTATED TRANSLATION OF HIS KITĀB AL-TAWBA.

W.Mohd Azam b. Mohd Amin

Ph.D

University of Edinburgh

1991



ACKNOWLEDGEMENT.

Firstly, I wish to express my profound thankfulness to my supervisor, Dr. Carole Hillenbrand. I am deeply grateful to her for expert guidance and continuous encouragement for the past three years. She also patiently supervised the whole of this work and frequently made useful suggestions for alterations or additions. Her advice and criticism have been of great value, sustaining this work especially during the period of its preparation.

I also owe a special debt of gratitude to Dr. M.V. McDonald who thoroughly supervised this work especially for the translation part. His guidance and assistance throughout my studies deserve a special vote of thanks.

I would like to acknowledge my gratitude to Dr. I.K.A. Howard for lending me a number of his useful books for my research. The departmental secretary, Miss Irene Crawford, certainly deserves my gratitude. She has been most helpful and co-operative in every possible way.

Secondly, I would like to acknowledge a debt of gratitude to the Public Service Department of Malaysia for granting me the Academic Staff Training Scheme Program scholarship (SLAB) for almost three years.

ABSTRACT

This thesis seeks to study in depth the contribution to Sufism made by the little-known 4th/10th century figure Abū Ṭālib al-Makkī. The first chapter deals with an analysis of the life and works of al-Makkī against the background of the religious milieu of his time. A major section of the thesis (the second and third chapters) provides for the first time in English a translation of the Kitāb al-tawba of al-Makkī. The fourth chapter assesses the originality of al-Makkī's Kitāb al-tawba and compares it with similar Ṣūfī works of the period. The fifth chapter attempts to compare and contrast al-Makkī and al-Ghazālī's approach to Sufism through an analysis of their respective Kitāb al-tawba.

It has long been known that in his work on Sufism, al-Ghazālī depended very heavily upon al-Makkī. This thesis conclusively proves this dependence whilst pointing to the more sophisticated presentation of al-Ghazālī. Al-Makkī is shown to have been one of the early Ṣūfī figures who tried to harmonise the views of the Baṣran and Baghdād Ṣūfī groups and to effect a synthesis between moderate Sufism and the Sharī'a.

NOTES ON TRANSLITERATION

The system of transliteration of Arabic that has been adopted throughout this work is the one employed by the Encyclopaedia of Islam with the following modifications.

j	instead of <u>dj</u>	for ج
kh	instead of <u>kh</u>	for ح
q	instead of <u>q</u>	for ق

TABLE OF CONTENTS.

Acknowledgements	i
Abstract	iii
Notes on Translation	iv
Table of contents	v
Abbreviations	viii

CHAPTER ONE: ABŪ ṬĀLIB AL-MAKKĪ

1.1 Birth, Name and Early Education	1
1.2 Life at Baṣra	4
1.2.1 The Sālimiyya	5
1.3 Life at Baghdād	8
1.3.1 The Ṣūfī School of Baghdād	9
1.4 Al-Makkī's Death	15
1.5 Al-Makkī's Attitude Towards Tradition	16
1.6 The Image of al-Makkī As presented In Muslim Sources During the Pre-Modern Period (10th-17th centuries)	20
1.7 Modern Scholarship on al-Makkī	27
1.8 The Works of Abū Ṭālib al-Makkī	34
1.8.1 The contents of 'Ilm al-Qulūb	35
1.8.2 The contents of Qūt al-Qulūb	42
Notes	45

CHAPTER TWO: THE TRANSLATION OF AL-MAKKĪ'S KITĀB AL-TAWBA I (The Translation of al-Makkī's Kitāb al-Tawba)

Notes	101
-------	-----

CHAPTER THREE: THE TRANSLATION OF AL-MAKKĪ'S KITĀB AL-TAWBA II (The Continuation of The Translation of al-Makkī's

Kitāb al-Tawba)	109
Notes	155
<u>CHAPTER FOUR: THE ORIGINALITY OF AL-MAKKĪ'S WORK</u>	158
4.0 The Plan Of al-Makkī's Chapter of Repentance	158
4.1 ANALYSIS OF THE CHAPTER	166
4.1.1 Contents of the Chapter	166
4.1.2 The Method of Presentation and Style used by al-Makki	169
4.1.3 A Brief Comparison Between al-Makkī's Chapter of Repentance with similar chapters on this topic written by his predecessors and his contemporaries.	172
4.1.4 A Brief Comparison Between the <u>Qūt</u> and the ' <u>Ilm al-Qulūb</u> .	178
4.2 THE CONTRIBUTION OF AL-MAKKĪ	182
4.2.1 Al-Makkī's Attitude towards innovation.	182
4.2.2 Al-Makkī's Attitude towards Sahl, al-Junayd and Abū Yazīd al-Bisṭāmī.	185
NOTES	187
<u>CHAPTER FIVE: THE INFLUENCE OF AL-MAKKĪ ON AL-GHAZĀLĪ</u>	
5.0 Introduction	190
5.1 Comparison Between al-Makkī And al-Ghazālī With Special Reference to the Kitāb al-Tawba	192
5.1.1 The Plan of al-Ghazālī 's Chapter of Repentance	192
5.2 Analysis of The Chapter	193

5.2.1	General Introduction	194
5.2.2	Summarising al-Makkī's Material	195
5.2.3	Enlarging al-Makkī's material	197
5.2.4	Summarising And Enlarging al-Makkī's Material	210
5.2.5	New Material Added By al-Ghazālī	212
5.2.6	Stylistic Approach	215
5.3	General Comments And Conclusion.	220
	Notes	223
<u>SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY</u>		230
	Primary sources	230
	Secondary sources	235

ABBREVIATIONS.

<u>Bidāya</u>	: Ibn Kathīr, <u>al-Bidāya wa 'l-Nihāya</u> .
De Slane	: Ibn Khallikān, <u>Wafayāt al-A'yān</u> , (Tr. De Slane).
<u>Doctrine</u>	: M.A. Shukri, <u>The Mystical Doctrine of Abū Tālib al-Makkī as Found in His Book Qūt al-Qulūb</u> .
<u>E.I</u> ¹	: <u>Encyclopaedia of Islam</u> (Old edition, 1913-1936).
<u>E.I</u> ²	: <u>Encyclopaedia of Islam</u> (New edition, 1954-).
<u>E.I(s)</u>	: <u>Shorter Encyclopaedia of Islam</u> .
<u>GAL</u>	: Brockelmann, <u>Geschichte der Arabischen Literatur</u> .
<u>Ghunya</u>	: Al-Jīlānī, <u>Kitāb al-Ghunya li Tālib Tarīq al-Haqq</u> .
<u>Hilya</u>	: Al-Iṣfahānī, <u>Hilyat al-Awliyā'</u> .
<u>Huffāz</u>	: Al-Dhahabī, <u>Tadhkirat al-Huffāz</u> .
<u>'Ibar</u>	: Al-Dhahabī, <u>Kitāb al-'Ibar fī Khabar man Ghabar</u> .
<u>I.C</u>	: <u>Islamic Culture</u> .
<u>Ihyā'</u>	: Al-Ghazālī, <u>Ihyā' 'Ulūm al-Dīn</u> .
<u>'Ilm</u>	: Al-Makkī, <u>'Ilm al-Qulūb</u> .
<u>I.Q</u>	: <u>Islamic Quarterly</u> .
<u>I.S</u>	: <u>Islamic Studies</u> .
<u>Isāba</u>	: Ibn Ḥajar, <u>Al-Isāba fī Tamyīz al-Ṣaḥāba</u> .
<u>JRAS</u>	: <u>Journal of The Royal Asiatic Society</u> .
<u>Kāmil</u>	: Ibn al-Athīr, <u>al-Kāmil fi 'l-Tārīkh</u> .
<u>Kashf</u>	: Al-Ḥujwīrī, <u>Kashf al-Maḥjūb</u> , (Tr. R.A. Nicholson).
<u>Kubrā</u>	: Ibn Sa'd, <u>Tabaqāt al-Kubrā</u> .

<u>Lisān</u>	: Ibn Ḥajar al-‘Asqalānī, <u>Lisān al-Mīzān</u> .
<u>Luma‘</u>	: Al-Sarrāj, <u>Kitāb al-Luma‘</u> .
<u>Mir‘āt</u>	: Al-Yāfi‘ī, <u>Mir‘āt al-Janān</u> .
<u>Muntazam</u>	: Al-Jawzī, <u>Al-Muntazam</u> .
<u>Mu‘tamad</u>	: Al-Farrā’, <u>al-Mu‘tamad fī Uṣūl al-Dīn</u> .
<u>MW</u>	: <u>Muslim World</u> .
<u>Mystics</u>	: R.A.Nicholson, <u>Mystics Of Islam</u> .
<u>Mystical</u>	: G.Böwering, <u>The Mystical Vision of Existence in Classical Islam</u> .
<u>Passion</u>	: L.Massignon, <u>The Passion of al-Hallāj</u> .
<u>Qūt</u>	: Al-Makkī, <u>Qūt al-Qulūb</u> .
<u>Rābi‘a</u>	: M.Smith, <u>Rābi‘a the Mystic</u> .
<u>Rasā’il</u>	: Al-Rundī, <u>al-Rasā’il al-Suḡhrā</u> .
<u>Ri‘āya</u>	: Al-Muḥāsibī, <u>al-Ri‘āya li Huqūq Allāh</u> .
<u>Sālimiyya</u>	: L.Massignon, "Sālimiyya", <u>E.I</u> ¹ .
<u>Sezgin</u>	: F.Sezgin, <u>Geschichte Des Arabischen Schrifttums</u> .
<u>Shadharāt</u>	: Ibn al-‘Imād al-Ḥanbalī, <u>Shadharāt al-Dhahab</u> .
<u>Shāfi‘iyya</u>	: Al-Subkī, <u>Tabaqāt al-Shāfi‘iyya al-Kubrā</u> .
<u>Sifat</u>	: Al-Jawzī, <u>Sifat al-Safwa</u> .
<u>Sufism</u>	: A.J.Arberry, <u>Sufism</u> .
<u>Tabaqāt</u>	: Al-Sulamī, <u>Tabaqāt al-Sūfiyya</u> .
<u>Tadhkirat</u>	: Farīd al-Dīn ‘Aṭṭār, <u>Tadhkirat al-Awliyā’</u> .
<u>Talbīs</u>	: Al-Jawzī, <u>Talbīs al-Iblīs</u> .

Tārīkh : Al-Baghdādī, Tārīkh Baghdād.
Wafayāt : Ibn Khallikān, Wafayāt al-A‘yān, (Ed. Iḥsan ‘Abbās).
Wāfī : Al-Ṣafadī, Wāfī bi ‘l-Wafayāt.

CHAPTER ONE

Abū Ṭālib Al-Makkī.

1.1 Birth, Name And Early Education.

Abū Ṭālib Muḥammad Ibn ‘Alī Ibn ‘Aṭiyya al-Ḥārithī al-‘Ajamī al-Makkī was born in the province of al-Jibāl but the date of his birth is unknown¹. Indeed, the sources reveal little information which might shed light on this. It is probable, however, given his date of death 386/996, his alleged meeting with Ibn Sālim² (d.350/960) and his early education under Abū Sa‘īd Ibn al-A‘rābī³ (d.341/950), that he must have been born some time between 930-940.

He is said to have been brought up in Mecca and it was thus that he acquired the nisba by which he is generally known. As regards the title al-Ḥārithī, it could refer to a number of tribes, and it is not known to which of them Abū Ṭālib belonged. The title al-‘Ajamī applied to the inhabitants of the non-Arabic speaking of Muslim world, especially the provinces of Iran.

Of his life very little is known. After his birth in al-Jibāl, his family must have moved to Mecca probably when he was very young since he was always known by the nisba al-Makkī. He obtained a systematic

education in Mecca under Abū Sa'īd Ibn al-A'rābī, 'Ābid al-Shaṭṭ al-Muẓaffar b. Sahl⁴ and Abū 'Alī al-Kirmānī⁵, all of whom he referred to as "our master" (shaykhunā).

Nothing has come to light in other sources about any of these teachers of al-Makkī, except Abū Sa'īd Ibn al-A'rābī who was one of the outstanding pupils of al-Junayd (d.298/910). Abū Sa'īd Aḥmad Ibn Muḥammad Ibn Ziyād Ibn Bishr Ibn al-A'rābī who was born in Baṣra⁶ is said to have stayed in Baghdād and to have frequented the circle of the Baghdād Ṣūfīs under the supervision of al-Junayd.⁷ After leaving Baghdād, he ultimately settled in Mecca. Then he became the venerated shaykh of the two Holy Cities, Mecca and Medina. Abū Sa'īd is said to have compiled many treatises on a variety of topics including mysticism and history⁸. One of his writings is Tabaqāt al-Nussāk of which al-Makkī related:⁹

When our Shaykh Abū Sa'īd Ibn al-A'rābī wrote his book Tabaqāt al-Nussāk, he described the first people who taught and expounded this knowledge and the others who came after them, the men of Baṣra, the Syrians and the Khurāsānīs right up until the last of them, the Baghdādīs. He also said "that the last person to teach this knowledge was Junayd al-Qawārīrī and he had perception and truth and expressed himself well. After him there remained only those who aroused indignation through consorting with them. He said on another occasion: there remained after Junayd only those whom one is ashamed to mention.

From this account it can be assumed that al-Makkī probably became familiar with the teaching of Abū Saʿīd in particular and also with the wider ideas of al-Junayd while he was in Mecca. It can be assumed that he underwent a systematic study of Sufism under this man while he was in this city.

At some point it is clear that al-Makkī also studied ḥadīth, especially the Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī, from the Shāfiʿite scholar Abū Zayd al-Marwazī (d.372/982)¹⁰. In another place in the Qūt, al-Makkī clearly mentions that one of his masters was Abū Bakr al-Marwazī who had frequented the circle of Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal.¹¹ His full name was Muḥammad b. Yaḥyā b. Sulaymān Abū Bakr al-Marwazī (d.298/910).¹² Conceivably al-Makkī studied tradition and the wider ideas of Ḥanbalism under the followers of this man.

Al-Makkī also obtained the permission (ijāza) to narrate ḥadīth from ʿAbd Allāh b. Jaʿfar b. Fāris (d.346/957)¹³. Apart from these men, he also related ḥadīth on the authority of Abū Bakr al-Mufīd al-Jarjarāyī (d.378/988)¹⁴. This man was a well known muḥaddith of the time, to whom Ibn al-Jawzī¹⁵ gives a long obituary in which he is criticised for narrating weak traditions. Al-Makkī also related ḥadīth on the authority of ʿAlī b. Aḥmad al-Maṣīṣī (d.364/973)¹⁶.

It is probable, therefore, that before he left Mecca, al-Makkī had received a thorough grounding in both Sufism and some at least of the religious sciences.

1.2 LIFE AT BASRA

After deciding to leave Mecca, al-Makkī went to Baṣra. Little is known about his life there except that he was a loyal adherent of the Sālimiyya school of thought.¹⁷

Al-Baghdādī and Ibn Khallikān say that he entered Baṣra after the death of Abu 'l-Ḥasan Ibn Sālim (d.350/960)¹⁸ from whom the Sālimites took their name. This conflicts, however, with his own statement in which he clearly mentioned that he saw Ibn Sālim during his life time. He wrote:

Some of the pious predecessors (salaf) used to leave their whiskers (sibalayh) which are the extremities of the moustache. Such a practice is narrated about 'Umar and others. Likewise I saw Abū al-Ḥasan b. Sālim, may Allāh have mercy on him, doing this.¹⁹

If this statement of al-Makkī is to be believed, it can be assumed that al-Makkī entered Baṣra before 350/960 and that he had the opportunity to meet Ibn Sālim. It can be assumed that his relationship with

Ibn Sālim was close enough for him to have the opportunity to notice such a practice. Therefore, the views of al-Baghdādī and Ibn Khallikān seem to be incorrect. As for the Sālimiyya school of thought, it is important to discuss it in relation to the career of al-Makkī in Baṣra.

1.2.1

SĀLIMIYYA

The Sālimiyya was a school of dogmatic theologians (mutakallimūn) with mystical leanings. According to Massignon this school of thought was formed among the Mālikī Sunnis at Baṣra in the third and fourth centuries of the Hijra.²⁰ The real founder of this school of thought was Abū Muḥammad Sahl b. ‘Abd Allāh b. Yūnus al-Tustarī who was born in Tustar in 203/818. He was noted for his piety and was an eminent Ṣūfī of his time. He died in Baṣra in 283/896.²¹

Recent study on Sahl has shown that he was a prolific writer and many treatises were attributed to him such as Kitāb Laṭā’if al-Qiṣaṣ, Risālat al-Manhiyāt, Risāla fi ‘l-Ḥurūf, Kitāb Tafsīr al-Qur’ān, Kitāb al-Mu‘ārada Wa ‘l-Radd ‘alā Ahl al-Firāq wa Ahl al-Da‘wa fi ‘l-Ahwāl, Kitāb Daqā’iq al-Muḥibbīn and so on. The most important treatise of his is Risāla fi ‘l-Ḥurūf which was

treated in depth by M.K.Ja'far in 1965.²² G.Böwering also made a useful contribution in his study of Kitāb Tafsīr al-Qur'ān which was published in 1980.²³ Sahl attracted many disciples and students to study under him. These followers bore the name Sahliyya. According to Böwering, three of the disciples of Sahl al-Tustarī made great efforts to compile and edit this Tafsīr. They were 'Umar b. Wāṣil, Abū Bakr Muḥammad b. al-Ash'ath al-Sijzī and Abū 'Abd Allāh Muḥammad b. Sālim.

Abū 'Abd Allāh Muḥammad b. Sālim (d.297/909) succeeded Sahl al-Tustarī as the leader of this school of thought.²⁴ He is said to have been very close to Sahl and is described in Ṣūfī sources as the companion and disciple of Sahl.²⁵ He is said to have compiled and edited "a thousand sayings" of Sahl in addition to his contribution to the compilation of the Tafsīr. Under the auspices of Muḥammad b. Sālim, this school of thought came to bear the name Sālimiyya.²⁶ Al-Sarrāj (378/988) appears to have acknowledged Ibn Sālim as amongst the luminary Ṣūfīs at that time with regard to many aspects of Ṣūfī doctrines²⁷ except in the case of the utterances of Abū Yazīd al-Bisṭāmī who was strongly condemned by Ibn Sālim.²⁸ It may be pointed out that Muḥammad b. Sālim attracted many students and followers, one of whom was Abū Ḥulmān al-Fārisī al-Ḥalabī who is said to have founded the Ḥulmāniyya school of thought in Damascus. Abū

Ḥulmān was accused of being involved with the Ḥulūlī group (those who believe in the doctrine of incarnation).²⁹

After his father's death in 297/909, Abu 'l-Ḥasan Aḥmad (d.350/960) who was a great ascetic, succeeded him as leader of the Sālimiyya school of thought.³⁰ He became the outstanding personality of the circle of Tustarī's disciples at Baṣra in the first half of the fourth/tenth century as a result of studying the Tafsīr and the teaching of Sahl through his father in particular and Sahl's followers in general. Böwering asserts that Abu 'l-Ḥasan Aḥmad had the opportunity to meet Sahl.³¹ He is said to have experienced mystical states and was noted for his abstinence and self-mortification. One source reveals that Aḥmad b. Sālim also attracted many students, one of whom was Abū Ṭālib al-Makkī.³²

As regards the doctrines of the Sālimiyya, we know that our information is derived from later, mostly Ḥanbalite sources, such as al-Ḥujwīrī, Abū Ya'ālā b. al-Farrā' (d.458/1065),³³ 'Abd al-Qādir al-Jīlānī (d.561/1167),³⁴ Ibn al-Jawzī and so on, who were hostile to them. Therefore, the true picture of this school is still ambiguous. If all the alleged doctrines of the Sālimiyya school which are listed by al-Farrā', al-Jīlānī and al-

Ḥujwīrī and summarised more recently by Goldziher,³⁵ Massignon³⁶ and Böwering³⁷ are to be believed, it seems that their doctrines still did not deviate from the articles of the Islamic faith and certainly do not provide justification for the hostility shown them in the sources.

In Qūt al-Qulūb, al-Makkī refers to Sahl al-Tustarī as "our guide" (imāmunā)³⁸ and our "learned man" (‘ālimunā), to Muḥammad b. Sālim as "one of our learned man" (ba‘du ‘ulamā’inā)³⁹ and to Aḥmad b. Sālim as "our leader" (shaykhunā).⁴⁰ From this information it can be assumed that al-Makkī was an adherent of the Sālimiyya school, and especially of Sahl's teaching. No wonder that in his Qūt there are about two hundred quotations attributed to Sahl.

1.3 LIFE AT BAGHDĀD.

After some time in Baṣra, al-Makkī left for Baghdād which at that time was a major centre of Sufism. Nothing has come to light in the sources about the date of his departure for Baghdād. Very little is known about his activities in this city except that he is reported to have spoken in public whereupon he was rejected by the public because of his making strange utterances⁴¹ and

because he was accused of being a heretic. The offending statement "nothing is more hurtful to the creatures than the Creator (ليس على المخلوقين أضر من الخالق)⁴² is quoted by al-Baghdādī and Ibn Khallikān but its significance is not explained.

Al-Makkī is reported to have attained mystical states at the end of his spiritual efforts. Al-Yāfi'ī (d.768/1367) says:

Initially, he was a man who observed self-discipline and self-mortification and at the end (of his life) he attained esoteric knowledge and witnessing God (mushāhada).⁴³

After being rejected by the public al-Makkī is said to have lived in seclusion until his death. The sources reveal little information which might shed light on his family life. He is reported to have had one son whose name was 'Umar b. Muḥammad b. 'Alī (d.445/1053)⁴⁴ .

1.3.1 THE ṢŪFĪ SCHOOL OF BAGHDĀD.

It is also important to discuss the Ṣūfī school of Baghdād in relation to the career of al-Makkī in that city.

When talking about the Ṣūfī school of Baghdād, it is important to mention Abu 'l-Qāsim al-Junayd al-

Qawārīrī al-Nihāwandī, who also exerted great influence on al-Makkī. Al-Junayd was born and brought up in Baghdād, though his ancestors came from the Persian town of Nihāwand.⁴⁵ He obtained his early education under his uncle's supervision. The latter's name was Sarī al-Saqāṭī (d.253/867) who is reported to have founded the Ṣūfī school of Baghdād.⁴⁶ Apart from frequenting al-Saqāṭī, al-Junayd also used to attend the assembly of Abu 'l-Ḥārith Asad al-Muḥāsibī. Sarī al-Saqāṭī is reported to have said while al-Junayd was going to this assembly:

Yes, go and accept his learning and his discipline, and ignore his schismatic reasoning and his refutation of the theologians. As I was going out (adds al-Junayd) I heard Sarī saying: "May Allāh make you a traditionalist who is a Ṣūfī and not a Ṣūfī who is a traditionalist."⁴⁷

In addition to the foundations of Sufism which al-Junayd must have learned from his uncle's and his own personal example, al-Junayd also studied law and hadīth with such authorities as Abū 'Ubayd and Abū Thawr (d.240/854). Al-Subkī relates that al-Junayd is reported to have said:

Whoever has not learned the Qur'ān by heart and has not formally studied hadīth, and has not learned law is a man who should not be followed⁴⁸.

Al-Junayd is said to have laid down the major principles of the teaching of tawḥīd in the Ṣūfī school

of Baghdād. Under his auspices this concept which had previously only been discussed and defined by the theologians came to be elaborated in a different and specifically Ṣūfī interpretation. Nevertheless, as far as al-Junayd's doctrine of tawhīd is concerned, no profound study has been made explaining it in detail except that of Ali Hasan Abdel Kader.⁴⁹

Tawhīd according to al-Junayd as described by A.H.A Kader is the separation of the Eternal from that which originated in time (ifrād al-qadīm 'an 'l-muhdath).⁵⁰ This implies that one has to separate all other attributes, action and essence from God in order to fix or hold fast to the Eternal, Attributes and Action of God. This can be achieved by observing the concept of fanā'⁵¹ and the concept of mīthāq.⁵²

The concept of fanā' can be explained as obliterating one's attributes, action, self or in the wider sense, one's individuality, in order to present oneself before God. After obliterating one's self, one has to observe the concept of mīthāq which is a feeling of returning to one's first state, i.e. one becomes as one was in pre-existence before God. In such a state, one can testify to the majesty of God. This refers to the covenant which took place between the souls of men before they were created when God says "Am I your Lord?", and

they reply "Yes, we do so testify". Therefore, al-Junayd's doctrine of tawhīd can be understood as obliterating one's self so that one can present oneself before God as in pre-existence, and hold fast to Him; hence one is called muwahhid. It is preferable for one to keep on maintaining oneself in a state of longing for the presence of God, which is observing the concept of baqā' (longing for the presence of God).⁵³

It is worth pointing out that R.C Zaehner, in his attempt to explain this Ṣūfī doctrine, equated al-Junayd's concept of tawhīd with the teaching of Yoga in Buddhism.⁵⁴ According to Zaehner, this doctrine originated from Abū Yazīd al-Bisṭāmī (d.261/875). He became familiar with this teaching through his spiritual master, namely, Abū 'Alī al-Sindī who was a convert to Islam from Buddhism. Through the followers of Abū Yazīd, this doctrine was studied by al-Junayd. In more recent times there has been disagreement among scholars regarding this issue.⁵⁵

Al-Junayd seems to have accorded full respect to al-Bisṭāmī whose spiritual achievements he gratefully acknowledges. Al-Sarrāj relates that there was an occasion on which Muḥammad b. Sālim discussed a saying of Abū Yazīd al-Bisṭāmī with al-Junayd when the former condemned the utterance as being "more monstrous than

Pharaoh". Al-Junayd, however, remained silent on this matter.⁵⁶

Al-Junayd attracted many disciples including those who came from Baṣra. From al-Makkī's account, the followers of Sahl seem to have approached al-Junayd after the death of Sahl, but differences in practice arose between the Baṣran and the Baghdād groups. Al-Makkī relates:

When the Baṣran Ṣūfīs came to Abu 'l-Qāsim al-Junayd after Sahl's demise, he asked them, "What is your practice with regard to fasting?". They answered, "We fast during the day time and when we come to the evening we go to our supplies". He replied, "Oh, oh, it would be more perfect for your state if you were to practise fasting without supplies, namely if you were not to rely on an assured⁵⁷ amount of food.⁵⁸

Conceivably, some of the Ṣūfīs of Baṣra joined the circle of al-Junayd in Baghdād after the death of Sahl whilst some of them presumably followed Ibn Sālim. As regards al-Makkī, although he is described as a loyal adherent of the Sālimiyya school, his own writings as they have come down to us reveal that he sometimes clings to the teaching of the Baghdād Ṣūfīs such as al-Junayd, Ja'far al-Khuldī, Abū Yazīd al-Bisṭāmī and so on.

A clear example of this tendency is the case of

two servants who were asked to sacrifice some of their property for the sake of Allāh. One of them whose lower soul weighed heavily upon him, was reluctant to make the sacrifice but he strove against the lower soul and spent his property. The other one sacrificed his property in full obedience without any struggle from his lower soul. Ibn 'Aṭā' is of the opinion that the former is superior; al-Junayd, however, is of the opinion that the latter is superior. Al-Makkī asserts that he is in favour of al-Junayd's opinion.⁵⁹

In order to expound the importance of tawhīd, al-Makkī adduces a proof in which he quotes a saying of al-Junayd, of whom he relates:

Ja'far al-Khuldī said: I heard al-Junayd saying: "I went out from one of the villages of the children of Israel, intending to enter Mecca. Then I saw a person sitting under a tree and he said: "O Abu 'l-Qāsim every truth which is not followed by Sharī'a is kufr, and every tawhīd which is not testified by the Book and Sunna is zandaqa.⁶⁰

Al-Makkī also quotes a saying of Abū Yazīd al-Bisṭāmī in order to provide a description of those who observe tawhīd. He says:

Abū Yazīd said: One who observes tawhīd is one who sees nothing apart from Allāh, beholds nothing apart from Allāh, hears nothing except from Allāh, does not sit except in the (presence) of Allāh, does not converse except with Allāh, does not love anything but Allāh, does not submit

except to Allāh, and does not feel gratitude except to Allāh.⁶¹

From the above example, it is clear that al-Makkī does not totally rely upon the teaching of the Sālimiyya school, and that he clings on occasion also to the teaching of al-Junayd, especially with regard to the doctrine of tawhīd. He also follows the attitude of al-Junayd in according respect to Abū Yazīd al-Bisṭāmī although the latter is condemned by Ibn Sālim for whose leadership, however, al-Makkī still has a high regard.

1.4 AL-MAKKĪ'S DEATH.

After living for some time in Baghdād, Abū Ṭālib died on the 6th Jumadā' 11, 386/ 7th June 996. He was interred in the Mālikiyya cemetery on the eastern side of the Tigris.⁶² Details about his death are related by Ibn al-Jawzī who becomes the first extant source to relate such an account at length. Ibn al-Jawzī writes:

I heard our master Abu 'l-Qāsim Ismā'īl b. Aḥmad al-Samarqandī saying: I heard our master Abū 'Alī Muḥammad b. Aḥmad b. Maslama saying (I heard our master Abu 'l-Qāsim b. Bishr saying) I went to our master Abū Ṭālib al-Makkī at the time he was dying and I said: "Please give me your request". He replied: "If you find out that He has ended my life with a favourable ending, strew almonds and sugar over me when you take me to the grave saying "This is for the penetrating (one)", I asked: "How shall I know

that?", he replied: "Please hold my hand when I am dying, and if I clasp your hand with mine, then you may know that Allāh has ended my life with a favourable ending. If I do not clasp your hand, and I release your hand, you may know that He has not ended my life with a favourable ending. Our master Abu 'l-Qāsim said: "I sat beside him, he was dying and he grasped my hand firmly.⁶³

1.5 AL-MAKKĪ'S ATTITUDE TOWARDS TRADITION.

It has been pointed out⁶⁴ that al-Makkī narrated traditions on the authority of the traditionist, Abū Bakr al-Mufīd al-Jarjarāyī, who narrated weak tradition. Ibn al-Jawzī says that al-Mufīd narrated traditions from personalities who are not well known to the authorities of ḥadīth criticism (majhūlūn).⁶⁵ Ibn al-Jawzī relates a story in which Abū Bakr al-Barqānī went to al-Mufīd who dictated al-Muwattā' of Mālik b. Anas (d.179/795) to him. When al-Barqānī returned to Baghdād, he met Abū Bakr Ibn 'Alī who said to him that his journey to write down al-Muwattā' from al-Mufīd was useless. This was because al-Mufīd narrated al-Muwattā' on the authority of Ḥasan Ibn 'Ubayd Allāh who was regarded as a person who was not well known to the authorities on ḥadīth criticism.⁶⁶ It is conceivable that al-Makkī while studying traditions may have studied al-Muwattā' under al-Mufīd's guidance.

As already mentioned, al-‘Asqalānī points out that al-Makkī also studied Sahīh al-Bukhārī under the supervision of Abū Zayd al-Marwazī who was an eminent scholar of the Shāfi‘ite school.⁶⁷ Indeed, according to Ibn Khallikān, al-Marwazī was one of the outstanding Imāms of the Shāfi‘ite school at this time, and was distinguished by his skill in discussion of doubtful points. He taught hadīth at Baghdād for some time, after which he left for Mecca where he gave instruction in the Sahīh al-Bukhārī for seven years. Abū Zayd attracted many disciples, one of whom was a certain Abū Bakr al-Marwazī (d.417/1027)⁶⁸. This man is not the person of this name who is mentioned by al-Makkī in his Qūt.⁶⁹ Conceivably, al-Makkī, as well as studying Sahīh al-Bukhārī in particular under Abū Zayd al-Marwazī, may also have gained instruction in the wider doctrines of the Shāfi‘ite school. At some points it is clear that al-Makkī also gained instruction in the wider doctrines of the Ḥanbalite school of thought under the followers of Muḥammad b. Yaḥyā b. Sulaymān Abū Bakr al-Marwazī.

A careful study of the Qūt shows that al-Makkī also used weak traditions. In fact he clearly mentions that he prefers weak tradition to the use of reasoning (ra’y) and analogy (qiyās). He writes:

And weak tradition (al-hadīth al-da‘īf) to my mind is preferable to

reasoning and analogy. Such an opinion is in accordance with the view of al-Imām Abū ‘Abd Allāh Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal, may Allāh be pleased with him.⁷⁰

In order to emphasise the superiority of weak tradition over the use of analytical reasoning, al-Makkī supports the opinion of Ibn Ḥanbal (d.241/855) that if a weak tradition is not denied by the Book and Sunna and does not go against the accepted unanimous opinion the community and the Imāms, it is obligatory for the Muslim to accept it as genuine.⁷¹

Furthermore, al-Makkī appears to have had his own opinion on narrating weak tradition. He lists his methods of narrating tradition which can be summarised as follows. Firstly, it is permissible to narrate weak tradition when one has full confidence that is not forged tradition. Moreover, it is more important to narrate the meaning of tradition than the actual wording. Al-Makkī quotes the saying of Ibn Sirīn (d.110/728) who says:

I used to hear the tradition from ten people, they convey the same meaning, but the words differ. Likewise, the Companions differ in narrating tradition from the messenger of Allāh (P.B.U.H). Some of them used to narrate it completely, some of them narrated it in summary form, some of them narrated the meaning...

Al-Makkī goes on to say that a weak tradition which is not contrary to the Qur’an and Sunna may be regarded as genuine and is better than the use of

analytical reasoning. If there is a tradition which has been in circulation for more than three centuries or even for a century only it should be accepted as genuine on condition that it is not contrary to the Qur'an and Sunna and that it has not been rejected by previous 'ulamā'. Al-Makkī further asserts that he quotes tradition from pious predecessors, having absolute faith in them, since according to al-Makkī, they would not have indulged in fabricating traditions. He also uses the concept of "good perception" (husn al-zann) in relation to all of them. Finally, al-Makkī states that it is permissible to narrate authentic tradition by using a weak chain (sanad).⁷² From the above information, it can be assumed therefore that al-Makkī is not over-scrupulous in his own use of traditions and as a result this attitude of his became the subject of criticism for later scholars as will be discussed in a later section of this chapter.

To sum up, presumably al-Makkī knew at least the basic doctrines of the Mālikite and Shāfi'ite madhhabs, since he studied under scholars who were at least familiar with the fundamental tenets of these madhhabs. He sometimes refers to Imām Mālik⁷³ and Imām Muḥammad b. Idris al-Shāfi'ī (d.207/820)⁷⁴ in his work. Nevertheless, al-Makkī clearly asserts that he is in favour of the stance of Ibn Ḥanbal towards tradition. From an analysis of his works, it would appear possible

that al-Makkī is perhaps an adherent of the Ḥanbalite madhhab rather than of the Mālikites or Shāfi‘ites. This view is contrary to that of Massignon who generalises that the Sālimiyya including al-Makkī are adherents of the Mālikite madhhab. As for Shukri, he is of the opinion that al-Makkī was a Shāfi‘ite.⁷⁵

1.6 THE IMAGE OF AL-MAKKĪ AS PRESENTED IN MUSLIM SOURCES DURING THE PRE-MODERN PERIOD (10-17th CENTURIES).

Al-Makkī died in 386/996. However, Ṣūfī writers who were contemporary with him do not mention a single word about him. Figures such as al-Sarrāj, al-Kalābādhī (385/995) do not acknowledge him in their writings. This was probably because al-Makkī was too closely associated with the Sālimiyya school of thought.

In the eleventh century, most of the famous Ṣūfī writers and biographers whose works remain extant also remained silent about al-Makkī. For example Abū ‘Abd al-Raḥmān Muḥammad b. al-Ḥusayn al-Sulamī (d.421/1021) who wrote the Tabaqāt al-Ṣūfiyya⁷⁶ does not mention al-Makkī. Abū Nu‘aym al-Iṣfahānī (d.430/1038) who wrote Hilyat al-Awliyā’,⁷⁷ al-Qushayrī (d.465/1073) who wrote al-Risāla al-Qushayriyya,⁷⁸ Abu ‘l-Ḥasan ‘Alī b. ‘Uthmān al-Ḥujwīrī (d.465/1073) who wrote Kashf al-Mahjūb⁷⁹ also never refer to al-Makkī.

Among the first historians to mention al-Makkī were Shihāb al-Dīn Khafājī (d.451/1059), the author of Husn al-Riyād fī Sharḥ Kitāb al-Shifā'⁸⁰, Abū Bakr Aḥmad b. 'Alī al-Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī (d.463/1071)⁸¹, the author of Tārīkh Baghdād. According to Ibn Khallikān, Abu 'l-Faḍl Muḥammad Ibn Ṭāhir Ibn 'Alī Ibn Aḥmad al-Maqdīsī (d.507/1113) also mentions al-Makkī in his Kitāb al-Ansāb⁸² as does Muḥammad Ibn Khalaf al-Andalūsī (d.536/ 1143) who wrote the book entitled al-Wusūl Ila 'l-Ghard al-Maṭlūb min Jawāhir Qūt al-Qulūb.⁸³ However, the only one of these works which is now extant is the Tārīkh Baghdād of al-Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī. Because his account is the earliest surviving information on al-Makkī, it is given in full below:

Muḥammad b. 'Alī b. 'Aṭīyya, Abū Ṭālib, generally known as al-Makkī. He wrote a book which he entitled Qūt al-Qulūb in the language of the Ṣūfīs. He mentioned in it bad, forbidden things about the attributes (of God). He reported (traditions) from 'Alī b. Aḥmad al-Maṣīṣī and Abū Bakr al-Mufīd and others. I was informed about him by Muḥammad b. al-Muẓaffar al-Khayyāt and 'Abd al-'Azīz b. 'Alī al-Azjī; Abū Ṭāhir Muḥammad b. 'Alī b. al-'Allāf said to me: Abū Ṭālib al-Makkī was from the inhabitants of al-Jibāl. He grew up in Mecca, he entered Baṣra after the death of Abu 'l-Ḥasan b. Sālim and he affiliated himself to his (Ibn Sālim) doctrines. He arrived in Baghdād and the people gathered around him (to listen to) his sermon. He spoke confusedly. It has been recorded about it that he said: "Nothing is more hurtful to the creatures than the Creator". The people accused him of heresy and rejected him. Al-Makkī was prohibited from preaching in Jumadā' ii, 386. Al-'Aṭīqī said: He was a

pious man and devoted himself to worship, and he composed treatises on tawhīd.⁸⁴

At the turn of the twelfth century, the most outstanding scholar in the Muslim world, Abū Ḥāmid Muḥammad al-Ghazālī (d.505/1111) mentions that he is much indebted to al-Makkī's Qūt in his studies on Sufism.⁸⁵ As will be demonstrated elsewhere in this thesis,⁸⁶ some parts of the Ihyā' of al-Ghazālī are obviously copied wholesale from the Qūt al-Qulūb. Although al-Ghazālī does not mention anything about the life of al-Makkī, he is not afraid to acknowledge his debt to al-Makkī. He says:

I knew that the complete mystic "way" includes both intellectual belief and practical activity; the latter consists in getting rid of obstacles in the self and in stripping off its base characteristics and vicious morals, so that the heart may attain to freedom from what is not God and to constant recollection of Him. The intellectual belief was easier to me than the practical activity. I began to acquaint myself with their belief by reading their books, such as Qūt al-Qulūb by Abū Ṭālib al-Makkī (God have mercy upon him), the works of al-Ḥārith al-Muḥāsibī, the various anecdotes about al-Junayd, al-Shiblī and Abū Yazīd al-Bisṭāmī (may God sanctify their spirits), and other discourses of their leading men.⁸⁷

The historians of the thirteenth century such as Ibn al-Jawzī (d.597/1200), the author of al-Muntazam⁸⁸ and Talbīs al-Iblīs,⁸⁹ and Ibn Khallikān⁹⁰

(d.681/1282) also mention al-Makkī. Their sources were the Tārīkh Baghdād of al-Baghdādī and the lost work, the Ansāb of al-Maḡdīsī.

Al-Makkī's attitude towards the reliability of narrating traditions was a particular subject of criticism by Ibn al-Jawzī who wrote:

Muḥammad b. 'Alī b. 'Aṭīyya Abū Ṭālib al-Makkī who reported (traditions) on the authority of 'Alī b. Aḥmad al-Maṣīṣī and Abū Bakr al-Mufīd and others. 'Abd al-'Azīz b. 'Alī al-Azjī and others relate (tradition) from him. He was from the ascetics who devoted themselves to worship. Al-'Atīqī says that he was a pious man and devoted himself to worship. He wrote a book which he called Qūt al-Qulūb in which he mentioned traditions which have no origin. He used to admonish people in the mosque in Baghdād.⁹¹

In another book of his, Ibn al-Jawzī repeats the same criticisms and other allegations:

Abū Ṭālib al-Makkī wrote Qūt al-Qulūb for them (Ṣūfīs). He mentioned in it false traditions and that which can not be traced back to its origin, on the subject of day and night prayers and other false traditions. He also mentioned in it corrupt faith. He repeated in it the saying "*Some of the mukāshḥifīn say*", and this is an idle saying. He also mentioned that some of the Ṣūfīs (claimed) that Allāh Most Honoured and Glorified reveals Himself in this world to His saints.⁹²

After Ibn al-Jawzī, Ibn Khallikān seems to have been the first historian to talk about al-Makkī at

comparatively greater length. He gives the most detailed account in comparison with the other historians. He appears to have quoted from the Anṣāb of al-Maḡdīsī and the Tārīkh Baghdād of al-Baghdādī. He writes:

Abū Ṭālib Muḥammad Ibn ‘Alī Ibn ‘Aṭīyya al-Ḥārithī al-Makkī, a celebrated preacher and the author of the work entitled Qūt al-Qulūb (food of the hearts), was noted for his piety and the austerity of his life. He pronounced the discourses in the mosque, and composed some treatises on the tawhīd. Al-Jibāl (Persian Iraq) was his native country, but, as he had resided at Mecca, he obtained the surname of al-Makkī. He carried the practices of self-mortification to such a length that, it is said, he abstained from ordinary food during a considerable period and lived on nothing but wild herbs. In the use of this nutriment he persevered so long that his skin took a green tinge. In the Tradition and Sufism he received the lessons of numerous masters. He went to Baṣra after the death of Abū ‘l-Ḥasan Ibn Sālim and represented himself as a follower of his doctrines. Having proceeded to Baghdād, he gave a public exhortation, but got so much embroiled in his discourse that the people went away and left him. Muḥammad Ibn Ṭāhir al-Maḡdisī relates in his Anṣāb that when Abū Ṭālib went to Baghdād and preached to the crowded congregation, which had assembled to hear him, he got embroiled in his discourse, and in one passage, it is well recollected that he said: "Nothing is more hurtful to the creature (sic)⁹³ than the Creator". This made the people exclaim against him as a heretic, and finding himself abandoned by them, he renounced preaching. Abū Ṭālib died at Baghdād on the 6th of the later Jumadā A.H 386 (7th June A.D 996), and he was interred in the Mālikiyya cemetery, on the eastern side (of the Tigris). His tomb is a well known monument and

attracts pious visitors. Ḥārithī means related to al-Ḥārith, or to al-Ḥāritha, a number of tribes are designated by these names, and I do not know to which Abū Ṭālib belonged. Makkī signified native of Mecca.⁹⁴

This account of Ibn Khallikān is of interest because he draws on the missing work of al-Maqdisī. However, there is only one additional item of information which is not found already in al-Baghdādī's account. This refers to the extreme personal asceticism practised by al-Makkī himself which is apparently not mentioned elsewhere.

The famous historian Ibn al-Athīr (d.630/1233) also mentions al-Makkī in his al-Kāmil fi 'l-Tārīkh.⁹⁵ The thirteenth century Ṣūfī poet Mawlānā Jalāl al-Dīn Rūmī quotes from al-Makkī's Qūt al-Qulūb in his Mathnawī.⁹⁶ He acknowledges that Qūt al-Qulūb is one of the important treatises of Sufism for novices. In the Mathnawī he writes:

Nine hundred years Noah (walked) in the straight way, and everyday he had a new sermon to preach.

His ruby (lip) drew its eloquence from the corundum (precious jewel) in the hearts (of prophets), he had not read (mystical books like) the Risāla or the Qūt al-Qulūb.⁹⁷

Many personalities of the fourteenth century wrote about al-Makkī. One of them was the outstanding

figure of the Ḥanbalite school, Ibn Taymiyya (d.729/1328). He criticises al-Makkī for using forged Tradition in his writings. This can be seen in Ibn Taymiyya's Majmū' Fatāwā.⁹⁸

Shams al-Dīn al-Dhahabī (d.748/1347), the author of al-ʿIbar fī Khabar Man Ghabar⁹⁹ and Tadhkirat al-Huffāz also mentions al-Makkī in his writings. Al-Ṣafadī (d.764/1363) mentions al-Makkī in his al-Wāfī bi'l-Wafayāt as well.¹⁰⁰ These sources generally repeat the information given by al-Baghdādī, without adding any comment, but it is al-Dhahabī who states clearly for the first time that, in his opinion at any rate, al-Makkī was a pupil of Ibn Sālim.

Abū ʿAbd Allāh Muḥammad b. Abī Ishāq Ibrāhīm al-Nafzī al-Ḥimyārī al-Rundī (d.792/1390) became the second person after al-Ghazālī who was influenced substantially by the teaching of al-Makkī. He is said to have spent much time studying and explaining the writings of al-Makkī especially al-Bayān al-Shāfī.¹⁰¹ However, this work is no longer extant. As mentioned earlier, Abū Muḥammad ʿAbd Allāh b. Sulaymān ʿAfīf al-Dīn al-Yāfiʿī (768/1367) who wrote Mir'āt al-Janān Wa ʿIbrat al-Yaqzān also briefly talks about the life of al-Makkī.¹⁰²

In the fifteenth century, the great scholar Ibn Khaldūn (808/1406) quoted from al-Makkī's Qūt in his Shifā' al-Sā'il Wa Tahdhīb al-Masā'il regarding the doctrine of self-mortification and he calls al-Makkī a qādī.¹⁰³ Ibn Ḥajar al-ʿAsqalānī (d.891/1449), the author of Lisān al-Mīzān ¹⁰⁴ and al-Isāba fī Tamyīz al-Ṣaḥāba, also wrote about al-Makkī. The Persian Ṣūfī biographer ʿAbd al-Raḥmān Jāmī (d.898/1442) also wrote a few sentences about al-Makkī in his work entitled Nafahāt al-Uns,¹⁰⁵ although he adds no new information.

The Ḥanbalite traditionist biographer Abu 'l-Falāḥ al-Ḥayy b. al-ʿImād al-Ḥanbalī (d.1089/1667) also mentions al-Makkī in his Shadharāt al-Dhahab fī Akhbār Man Dhahab.¹⁰⁶ Muḥammad Ibn Ibrāhīm Ibn Yaḥyā Qawamī Shīrāzī also known as Ṣadr al-Dīn Mullā Ṣadrā (d.1050/1640) is said to have studied and mastered many Ṣūfī treatises including Qūt al-Qulūb in his life time.¹⁰⁷

1.7 MODERN SCHOLARSHIP ON AL-MAKKĪ.

After the seventeenth century, it would appear that no historian mentions al-Makkī until Brockelmann in the nineteenth century listed the writings and the manuscripts of al-Makkī.¹⁰⁸ More

recently L. Massignon also wrote a few sentences about al-Makki in his famous Passion of al-Hallaj and his articles about al-Makkī and the Sālimiyya school of thought. In his article about the Sālimiyya he is of the opinion that the original text of Qūt al-Qulūb was "purified" early on.¹⁰⁹

A certain amount of information about the teachings of al-Makkī can also be found in the works of Margaret Smith, Rābi'a The Mystic and Her Fellow Saints in Islam¹¹⁰ and Readings from The Mystics of Islam.¹¹¹ She translates a few paragraphs of al-Makkī's Qūt al-Qulūb which deal with the doctrine of patience and repentance, acknowledging that it was from al-Makkī's Qūt al-Qulūb that she gained much important information about Rābi'a, though al-Makkī lived almost two hundred years thereafter. Fuat Sezgin has up-dated the list of manuscripts of al-Makkī.¹¹²

In 1964 al-Makkī's 'Ilm al-Qulūb was edited by 'Abd al-Qādir Aḥmad 'Aṭā' with introduction and notes.¹¹³ G.C Anawati also mentioned al-Makkī several times in his work Mystique Musulmane. He asserts that al-Makkī was a loyal adherent of the Sālimiyya school of thought.¹¹⁴ A.J.Arberry also translates and commented a few paragraphs about al-Makkī in his work, Sufism: An account of the mystics of Islam. He mentions that al-

Makkī's Qūt al-Qulūb contains careful argument and is the first and a very successful attempt to construct an overall design for orthodox Sufism.¹¹⁵

In his work The life, personality and writings of al-Junayd which was published in 1962, Ali Hasan Abd al-Kader asserted that al-Makkī was a pupil of al-Sarrāj when he was in Baghdad.¹¹⁶ W.M.Watt also wrote briefly about al-Makkī in his book, Muslim intellectual: A study of al-Ghazālī.¹¹⁷

In 1975, Annemarie Schimmel made passing reference to al-Makkī in her book Mystical Dimensions of Islam. She asserts that it was al-Makkī's Qūt which becomes the first comprehensive manual of Sufism. She also says that not only did al-Ghazālī rely heavily upon this work but that Rūmī's Mathnawī and medieval Indian books also were dependent on it.¹¹⁸

In 1976, M.A. Shukri carried out a partial study of al-Makkī. His unpublished Ph.D thesis The mystical doctrine of Abū Tālib al-Makkī as found in his book Qūt al-Qulūb throws some light on al-Makkī.¹¹⁹ He observes:

But although the Qūt al-Qulūb of al-Makkī was edited as late as 1931, no attempt has been made either for the translation or the systematic study of the work of al-Makkī, although it is

very widely quoted by all the prominent scholars who write on Sufism.¹²⁰

He says, therefore, that his aim is to fill this gap by undertaking a systematic study of al-Makkī. In spite of these claims by Shukri, his thesis is limited to a discussion of the contents of the Qūt only. Shukri commences his thesis by a discussion of the life and personality of al-Makkī in which he explains the early life of al-Makkī and his education in Mecca, Baṣra and Baghdād. He also discusses the relationship between al-Makkī and the Sālimiyya school of thought. He then goes on to highlight the contemporaries and the teachers of al-Makkī. In part of the first chapter he discusses the works and personality of al-Makkī and the criticisms made against him. From this chapter it seems that Shukri is also of the opinion that al-Makkī did not have any opportunity to meet Ibn Sālim, let alone study under this personality, but he also gives the impression that al-Makkī was a loyal adherent of the Sālimiyya school of thought.

In the second part of his thesis, Shukri begins with the mystical doctrines of al-Makkī. Under this part he begins his second chapter by summarising the contents of Qūt al-Qulūb. Under the title of the religious life, Shukri discussed the relationship

between Islam and īmān, the path and its stations, faith and intellect. It seems that Shukri tries to sum up the teaching of al-Makkī with regard to all those doctrines and to represent it briefly. He then goes on to discuss the pillars of Islam and other articles of Islamic faith such as belief in prophethood, recitation of the Qur'an and so on. Shukri's account of the contents of the Qūt is thorough and accurate.

In the third chapter Shukri also summarises the mystical views of al-Makkī with regard to the qalb (heart), inspirations of the heart (khawāṭir) and purification of it. He discusses the theory of knowledge and its relation to the concept of wisdom (hikma), īmān and Islam of al-Makkī. Shukri also notes the difference between exoteric knowledge (‘ilm al-zāhir) and esoteric knowledge (‘ilm al-bāṭin).

The fourth chapter is devoted to the mystical life in which Shukri discusses intention (niyya), the dangers of the lower soul (nafs), and the virtue of self-mortification (mujāhadat al-nafs), self-examination (muhāsaba), remembrance (dhikr), introspection and contemplation (murāqaba wa mushāhada).

In the fifth chapter of his thesis, Shukri summarises al-Makkī's concept of the mystical path and

its stations. He highlights the stations (maqāmāt), and the states (ahwāl) such as repentance (tawba), asceticism (zuhd), patience (sabr), gratitude (shukr) and so on. He concludes his work by asserting that al-Makkī was among those early Ṣūfīs who tried to expound Sufism under the shelter of the Sharī'a. This method became a basis for al-Ghazālī in expounding the theory of reconciliation between Sufism and Sharī'a as found in his Ihyā'.

In 1980, Gerhard Böwering wrote a valuable book on Sahl al-Tustarī, entitled The mystical Vision of existence in classical Islam.¹²¹ In this book, he devotes a few very important pages to al-Makkī who, according to him, was the successor of Ibn Sālim. He suggests that al-Makkī must have met Abu 'l-Ḥasan b. Sālim personally, although as already mentioned many historians such as al-Baghdādī, Ibn Khallikān, Ibn al-Athīr maintain that he did not have any opportunity to meet Ibn Sālim. Böwering also states:

Tustarī represents one of the foremost authorities of the Qūt al-Qulūb. He is quoted approximately two hundred times in this treatise, either by name or by his kunyah, or anonymously.¹²²

He asserts that the materials of the Tustarī tradition included in the Qūt al-Qulūb are definitely to be considered as authentic and authoritative. He also

says that no attempt has been made at a critical study of the manuscripts of al-Makkī, either Qūt al-Qulūb or ‘Ilm al-Qulūb, in order to determine whether or not he was definitely a proponent of Sahl's teaching.

In a recent article Victor Danner confirms the views of Shukri that al-Makkī was among the first Ṣūfīs to talk about the reconciliation between Sufism and Islamic law (Sharī‘a).¹²³ This structure of reconciliation as laid in the Qūt al-Qulūb became the basis for al-Ghazālī to elaborate it in greater detail in his Ihyā’ for which he was venerated as the harmoniser between Sufism and Sharī‘a in the Muslim world. This point will be discussed in particular detail in a later chapter.

In 1989, Julian Baldick refers to al-Makkī as follows:

Earlier western writers imagined that Ghazālī's enormous Revival of the Religious sciences (Ihyā’ ‘Ulūm al-Dīn) was a work which conveyed profound mystical experience. It has been pointed out, however, that is really a book on ethics and conduct, which owes a lot to the popular manual written by Makkī in the late tenth century.¹²⁴

This remark is not explained or elaborated further.

More recently, T.J.Winter who translates Kitāb Dhikr al-Mawt wa mā Ba'dahu (Al-Ghazālī: The remembrance of death and the afterlife) of al-Ghazālī's Ihyā' asserts that al-Ghazālī relied heavily on al-Makkī, stating that whole passages of the Qūt can easily be demonstrated almost verbatim in some places.¹²⁵

1.8 THE WORKS OF ABŪ TĀLIB AL-MAKKĪ.

Al-Makkī is not a prolific writer. There are about five books which have been attributed to him. His best known work is Qūt al-Qulūb through which he was elevated by later Ṣūfīs to the ranks of their outstanding personalities. His other works were 'Ilm al-Qulūb, al-Bayān al-Shāfī, Kitāb Manāsik al-Hajj and a Tafsīr of the holy Qur'an. The only books extant are Qūt al-Qulūb and 'Ilm al-Qulūb. Although al-Bayān al-Shāfī was studied in depth and explained by Ibn 'Abbād al-Rundī,¹²⁶ it seems that the original text was lost.

As regards the Kitāb Manāsik al-Hajj, although al-Makkī himself mentions it in his Qūt,¹²⁷ it is no longer extant and it would appear that it is not

cited in the works of later authors. Al-Khafājī (d.451/1059) clearly states that al-Makkī was a man of deep learning in Quranic exegesis and he mentions that al-Makkī wrote a voluminous work of Tafsīr.¹²⁸ The text is also no longer extant.

1.8.1 The Contents of 'Ilm al-Qulūb.'

This book is the only other extant work of al-Makkī's apart from the Qūt. It is not well-known in the west and has been very little studied. A manuscript copy of it, no 113, is available at the Dār al-Kutub al-Miṣriyya in Cairo. It has 315 folios,¹²⁹ and was published by 'Abd al-Qādir Aḥmad 'Aṭā' in Cairo in 1964. Another version of this manuscript (not used by 'Aṭā') is available at the Escorial library.¹³⁰ According to 'Aṭā', this treatise was written by al-Makkī in Baghdād after finishing the Qūt. In view of the dearth of knowledge about the 'Ilm al-Qulūb', a brief summary of its contents is given below. However, the work deserves more scholarly attention than can be given here in a study of the Qūt.

This book consists of eighteen main topics in which al-Makkī lays great emphasis on wisdom (ḥikma), knowledge ('ilm) and gnosis (ma'rifa). In the first chapter al-Makkī discusses the definition and

significance of wisdom (ḥikma). He highlights many definitions devised by various groups of people such as the Ṣūfīs, jurists, traditionists, Quranic exegesists and so on. From the definitions which are discussed by al-Makkī, it can be understood that wisdom is the highest stage of knowledge which is granted by God to his messengers, through whom it is taught to the people. Al-Makkī elaborates this concept by quoting Quranic verses, the sayings of the Prophet (P.B.U.H), the Successors, outstanding Ṣūfīs and others. He also discusses the significance of pursuing knowledge and importance of intention (niyya) in every aspect of worship.¹³¹

In the second chapter, using the same method, al-Makkī elaborates the difference between wisdom and knowledge. In his view, since wisdom is superior to knowledge, one who possesses knowledge should study under one who possesses wisdom; for instance the prophet Moses sought guidance from the prophet Khidr. Al-Makkī goes on to say that people are educated by an 'ālim, whereas the 'ālim is educated by wisdom.¹³²

The third chapter deals with the tradition of the Prophet (P.B.U.H) (saying that): "Pursuing knowledge is incumbent on every Muslim". Al-Makkī

asserts that there is disagreement between scholars of esoteric and exoteric knowledge on this tradition as to which kind of knowledge is necessary for each Muslim to study. Therefore, each group lays different emphasis on different aspects of knowledge in accordance with their understanding.¹³³

In the fourth chapter, without giving definitions, al-Makkī extends his treatise by discussing the concept of tawhīd and tafrīd. He elaborates both concepts according to those gnostics and novices who possess esoteric knowledge (‘Ilm al-Ishāra). In this topic he adduces proof by referring to outstanding Ṣūfīs such as al-Junayd, Abū Yazīd al-Bisṭāmī, Yaḥyā b. Mu‘ādh al-Rāzī and so on. This chapter is chiefly concerned with the discussion of tawhīd.¹³⁴

The fifth chapter deals with a description of those gnostics who have pure conviction and whose attributes are well-known. Since gnostics possess the highest stage of knowledge, that is gnosis, they are, according to al-Makkī, praised by the Prophet (P.B.U.H). This is because gnosis is the highest station of the mūqinīn, the most perfect state of those who are sincere and the noblest stage of those who draw near to God. Al-Makkī refers to some of the selected verses of the Qur’an which deal with this issue; one such verse is

51:56 , "I have only created Jinns and men, that they may serve Me" . From this chapter gnosis can be understood as being knowledge of God (maʿrifat Allāh). Al-Makkī also discusses the concept of shirk when he refers to the Quranic verse, 112:2.¹³⁵

Under the sixth chapter the concept of sincerity (al-ikhhlās) and the levels of those who are in that position are elaborated by al-Makkī. He highlights five kinds of sincerity; those are as follows ikhhlās al-milla, ikhhlās al-dīn, ikhhlās al-ʿamal, ikhhlās fī ṣadaqa and ikhhlās al-akhlāq. Al-Makkī also differentiates between ikhhlās al-ʿubūdiyya, ikhhlās al-himma and ikhhlās al-tawhīd. In addition to that he also discusses four kinds of shirk. The position of sincerity in relation to worship is also discussed at some length by al-Makkī in this chapter.¹³⁶

In the seventh chapter, the legal value (ḥukm) of intention in worship is discussed by al-Makkī. Moreover, he also notes the definition, scope and depth of intention. He expounds this by quoting three Quranic verses which are related to the subject. He also refers to three traditions of the Prophet (P.B.U.H) in order to explain the importance of intention in worship and its relation to deeds.¹³⁷

The observance of beliefs and righteous deeds, and the different ways of gaining reward through various intentions in a single action are discussed thoroughly in the eighth chapter. Al-Makkī explains that all deeds must be devoted to Allāh. He asserts that from a single action one can gain much reward from Allāh through the various ways of intention.¹³⁸

In the ninth chapter al-Makkī clarifies further that in one action such as entering a mosque, one manages to obtain eight rewards from Allāh through eight different intentions. He elaborates a practice such as entering a mosque with the intention of visiting the house of Allāh or with the intention of fulfilling the trust which is bestowed by God or frequenting the mosque for the sake of Allāh. Therefore, if one has these intentions while entering a mosque, one will be given many rewards by Allāh from a single action.¹³⁹

Furthermore, once one enters a mosque and sits properly in it, one may obtain twelve rewards from Allāh through twelve intentions which can be applied in one single action. These intentions include such aspects as performing a meritorious act such as congregational prayer, observing the Sunna, fostering a close relationship among the Muslims and so on. This point is further discussed in the tenth chapter.¹⁴⁰

Fear of Allāh is one of the features of the believer. When one has true intention in this regard, one's station will be elevated by Allāh. In this regard, there are seven intentions which can be applied to a single action in order to derive many rewards from the Most Exalted. Al-Makkī discusses all these intentions in the eleventh chapter.¹⁴¹

Al-Makkī says: "Visiting brothers for the sake of Allāh is among the virtuous deeds of the believers". Therefore, it is incumbent on the servant to purify his intention. There are five blameworthy intentions which can overcome the servant, generated from a single action such as visiting a brother to get food, to lord it over him, to gain knowledge through which one will be praised and so on. However, there are also six virtuous intentions which can be applied in visiting brothers such as observing the Sunna, performing a good deed by which one can obliterate a bad one, giving advice and so on. Sayings which are attributed to Abū Yazīd al-Bisṭāmī are also highlighted.

In a subsidiary section in the twelfth chapter, al-Makkī also briefly discusses the intention in fasting by quoting the traditions of the Prophet and the sayings of Abū Sa'īd al-Khudrī. Elsewhere in this

chapter, al-Makkī elaborates on how to have true intention in bringing up children.¹⁴²

The attribute of the believer and his identification is the main topic of this chapter. In addition to that, a comparison is made between the believer and swarming bees. Al-Makkī highlights twelve examples from the traditions in this regard. He then elaborates these points by quoting the sayings of the gnostics. Moreover, he makes forty comparisons between the believer and the bees with regard to their respective behaviour.¹⁴³

Al-Makkī then talks about love (maḥabba). He describes the concept and degrees of love by quoting Quranic verses, the traditions of the Prophet (P.B.U.H), the sayings of the Successors, the outstanding Ṣūfīs and so on. According to him, there are three stages of love, that of maḥabbat al-‘āmm, maḥabbat al-khāṣṣ and maḥabbat al-khāṣṣ al-khāṣṣ. These all come under one sub-section of the thirteenth chapter.¹⁴⁴

The last part of this book is a section on the scattered sayings of prominent Ṣūfīs, which al-Makkī puts together in another sub-section of the thirteenth chapter. This consists of various subjects such as stations (maqāmāt), tawhīd, conviction (yaqīn), the

degrees of gnosis (ma'rifā) and so on.¹⁴⁵

1.8.2 THE CONTENTS OF QŪT AL-QULŪB

Since the work of Shukri was essentially a discussion of the contents of Qūt al-Qulūb, this topic will therefore be mentioned only briefly here.

Qūt al-Qulūb consists of forty-eight chapters. The first twenty-two chapters deal with the basic and obligatory things of Islam such as remembrance (dhikr), prayer, orison (wird), the etiquette and the methodology of reciting the Qur'an and the virtues of congregational prayer.

Chapter 22 to 30 deal with the training of novices for embarking on the mystical path. This includes self-examination (muhāsaba), self-mortification, contemplation, meditation (murāqaba) and so on.

Al-Makkī discusses the concept of knowledge ('ilm) and its superiority in Chapter 31. Chapter 32 discusses the station of conviction and the description of those who are in this station. This chapter also encompasses the stations of repentance, patience, gratitude, hope, fear, asceticism, surrender,

contentment and love.

Chapter 33 deals with the principles of Islam such as the articles of faith and the pillars of Islam. Chapter 34 is a discourse on Imān and Islam, while in Chapter 35 the concept of Ahl al-Sunna wa 'l-Jamā'a is discussed. Chapter 36 treats the rights of the Muslim in relation to his Muslim brother and also how to become a true Muslim.

Chapter 37 deals with the major sins (kabā'ir). Chapter 38 is an exposition of sincerity and pious intention in action. Chapter 39 deals with the etiquette of eating and also an account of foods. This topic is continued in Chapter 40.

Chapter 41 deals with the merits of poverty. Chapter 42 is about travelling and its purposes. Chapter 43 is about leadership in prayer (imāma), followed by chapter 44 in which the concept of brotherhood is discussed.

Chapter 45 is about marriage. Chapter 46 deals with the etiquette of entering the public bath. Chapter 47 is about trade. The exposition of halāl and harām, the virtue of halāl and the bad aspects of shubha are discussed in the last chapter.

As far as Abū Ṭālib al-Makkī's Qūt al-Qulūb is concerned, no attempt has been made to translate it into English, except for some scattered paragraphs produced by M.Smith and A.J.Arberry. Although M.A. Shukri claimed to have systematically studied the Qūt, his work was essentially a summarising of it. Thus, there is still much room for students of Sufism to examine and analyse in detail the teaching of al-Makkī as laid down in his Qūt al-Qulūb. This thesis will attempt to deal with some aspects of this important task. One of the aims of this study will be to translate and analyse al-Makkī's treatment of one of the most important stations of the Ṣūfīs, that of repentance.

Many scholars have pointed out that large portions of the Ihyā' of al-Ghazālī were obviously copied wholesale from the Qūt, but as far as these two books are concerned, no profound comparative study of al-Makkī and al-Ghazālī has yet been produced. An attempt will therefore be made to fill this gap by providing a close analysis of the treatment by both these authors of the concept of repentance.

Finally, this study will also examine the originality of al-Makkī's concept of repentance.

NOTES

1. Ibn Khallikān, Wafayāt al-A'yān, ed. Iḥsan 'Abbās, Beirut, n.d, vol.4, p.303; see also Ibn Khallikān, Wafayāt al-A'yān, tr. De Slane, Ibn Khallikan's Biographical Dictionary, Beirut, 1970, vol.3, pp.23-24.

2. Abū Ṭālib al-Makkī, Qūt al-Qulūb Fi Mu'āmalat al-Mahbūb Wa Waṣf Tarīq al-Murīd Ilā Maqām al-Tawḥīd, Cairo, 1961, vol.2, p.294.

3. Ibid, 1, p.330.

4. Ibid, 2, p.543.

5. Ibid, 2, p.248; Al-Makkī refers to al-Kirmānī as "our master in Mecca-Shaykhunā bi Makka.

6. Abū Nu'aym al-Iṣfahānī, Hilyat al-Awliyā', Cairo, 1932, vol.1, p.375.

7. Al-Subkī, Tabaqāt al-Shāfi'iyya al-Kubrā, Cairo, 1964, vol.1, p.93; See also 'Abd al-Raḥmān Ibn al-Jawzī, Al-Muntazam fī Tārīkh al-Mulūk wa 'l-Umam, Hyderabad, 1358, vol.4, p.381; See also Hilyat, 1, p.375.

8. Abu 'l-Falāḥ b. al-'Imād al-Ḥanbalī, Shadharāt al-Dhahab fī Akhbār Man Dhahab, Cairo, 1350 A.H, vol.3, 154; Ali Hasan Abdel Kader lists 12 treatises attributed to Abū Sa'id in his book The Life, Personality and Writings of al-Junayd, London, 1962, p.xii.

9. Qūt, 1, p.330; the edition here make little sense in one part of the sentence. Accordingly, Wa waṣafa has been read as waṣafa.

10. Shihāb al-Dīn Ibn Ḥajar al-'Asqalānī, Lisān al-Mīzān, Hyderabad, 1331 A.H, vol.5, p.300; See also De Slane, 2, p.613. In Lisān al-Mīzān, the name of this personality is Ibn Zayd al-Marwazī, whereas in De Slane the name is slightly different, that is Abū Zayd al-Marwazī. Since the biography of this man, which was given by these two historians, is the same, the above names probably refer to one and the same person. The version of the name given by Ibn Khallikān has been preferred here since he provides much more substantial information on al-Marwazī.

11. Qūt, 1, p.344.

12. Shadharāt, 2, p. 231.
13. Lisān, 5, p. 300; see also Shadharāt, 2, p. 372
14. Muntazam, 7, p. 144; See also al-Dhahabī, al-‘Ibar fī Khabr man Ghabr, 3, p. 8.
15. Muntazam, 7, p. 144.
16. Ibid, 7, p. 189; See also Abū Bakr Aḥmad Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī, Tārīkh Baghdād, 14 vol, 11, p. 324.
17. "Sālimiyya", E.I¹, 4, p. 115.
18. Tārīkh, 3, p. 89; see also De Slane, 3, pp. 23-24.
19. Qūt, 2, p. 294.
20. "Sālimiyya", E.I¹, 4, p. 115.
21. Ibid.
22. This information is based on Mystical, p. 3.
23. G. Böwering, The Mystical Vision of Existence in Classical Islam, Berlin, 1980.
24. "Sālimiyya", E.I¹, 4, p. 115.
25. Mystical, pp. 85-91.
26. "Sālimiyya", E.I¹, 4, p. 115.
27. Abū Naṣr al-Sarrāj, Kitāb al-Luma‘ fi ‘l-Tasawwuf, ed. R. A. Nicholson, London, 1914, pp. 390-391.
28. Ibid.
29. J. Pedersen, "Ḥulmāniyya", E.I², 4, p. 570.
30. "Sālimiyya", E.I¹, 4, p. 115; see also W. M. Watt, The formative period of Islamic thought, Edinburgh, 1976, p. 23; Idem, Islamic Philosophy and theology, (Extended survey), Edinburgh, 1985, pp. 62, 109-110.
31. Mystical, p. 134.
32. ‘Ibar, 2, p. 320.
33. Muḥammad b. Abī Ya‘lā Ibn al-Farrā’, al-Mu‘tamad fī Usūl al-Dīn, Beirut, 1974, pp. 217-221.
34. ‘Abd al-Qādir al-Jīlānī, al-Ghunya li Tālib

Tarīq al-Haqq, Cairo, n.d, pp.106-107.

35. I.Goldziher, "Die dogmatische Partei der Sālīmījja", Gesammelte Schriften, Hildesheim, 1970, vol.v, pp.76-85.

36. "Sālīmiyya", E.I¹, 4, p.115.

37. Mystical, pp.94-95.

38. Qūt, 1, pp.34, 247, 262, 310.

39. Ibid, 2, p.356.

40. Ibid, 2, pp.31, 173.

41. Wafayāt, 4, p.303.

42. Ibid, 4, p.303; see also Tārīkh, 3, p.89. It is worth mentioning here that al-Baghdādī is a traditionist and is described as a loyal adherent of the Shāfi'ite madhhab. In addition to that, he also had a personal hatred of the Ḥanbalites to whom he belonged previously and with whom he was always at loggerheads. Perhaps, al-Makkī was maligned by al-Baghdādī on this basis. See R.Sellheim, "al-Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī", E.I², 4, pp.1111-1112.

43. Abū Muḥammad 'Abd Allāh b. As'ad al-Yāfi'ī, Mir'āt al-Janān wa 'Ibrat al-Yaqzān, Medina, 1338 A.H, vol.2, p.430.

44. Tārīkh, 2, p.275.

45. Farīd al-Dīn 'Aṭṭār, Tadhkirat al-Awliyā', tr. A.J.Arberry, Muslim saints and Mystics, London, p.189; see also Abū 'Alī 'Uthmān al-Ḥujwīrī, Kashf al-Mahjūb, pp.128-130. A profound study on al-Junayd has been made by Ali Hasan Abdel Kadeer, The life, London, 1962; see also A.J.Arberry, "Djunayd", E.I², 2, p.600.

46. The life, p.35.

47. Qūt, 1, p.322.

48. Shāfi'īyya, 2, p.273.

49. The life, pp.68-75.

50. Ibid, pp.70-75; see also Idem, "The doctrine of al-Junayd", I.Q., (1) 1954, pp.168-177.

51. The life, pp.81-87; see also Idem, "The rasā'il

of al-Junayd", I.Q., (1) 1954, pp.70-89; Idem, "al-Junayd's theory of fanā'", I.Q., (1) 1954, pp.217-228.

52. The life, pp.76-80; see also Idem, "Al-Junayd's theory of fanā'", I.Q., (1), pp.217-228.

53 The life, p.82.

54. R.C Zaehner, Hindu and Muslim Mysticism, London, 1969, pp.135-161; cf Ninian Smart, The religious experience of mankind, Glasgow, 1970, pp.514-515.

55. A.J.Arberry, Revelation and Reason in Islam, London, 1957, pp.89-91.

56. Luma', pp.390-391.

57. Lit. what is known (ma' lūm).

58. Qūt, 2, p.243.

59. Qūt, 1, p.373.

60. Al-Makkī, 'Ilm al-Qulūb, ed. 'Abd al-Qādir Aḥmad 'Aṭā', Cairo, 1964, pp.97, 113.

61. Ibid, p.98.

62. De Slane, 3, p.24.

63. Muntaẓam, 7, pp.189-190.

64. See this chapter pp.3-4.

65. Muntaẓam, 7, p.144.

66. Ibid, 7, p.145.

67. Lisān, 5, p.300.

68. De Slane, 2, p.613.

69. Qūt, 2, pp.562, 563, 572.

70. Ibid, 1, p.362.

71. Ibid.

72. Ibid, 1, pp.359-364.

73. Ibid, 2, p.531.

74. Ibid, 2, pp.459, 531.

75. "Sālimiyya", E.I¹, 4, p.115; see also Doctrine, p.52.
76. Al-Sulamī, Tabaqāt al-Šūfiyya, Leyden, 1960.
77. Al-Iṣfahānī, Hilyat al-Awliyā', 10 vols., Cairo, 1932.
78. Abu 'l-Qāsim 'Abd al-Karīm al-Qushayrī, al-Risāla fī 'Ilm al-Taṣawwuf, Cairo, 1346 A.H.
79. Kashf, (new edition), Lahore, 1982. 'Abd al-Wahhāb b. Aḥmad al-Sha'rānī also does not mention al-Makkī in his book entitled Tabaqāt al-Kubrā, Cairo, 1954.
80. GAL, 2, p.389. One of the famous historians who is contemporary with al-Makkī is Ibn Miskawayh, the author of Tajārib al-Umam. He also never mentions al-Makkī.
81. Tārīkh, 3, p.89.
82. GAL, 1, p.436; see also Wafayāt, 4, p.303.
83. Fuat Sezgin, Geschichte Des Arabischen Schrifttums, Leyden, 1961, vol.1, p.667.
84. Tārīkh, 3, p.389.
85. Abū Ḥāmid Muḥammad al-Ghazālī, al-Munqidh min al-Dalāl, Beirut, 1959, p.55.
86. Chapter five of this thesis.
87. Ibid, p.55; see also al-Ghazālī, al-Munqidh min al-Dalāl, tr. W.M.Watt, The faith and Practice of al-Ghazālī, London, 1953, p.54.
88. Muntazam, 7, pp.189-190.
89. Ibn al-Jawzī, Talbīs Iblīs, Cairo, n.d, pp. 164-165.
90. Wafayāt, 4, p.303.
91. Muntazam, 7, p.189.
92. Talbīs, pp.164-165.
93. According to De Slane, he (al-Makkī) probably means to say "than the world", but pronounced Khāliq instead of khalq. De Slane, 3, p.23.
94. De Slane, 3, pp.23-24.

95. Ibn al-Athīr, al-Kāmil fi 'l-Tārīkh, Leyden, 1864, vol. 9, pp. 90-91.
96. Jalāl al-Dīn Rūmī, Mathnawī, 7 vols., tr. R.A. Nicholson, The Mathnawī of Jalāluddīn Rūmī, London, 1934, vol. 6, p. 405. See also R.A. Nicholson, The Mathnawī of Jalāluddīn Rūmī, (commentary), London, 1937, vol. 7, p. 77; see also Afzal Iqbal, The life and works of Jalal-ud-Din Rumi, London, 1983, pp. 98-99.
97. R.A. Nicholson, The Mathnawī of Jalaluddin Rumi, 6, pp. 404-405.
98. Taqī al-Dīn Aḥmad Ibn Taymiyya, Majmū' Fatāwā, Riyaḍ, 1381 A.H., vol. 11, p. 579.
99. 'Ibar, 3, p. 33.
100. Ṣalāḥ al-Dīn Khalīl al-Ṣafadī, Wāfī bi 'l-Wafayāt, Cairo, 1974, vol. 4, pp. 116-117.
101. GAL, 1, p. 217. See also P. Nwyia, "Ibn 'Abbād al-Rundī", E.I², 3, p. 671. See also al-Rundī, al-Rasā'il, pp. 19, 22, 23, 25, 41, 78, 89, 131, 205, 212.
102. Abū Muḥammad 'Abd Allāh al-Yāfi'ī, Mir'āt al-Janān wa 'l-'Ibrat al-Yaqzan, Medina, 1338 A.H., vol. 2, p. 430. Ibn Kathīr also mention al-Makkī in his al-Bidāya wa 'l-Nihāya, Beirut, 1966, vol. 12, p. 319.
103. Abū Zayd 'Abd al-Raḥmān Ibn Khaldūn, Shifā' al-Sā'il wa Tahdhīb al-Masā'il, Beirut, n.d., pp. 45, 70.
104. Lisān, 5, p. 300.
105. 'Abd al-Raḥmān b. Aḥmad Jāmī, Nafahāt al-Uns, Tehran, n.d., p. 121.
106. Shadharāt, 3, p. 120.
107. S. Hossein Nasr, Ṣadr al-Dīn Shīrāzī and his transcendent theosophy, Tehran, n.d., p. 121.
108. GAL, 1, p. 217.
109. L. Massignon, "Abū Ṭālib al-Makkī", E.I², 1, p. 153; see also idem, La Passion de Husayn Ibn Mansur Hallaj, Paris, 1975, vol. 1, pp. 78, 112, 265, 422, 495. See also "Sālimiyya", E.I¹, 4, p. 115.
110. Margaret Smith, Rābi'a the mystic and her

fellow saints in Islam, Cambridge, 1928, p. xiv. See also pp. 14, 16, 47, 50, 51, 58, 74, 78, 80, etc.

111. eadem, Readings from the mystics of Islam, London, 1950, pp. 44-46; see also eadem, An early mystic of Baghdād, London, 1935, pp. 27, 239, 259, 269,

112. Sezgin, 1, p. 667.

113. ‘Ilm al-Qulūb.

114. G.C. Anawati, Mystique Musulmane, Paris, 1961, pp. 34, 41. see also pp. 50, 149, 165, etc.

115. A.J. Arberry, Sufism: An account of the mystics of Islam, London, 1950, pp. 68-69; see also idem, An Introduction to the history of Sufism, London, n.d., pp. 20-26.

116. The life, pp. 8-9.

117. W.M. Watt, Muslim Intellectual: A study of al-Ghazālī, Edinburgh, 1971, pp. 110-111. See also Idem, Islamic Philosophy and Theology, (extended survey), Edinburgh, 1985, p. 109.

118. Annemarie Schimmel, Mystical Dimensions of Islam (3rd edition), Chapel Hill, 1975, pp. 18, 56. See also pp. 85, 120, 131, 132, 215, 251, 348.

119. Doctrine, Edinburgh, 1976.

120. Ibid, p. 26.

121. Mystical, pp. 19-20, 25-27, 34, 36-37, 40, 44, 47, 56-57, etc.

122. Ibid, p. 26.

123. Victor Danner, "The early development of Sufism", in Islamic Spirituality (Foundations), ed. S. Hossein Nasr, London, 1987, pp. 260, 261.

124. Julian Baldick, Mystical Islam: An Introduction to Sufism, London, 1989, p. 65. See also pp. 260, 261.

125. T.J. Winter, Al-Ghazālī: The remembrance of death and the afterlife (Translation with introduction and notes from Kitāb dhikr al-mawt wa mā ba‘dahu, Book XL of al-Ghazālī, Ihyā’ ‘Ulūm al-Dīn), Cambridge, 1989, pp. XIX-XX. Winter asserts that not only al-Makkī but also other outstanding figures such as al-Muḥāsibī, Ibn Abī al-Dunyā, al-Ḥākim al-Tirmīdhī and so on exerted great



influence on al-Ghazālī.

126. GAL, 1, p. 217; see also P. Nwyia, "Ibn 'Abbād al-Rundī", E. I¹, 3, p. 671. See also Ibn 'Abbād al-Rundī, Al-Rasā'il al-Ṣuḡhrā, ed. P. Nwyia, Ibn 'Abbād de Ronda, Lettres de direction spirituelle al-Rasā'il al-Ṣuḡhrā, Beirut, 1986, p. 19.

127. Qūt, 2, p. 231.

128. This information is based on the footnote of al-Makkī's Qūt al-Qulūb, Cairo, 1932, vol. 1, p. 4. As regards Khafājī, he was the author of Husn al-Riyād fī sharḥ kitāb al-Shifā'. See GAL, 2, p. 396. It is worth mentioning that one of the famous Quranic exegesists, Jalāl al-Dīn al-Suyūṭī, quoted the saying of al-Makkī with regard to the subject of ijtihād in his work Tagrīr al-Istinād fī Tafsīr al-Ijtihād, (Introduction and annotation by Fu'ād 'Abd al-Mun'im Aḥmad), Alexandria, 1983, pp. 36-37.

129. 'Ilm, pp. 5-6; Sezgin, 1, p. 667.

130. 'Ilm, p. 6; cf Sezgin, 1, p. 667.

131. 'Ilm, pp. 14-15.

132. Ibid, pp. 46-79.

133. Ibid, pp. 80-86.

134. Ibid, pp. 87-118.

135. Ibid, pp. 118-144.

136. Ibid, pp. 144-175.

137. Ibid, pp. 175-198.

138. Ibid, pp. 198-200.

139. Ibid, pp. 200-207.

140. Ibid, pp. 208-214.

141. Ibid, pp. 214-220.

142. Ibid, pp. 220-247.

143. Ibid, pp. 247-270.

144. Ibid, pp. 270-274.

145. Ibid, pp. 274-290.

CHAPTER TWO

THE TRANSLATION OF AL-MAKKĪ'S KITĀB AL-TAWBA I

In the translation¹ which follows an effort has been made to adhere as closely as possible to the structure of al-Makkī's Arabic. However, sometimes in the interests of comprehensibility and style, the rather rambling sentences of al-Makkī have been made shorter and extra words have been added for reasons of sense.

The English translation of the Qur'ān which has been used in this thesis is that of Abdullah Yusuf Ali.²

SECTION THIRTY-TWO

(p.364)

Which contains the explanation of the stages (maqāmāt)³ of conviction (yaqīn) and of the states (aḥwāl)⁴ of those who are "convinced" (mūqinīn).⁵

There are nine roots of the maqāmāt of conviction (yaqīn) to which may be traced back the branches of the states (aḥwāl) of those who fear God. The first of them is repentance (tawba) and (then) patience (ṣabr), gratitude (shukr), hope (rajā'), fear (khawf), asceticism (zuhd), surrender (tawakkul), contentment (riḍā), and love (maḥabba). And this is the love of the

specially chosen (al-khusūṣ);⁶ that is the love of the Beloved (maḥabbat al-maḥbūb).

An account of the obligations of repentance,⁷ the explanation of its virtues, and the description of those who are penitent.

Allāh Most Exalted said in His first utterance (on this subject), speaking to people in general;

"And O! believers, turn ye all together towards Allāh, that ye may attain bliss".(14:31)

(which) means, "Return to Him from the worldly desire of your souls and your continuing in your lusts (so that) perhaps you will succeed in your hope of returning (to God), and in order that you may remain in the perpetual presence of Allāh Most Honoured and Glorious, in bliss which neither wanes nor come to an end, and in order that you may succeed and prosper by entering Paradise and escape the fire. This is (true) success (al-falāḥ).

(Allāh) said in His second utterance, speaking to the chosen (the Sūfīs);

"O ye who believe, turn to Allāh with sincere (naṣūḥ) repentance; in the hope that your Lord will remove from you ills and admit you to Gardens beneath which Rivers flow".(66:8)

(The word) naṣūhan (نصوحا) is derived from nush. It is on the pattern fa'ūl and denotes an intensified amount of nush (sincerity). It may be read as nusūhan (p.365) with a damma on the nūn, in which case it becomes the verbal noun (masdar) of naṣaha, (whose verbal) nouns are nash and naṣūh, and the meaning of which is "whole-heartedly for the sake of Allāh Most Exalted". It is also said that its (naṣūh) derivation is from niṣāh which means "thread" (khayṭ), i.e. unattached -neither attached to anything nor having anything attached to it. (Thus) it (means) constant commitment (istiḡāma) to obedience without any deviation to sin in the manner of the fox, so that one does not entertain the thought of returning to sin ⁸ whenever one has the power to do so. (It also means that) one abandons sin for the sake of Allāh Most Exalted (turning) wholeheartedly towards His face just as one used to commit sin in accordance with one's (base) desires, resolving upon it with one's heart and one's lust. Whenever one comes to Allāh, may He be praised and glorified, with a heart free from worldly desire and with sincere works, following the Sunna, God will grant one a favourable final outcome. At that moment one will be overtaken by one's previous meritorious behaviour. This is sincere repentance (al-tawba al-naṣūh). This servant is the pure, beloved penitent. This is an account of those who have already gained a reward for meritorious action (ḥusnā) from Allāh

Most Exalted, and those who have been overtaken by bounty from their Lord by which He has absolved them from the stain of sin. This is the description of those whom He meant in His utterance (when He said) in His Book:

For Allāh loves those who turn to Him constantly and He loves those who keep themselves pure and clean.
(2:22)

Similarly, the Prophet, peace and blessing be upon him (P.B.U.H), said:

The penitent is the beloved of Allāh and one who repents from sin is like one who has no sin.⁹

Al-Ḥasan¹⁰ was asked about sincere repentance and he replied:

(Repentance) is regretfulness of heart, seeking forgiveness with the tongue, abandoning (sin) with the limbs of the body and making the intention not to return to it (sin).

Abū Muḥammad Sahl,¹¹ may Allāh have mercy upon him, said:

There is nothing more incumbent on this people than (the act of) repentance. And there is no torment for them which is more severe than losing the knowledge of repentance. In fact the people are ignorant of the knowledge of repentance.

He (also) said:

Whosoever says that repentance is not an obligation is an unbeliever. And

whosoever does not protest against
(such a) statement is (also) an
unbeliever.

He (also) said:

The penitent is he who repents from
his heedlessness in his acts of
obedience in every twinkling of his
eye and every breath.¹²

‘Alī (ibn Abī Ṭālib), may Allāh ennoble him,
defined the abandoning of repentance as a stage of
blindness and he linked it to following idle fancy and
forgetting remembrance (of God). He said in the long
tradition:

Whoever is blind forgets remembrance
(of God), follows idle fancy and
asks forgiveness with neither
repentance nor humility.

The obligation of repentance is essential for
the penitent, and will never be valid and true unless he
recognises his sin, acknowledges his wrongdoing, makes
his soul abhor passion, unties the wilfulness which has
bound him to evil works, and unless he eats wholesome
food as far as he is able, since nutrition is the basis
of (the life) of pious people, and unless he regrets what
has passed in the way of crimes (jināyāt) - (the true
meaning of regret, if it is the truth, since every truth
has its own true meaning, is that one will not revert to
the like of what caused the regret),- and unless one

holds firmly to what is enjoined and avoids what is prohibited.

The real meaning of constant commitment (al-istiḡāma) is not to repeat in one's future life what one has committed in the way of previous insincerity. (It is also) that one should (p.366) follow the way of one who turns repentantly to Allāh, and not keep company with the ignorant (man) who will cause one to perish. Moreover, one should busy oneself with reforming that which one has corrupted during the time of one's wrongdoing in order to be included amongst the pious people (muṣliḥīn) who repent and reform what they have corrupted. Verily Allāh, may He be praised and glorified, will not reform the deeds of corrupted people, just as He will not squander the reward of those who do good. Moreover, the meaning of constant commitment is that one should substitute for one's bad deeds good deeds so that one may be included amongst those who have substituted bad deeds for good (ones) in order to demonstrate true repentance and sincere turning to God. For substitution takes place in this world, exchanging bad acts for good deeds, as is shown by the saying of the Most Exalted:

Verily, never Will Allāh change the
condition Of a people until they
Change it themselves (With their own
souls).(13:11)

for they have changed¹³ the evil in them to good. He will exchange their bad deeds for good ones. Furthermore, (there should be) regret and perpetual sorrow. The real meaning of regret at what has passed is that one should not be remiss and not tire in one's time of awareness, nor return (to one's dilatoriness) nor turn away from applying one to achieving transformation, for otherwise one will lose one's soul for a second time, since one has been working to repair what has passed; (the real meaning of regret and sorrow is) that one should not lose what one has gained in one's state of awareness, so that one's awareness would be similar to one's previous heedlessness, since omission cannot be repaired by omission, and bliss cannot be gained by bliss, so that one may be as Allāh Most Exalted described:

Others (there are who) have
Acknowledged their wrong-doing. They
have mixed an act That was good with
another That was evil.(9:102)

It has been said (qīla):

Acknowledge what you have done wrong
and feel regretful.

Abū Sulaymān al-Dārānī¹⁴ said:

If the intelligent man were to weep
for the rest of his life only for his
previous disobedience, it would be
fitting that that should make him
grieve until his death.(So) how will
it be for someone facing the rest of
his life with the likes of his
previous ignorance?.

Sahl b. 'Abd Allāh ¹⁵ said:

The penitent is he who is not diminished by anything and whose heart is attached to the throne (of God) until it leaves his lower soul. (And) there is no life for him except the necessity to remain firm, and to feel distress at what has happened in the past, to make serious efforts (in observing) the injunctions (of God), (as well as) abandoning what is prohibited in what remains of his life. (All of this) will not be achieved for him unless he uses 'ilm al-yaqīn' in every matter, and unless moreover, he follows it up by righteous acts (in order) to be included in the (category of) those of whom of Allāh Most Exalted said:

"And (they) turn off Evils with good". (13:22)

which means they pay for their previous bad deeds by the good which they perform.

Likewise the Prophet (P.B.U.H) said in his hadīth (narrated by) Abū Dharr¹⁶ :

Whenever you have committed a bad deed, immediately after that perform a good deed, the secret (deed) for the secret (deed) and the public (deed) for the public (deed).¹⁷

In the injunction of Mu'ādh¹⁸ :

Follow the bad deed with a good one which will obliterate it.¹⁹

in order that one may be included amongst those who do good, as Allāh Most Exalted said:

And those who believe And work
righteous deeds. Them shall We admit
To the company of the Righteous.(29:9)

Moreover (one should) hasten to perform pious
acts whenever one is capable of doing that, in order to
redress thereby what has been lost in the past²⁰ in order
to be amongst the righteous.

In this station, one is fitting for one's Lord
and He will protect and guide him. As God (Most Exalted)
said:

And He will choose And befriend the
righteous.(7:196)

(p.367)

To sum up what is incumbent on the servant
concerning repentance and what is related to it, it
consists of ten characteristics.

The first of them is that it is obligatory on
him not to disobey Allāh Most Exalted. The second is
that, whenever he is tempted to sin, he should not
persist in it. The third characteristic is to repent of
it to Allāh Most Exalted. The fourth is regret for what
has passed. The fifth is to express the firm belief in
commitment to obedience (to Allāh) until death. The
sixth is fear of punishment, and the seventh is hope of
forgiveness. The eighth is acknowledging sin (which has

been committed). The ninth is to express the firm belief that Allāh Most Exalted pre-ordained those things for him and that this is justice from Him. The tenth is to proceed constantly with righteous deeds, to perform acts of penance, as the Prophet (P.B.U.H) said:

Follow the bad deed with a good one
which will obliterate it.

About all these characteristics, there are many anecdotes which have been narrated to us from the Companions and the Successors and which are too numerous to be mentioned.

It is said that whenever the angel of death (malak al-mawt) appears to the servant, he tells him; There is only one hour left of your life, and you cannot postpone (the due time) even by the twinkling of an eye. "Then there appear from the servant so much regret and sorrow (on his face) that if (all the contents of) the world from its beginning to its end were his, he would forego it if he could add another hour to that hour in order to seek therein (Allāh's) favour or to seek a substitute for it, but he will find no way of doing that. This is the interpretation of the saying of Allāh Most Honoured and Glorious:

And between them And their desires Is
placed a barrier.(34:54)

It has been said that (the above verse) refers to repentance.²¹ It has also been said that it means an extension of life ²² and it has also been said that it means a favourable ending.

And between them And their desire Is
placed a barrier As was done in the
past With their partisan. (34:54)

i.e people like them and the members of
their group.²³

Indeed, every hour which passes for the servant is like this hour whose value is the whole of this world, if only he realises its value. For this reason, it has been said that the remainder of the servant's life has no value if he knows God's pre-ordained design (which He has decreed) with justice and wisdom.

It has been said about the meaning of the saying of Allāh Most Exalted:

(And spend something in charity Out of
the substance Which We have bestowed
On you), before Death Should come to
any of you And he should say: O my
Lord! Why didst Thou not give me
Respite for a little while?. (63:10)

That the "little while" (al-waqt al-qarīb) means that the servant will say when the cover is removed:

"O angel of death, give me a day's respite so that I may worship my Lord (all the time) in it, so that I may reprove my sin in it and provision myself with righteous deeds".

The angel will reply: "You have already wasted your days, therefore there is no (extra) day (for you)". (The servant) will say: "Give me an hour's respite". The angel will reply: "You have already wasted your hours so there is no (more) hour (for you)". After that, the spirit (rūh) (of the servant) will reach his throat and he will be seized by an inability to speak during his death-rattle. (Consequently) the gate of repentance will be shut and (the servant) will be debarred from it. All activities will cease, all times will go away, his breaths will rise up, and he will see at this moment with his own eyes when the cover is removed and his sight becomes sharper. When he comes to his last breath his soul will depart, the happiness (al-sa'āda) which he had formerly (enjoyed) will overtake him, and his spirit will depart in the state of tawhīd. This is the (most) favourable of outcomes. Alternatively, the misery (al-shaqawa) which he has (formerly) acquired will overtake him and then his spirit will depart in a state of doubt; this corresponds to the saying of Allāh Most Exalted and Glorious:
Of no effect is the repentance Of
those who continue To do evil, until
Death Faces one of them, and he says
"Now have I repented indeed". (4:18)

So this is the (most) unfavourable endings, against which we take refuge in Allāh. It has been said that such a person is a hypocrite, or that it is one who applies himself to sin and persists in it. Allāh Most Exalted says:

Allāh accepts the repentance (p.368)
Of those who do evil In ignorance and
repent Soon afterwards.(4:17)

It has been said that (this means) "before death" (qabl al-mawt) or "before the emergence of the signs of the next world " (qabl zuhūr āyāt al-akhīra), or before the death rattle: i.e before the breath rattles in the throat. This is because the Most Exalted has already decreed that repentance after the appearance of the signs of the next world will not be accepted. That is why God, Most Exalted and Glorious, said:

The day that certain Of the Signs Of
thy Lord Do come, no good Will it do
to a soul To believe in them then, If
it believed not before. (6:158)

I.e. before the last signs of death are visible (min qabl mu'āyana al-āyāt), "Nor earned righteousness through its faith" (6:158). It has been said that (this means) repentance, which is the acquisition of faith (kasb al-īmān) and the roots of pious deeds. It has also been said (that it means) righteous acts which are an increment of faith and a sign of conviction. It has

(also) been said that "and repent soon afterwards" (4:17) means "soon after committing the sin" without delay and without keeping far away from repentance. And "repentance soon afterwards" means doing penance for one's sin with a righteous deed, never committing another sin (thereafter), ridding oneself of a bad deed with a good one and never engaging in another.

It has been said that the first person from this community (umma) who asks to return to life (al-raj'a) is he who has not yet paid alms on his property or he who has not yet made pilgrimage to the house of his Lord (bayt Rabbihi). That is the allegorical interpretation of the saying of Allāh Most Exalted:

I should then have given (Largely) in
charity, and I Should have been one Of
the doers of good. (63:10)

Ibn 'Abbās ²⁴, may Allāh be pleased with him, used to say that this verse is one of the severest things for Muslims; this refers to the words of Allāh Most Exalted at the beginning of this (passage) (63:10):

O ye who believe! Let not your riches
Or your children divert you From the
remembrance of Allāh. (63:9)

It has been said that a servant will not ask to return (to this world) at the time of his death if he possesses in the view of Allāh, may He be praised and

glorified, the weight of an atom of charity. We have been told that what this means is that whosoever in the hereafter possesses the weight of an atom of charity, if the whole contents of the world were his from beginning to end, he would never wish to return to this world.

One of the gnostics (‘Ārifūn)²⁵ said that Allāh Most Exalted endows His servant with two mysteries, which He confides to him. He communicates this to him through an inspiration with which He inspires him. One of them is when he is born and emerges from his mother's womb. He (Allāh Most Exalted) says to him: "O my servant, verily I have sent you to the world clean and chaste. I have entrusted you with your life, and have committed it to you. So see to it that you will preserve that trust and see to it that you meet Me (again) (in the same condition) as (when) I sent you out".

A (second) mystery is at the departure of his spirit (when Allāh) says: "O my servant, what have you done with my trust (which was committed) to you?. Did you preserve it with close observance and attention until you meet Me, (in which case) then I will discharge My obligation to you and reward you?. Or have you neglected it, in which case I shall meet you with a

calling to account and punishment?". This is included in God's saying (may He be praised and glorified):

Those who faithfully observe Their trust and their covenants.(23:8)

And another saying of His:

And fulfill your Covenant With Me as I fulfill My covenant With you. (2:40).

The life of (God's) servant is indeed a trust to him. If he abides by it, he will have fulfilled the trust, and if he abandons it, he will have betrayed Allāh Most Exalted:

For Allāh loveth not the treacherous.
(8:58)

(p.369)

And in the tradition narrated by Ibn 'Abbās (may Allāh be pleased with him):

Whoever neglects the injunctions of Allāh (may He be praised and glorified), he has departed from the covenant of Allāh Most Exalted.²⁶

At the moment of sincere repentance there is forgiveness of bad deeds and entrance into Paradise.

One of them (the gnostics) used to say: "I know when Allāh Most Exalted forgives me". He was asked: "When?". He replied: "When He has bestowed repentance upon me". (And) another person said: "For me the

withholding of repentance is more dreadful than the withholding of forgiveness". Allāh Most Exalted said:

And whose word can be Truer than Allāh's. (4:87)

But He turned to you And forgave you. (2:187)

And Allāh Most Exalted said in similar vein:

He is the One that accepts Repentance from His Servants And forgives sins. (42:25)

One of the 'ulamā' said:

The repentance of the servant will not be valid unless he forgets his lusts and he becomes one who remembers grief so that it does not leave his heart and he becomes one who abandons sin so that it does not pervade his inmost being.

One of the 'ulamā' of Syria said:

The novice (murīd) will not become a penitent until the angel of the left side (sāhib al-shimāl) has not recorded any sin for him for twenty years.

One of the pious predecessors (salaf) said:

One of the signs of genuine repentance²⁷ is that he will exchange for the sweetness of lust the sweetness of obedience and will exchange for the pleasure of engaging in sinful acts grief at that and joy at a proper turning towards God.

One of the 'ulamā' said as regards the meaning of this sentence:

The servant will not become a penitent until he puts the bitterness of being

in opposition to the lower soul in place of the sweetness of being in accord with it (the lower soul).

It has been narrated to us in the Isrā'iliyyāt²⁸ that Allāh (may He be praised and glorified) said to one of His prophets who had asked Him for the acceptance of the repentance of a servant after he had striven in devotion for many years but had not seen his repentance accepted. Then He said to him): "I swear by My Glory and Majesty, that even if the inhabitants of the skies and the earth interceded with Me on his behalf, I would not accept his repentance, (because) the sweetness of that sin from which he has repented (is still) in his heart". Anyone in whose heart the sweetness of sin remains, or who ponders on it when he remembers it in his mind, it is to be feared that he will resume it. (This can only be avoided) by stringent self-mortification and hatred of it, and by banishing the thought of it from his heart when he remembers it, with fear and apprehension of it.

Abū Muḥammad Sahl said:

The first (thing) which is commanded to the beginner novice (al-mubtadī' al-murīd) is repentance; that is the transformation of blameworthy behaviour to praiseworthy behaviour, and keeping himself in seclusion (khalwah) and silence. His repentance will not be valid except by taking lawful food and he will not be able to consume lawful things until he fulfills what is due to Allāh Most

Exalted with regard to his creatures, and what is due to Allāh Most Exalted with regard to Himself. (All of) this will not be valid for him until he purifies himself from everything which is not concerned with Allāh Most Exalted,²⁹ and until he ceases to be (too) certain of (earning) Allāh's forbearance by his pious deeds.

The true meaning of repentance is to abandon that which is to one's credit so that one does not enter upon that which is to one's discredit, and that one should never procrastinate, and should always oblige oneself to concentrate upon the present time (al-hāl fi 'l-waqt).

(p.370)

They have related to us the words of Sarī al-Saqatī:³⁰

It is a condition of repentance that the penitent who turns repentantly must commence by parting company with the people of disobedience and thereafter with his (lower) soul on account of which he disobeyed Allāh Most Exalted, and not give it anything but that which is essential. Then he must make a firm decision never to return to disobedience, and he will receive his provision from people, he will abandon whatever compels him to sin and will never follow passion, (but) will follow those (pious) predecessors who have gone before him.

It is necessary for those who repent to hold themselves to account at every single moment, to leave aside every lust and abandon vain acts. These (consist

of) six items: abandoning idle talk, abandoning idle looking, abandoning idle walking, and abandoning idle eating, drinking and clothing. (Sarī) said:

Only those who abandon passions are able to abandon dubious acts (shubahāt).

Yahyā b. Mu'ādh,³¹ may Allāh have mercy upon him, was asked: "How does the penitent behave?". He replied:

For all of his life he is between two days, the day which is past and the day which remains, and he sets them aright with three things. As for the past, it is by regret and by asking the forgiveness (of Allāh). As for that which remains, it is by abandoning confusion and its followers, keeping to the company of novices, and sitting with those who practise remembrance (of God). The third thing is constantly to purify his nutrition and persistence in practising (good) deeds. A sign of true repentance is tenderness of heart and abundance of tears.

In the tradition (it is said):

Sit with penitents, for they are the tenderest of heart.³²

(A man's) penitence can be established (by the fact that) he regards his sins as great, for it is said:

Whenever the servant regards (his) sin as great, it is small in the sight of Allāh Most Exalted.

It is said that regarding a sin as small is a major sin (kabīra), as is mentioned in the tradition:

The believer is he who feels that his sin is as big as a mountain above him, which he fears will fall upon him, (whereas) the hypocrite is he who feels that his sin is as small as a fly which passes his nose and he swats it away.³³

We have been informed in khabar mursal³⁴:

Let any one of you fear lest he be held to account in his very soul for the least of his sins.³⁵

A certain person said:

The sin which is not forgiven is when a servant says; "would that every deed I have done were like this".

This is like the words of Bilāl b. Sa'd³⁶:

Do not consider the smallness of the offence but consider Him whom you have disobeyed.

We have been informed concerning Allāh Most Exalted that He revealed to one of His saints:

Do not consider the smallness of the gift but consider the Majesty of Him who bestowed it. Do not consider the smallness of the offence but consider the Majesty of Him with whom you face it, for sins grow great in proportion to the greatness of the One with whom you face them, and they grow large in (men's) hearts when they see the Majestic One and (realise that) they have been disobedient to His command

to them. For then no sin will seem small, and minor sins will seem major sins to those who are struck by fear. This is one of two ways of interpreting the saying of the Most Exalted:

Such (is the Pilgrimage): Whoever honours the sacred Rites of God, for him It is good in the sight Of his Lord. (22:30)

Such (is his state): and Whoever holds in honour The Symbols of Allāh (In the sacrifice of animals), Such (honour) should come truly From piety of heart. (22:32)

It is said: "Al-hurumāt (the sacred rites of God) grow great in his heart, so that he does not violate them".

Of the same sort is the saying of the Companions to the Successors:

"Verily all of you commit acts which are smaller in your eyes, than (p.371) a hair but which we considered at the time of the Prophet (P.B.U.H) as sins leading to perdition".

They did not mean that grave sins at the time of the Prophet (P.B.U.H) became small sins thereafter, but that they considered small sins as grave sins because of the majesty of Allāh Most Exalted in their hearts on account of the greatness of the light of faith (nūr al-īmān), and that was not in the hearts of those who came after them.

Allāh Most Exalted revealed to one of His saints:

How many sins have I seen from you for less than which I have destroyed one of the nations?.

There has been related to us from Abān b. Ismā'īl from Anas from the Prophet (P.B.U.H):

Allāh Most Exalted destroyed one of the nations because they used to masturbate.³⁷

As regards forgetfulness and remembrance of sins, there are differences of opinion amongst the gnostics on this point. Some of them said that the truth of repentance is to raise up your sin before your eyes. Others said that the real meaning of repentance is to forget your sin. These are two paths of two groups, and two states (hālān) for the people of two stations (maqāmān).

As regards the remembrance of sins, this is the path of novices (murīdūn) and the state (hāl) of those who fear (God) (khā'ifūn). They are drawn to keep it in mind by perpetual sorrow and unceasing fear.

As regards forgetfulness of sins, because they are distracted from them with orisons and the deeds which lie before them in the future, this is the path of

gnostics, and the state (hāl) of those who love (God) and the aim of those who contemplate the uniqueness (of God) (mushāhadat al-tawhīd); this is a station in cognition (maqām fi 'l-ta'arruf). The aim of the first (group) is to achieve the contemplation of acquaintance and definition (mushāhadat al-tawqīf wa 'l-tahdīd) which is a station (maqām) in identification (maqām fi 'l-ta'rīf), and in either one of these stations, the servant stands firm in order to testify to his aim and to practise compliance with his state.

According to the gnostics, the maqām shahādat al-tawhīd is superior to the maqām mushāhadat al-ta'rīf, even though the latter station is wider and bigger, for this is for the people of the right side (aṣḥāb al-yamīn) and the generality of those who are nigher to (God). The station of shahādat al-tawhīd is narrower and smaller, but its people are higher and superior, and it is for those who are nigher to God and the elect of those who achieve gnosis.

The novice may encounter (something like) the story of the Prophet David (may Allāh have mercy upon him) in his remembering and weeping for his wrongdoing. The prophets cannot be compared with them (Ṣūfīs) because they transcend the limits of ordinary people, but they sometimes change into the state of

novices and accompany them on the path of the student. This is for the sake of the community, that it may be a path for all men.

Know that (the novice) who is weak in certainty and strong in lower soul cannot be sure when he contemplates his sins that his heart will not look upon them with desire, or that his lower soul will not incline towards them with sweetness, so that these things will become the means of his seduction and he will become corrupt after having reformed. Likewise one cannot be sure, when someone goes over a sin with the intention of looking to its cause, that his lower soul will not move toward it. Even though it may be better to keep company (with the sin), as long as this keeping company is not a transgression in order to mortify the lower soul by abstaining from it, nevertheless this can be (p.372) hazardous and dangerous, and it is safer than to abandon its company and sever all links with it. Whatever is safer for the novice is better, and by forgetting sins he can contemplate what lies in the future and shrink from the time which has been lost, for fear of further loss.

A certain gnostic disapproved of the novice being tempted by Paradise and thinking of what is in it in the way of bounty, clothes and spouses, and said;

I prefer that the novice should be tempted by remembering Allāh Most Exalted, and that his thoughts and zeal should be attached to Allāh Most Exalted, exclusively. This is because the novice is a beginner in repentance, not used to prolonged uprightness (istiḡāma) and virtuousness (‘ismah). Whenever he remembers the bounty of Paradise, I cannot be certain because of the weakness of his heart that he will not desire the like of that which he sees in this world in the way of clothes, good things and marriage. For these are available in this world while (the blessing of Paradise) are only available in the hereafter, and so his lower soul will demand such things as he remembers of the bounty of the Hereafter instantly in this world. If his zeal is merely for Allāh Most Exalted, this will keep him further away from the adornment and passions of this world, and the Enemy will not be able to represent to him the like of (this bounty) in this world before he has strengthened his certainty, removed his (previous) customs and prolonged his virtuousness.

There is also disagreement amongst the people who possess knowledge concerning the case of one servant who abandons sin and works to live in an upright life, but his lower soul strives against him (to bring him to sin), though he struggles against it; and another servant who abandons sin and is absorbed in reforming (himself) while his lower soul does not demand anything from him and does not strive to bring him to sin, and it causes no pressure or need to struggle upon his heart;

which one of these is superior?. One of the 'ulamā' of Syria said:

The one whose lower soul pulls him to sin while he struggles against it is superior, because he has to contend with it, and has the virtue of struggling against it.

Aḥmad b. Abi 'l-Ḥawārī³⁸ and the followers of Abū Sulaymān al-Dārānī inclined to this view.

The 'ulamā' of Baṣra say:

The one whose lower soul desists from struggle because of the presence of certainty and conviction, so that he no longer feels any urge to return or desire for that to which he was accustomed is superior.

Rabāḥ b. 'Amr al-Qaysī,³⁹ one of the outstanding 'ulamā' of Baṣra, inclined to this view, and said:

If this (desire) is abated, he will be nearer to safety, while the other is not safe from relapsing.

These are his words.

There is also disagreement among the 'ulamā' concerning two servants. One of them was asked to sacrifice some of his money for the sake of Allāh Most Exalted, and his lower soul was reluctant and it weighed heavy upon him, but he strove against it and spent his money. The other one was asked to give his money and he spent it when he was asked in full obedience without any

weighing upon it or any struggle against it on his part.
Which one of them is superior?.

(p.373)

One group said:

The one who strives hard against his lower soul is superior, because acting against his will and struggle are combined in him, and so he will have acquired two (meritorious) actions.

Ibn 'Aṭā'⁴⁰ and his followers are of this opinion. Others say:

The one whose lower soul gives freely and generously in obedience, without compulsion or objection, is superior; this is because the station of this man, in the generosity of his soul, and his realisation of asceticism, is superior to all the meritorious acts of the former in acting against his will and striving, and giving generously of his property in these conditions because the first person even if he overcomes his lower soul on this occasion, cannot be certain that it will not overcome him on a second or third occasion, since generosity is not yet intrinsic to its station, and it had to be compelled to this.

This is the view of al-Junayd,⁴¹ may Allāh have mercy upon him, I subscribe to what he said, but the (above) phrasing is mine.

Abū Muḥammad Sahl was asked about a man who repents of something and abandons it; after that it

comes into his heart, or he sees it or hears of it, and it seems sweet to him. (Abū Muḥammad Sahl) said:

(Finding sin) sweet is in the nature of mankind, and one cannot escape from nature. One can only deal with it by raising one's heart up to one's Lord in grief, denying it with one's heart, forcing one's lower soul to deny it, never leaving it alone, praying to Allāh Most Exalted that He will cause one to forget this, and making oneself busy with other things in the way of remembrance and obedience. If one stops denying (it) for as long as the twinkling of an eye, I fear that one will not be safe, and the attraction of sin will act upon one's heart; but if when one finds it sweet, one compels one's heart to deny it and to sorrow, it will not harm one.

This is correct, in my opinion, because repentance is not valid if passion remains, and therefore the servant is desired to struggle, and this is the state of the novices.

The obliterating of passion from the heart is attained by perpetual following of the prescription of the gnostics. Sometimes there are attached to a sin many other sins which are greater than it, such as persistence in the sin, rejoicing in it, delaying repentance after committing it, finding the commission of a similar (sin) sweet, experiencing sorrow and aversion when it has ceased, joy at performing it or adding other sins to it, if it is a sin between two

others, or spending the property of Allāh (may He be praised and glorified) upon it, for this is ingratitude for His blessing (kufr al-ni'ma); it has been said:

Whoever spends a dirham upon a unlawful act is a spendthrift.

Another kind (of sin) is to belittle the sin and disdain it, for this is worse than committing it, or belittling Allāh's concealing of one's sin; or thinking little of His clemency toward oneself, for this comes from arrogance and feeling secure; or ignoring the bounty of Allāh Most Exalted towards him in the way of concealing one's sin and displaying the opposite, as the Prophet (P.B.U.H) said in the prayer related directly (ma'thūr) from him in which he praises Allāh, may He be praised and glorified:

O One who displays the beautiful and conceals the ugly, and does not hold us to account for sin, and does not reveal the secret.

for it is said that every disobedient person is under the shelter of the Merciful and when he lifts his hands from Him, He uncovers his secret; or (this comes) from announcing one's sin aloud, flaunting it and making a show of it, for this is rebellion.

In the tradition (it is said that):

Every person is exempted except those who display (their sin) openly. One of

them passes the night in a state of disobedience and Allāh Most Exalted hides him from the public and the next morning he lifts the cover of Allāh Most (p.374) Exalted and talks about his sins.⁴²

And sometimes the one who disobeys makes the sin a custom (sunna) in which he is followed (by others), and the evil consequences of his sin will continue to be his responsibility as long as it is followed. It has been said: "Blessed be he whose sins die with him at the time of his death, and he is not held to account for them thereafter, and blessed be he who does not recount his sin to others".

One of them (the 'ulamā') said:

Do not commit sin, but if it is unavoidable, do not cause another person to sin, for then you will have the burden of two sins". Allāh Most Exalted made this one of the attributes of the Hypocrites in His saying:

The Hypocrites, men and women (Have an understanding) with each other; They enjoin evil and forbid What is just. (9:67)

Whoever causes his brother to sin with him, he has enjoined evil and forbidden what is good.

One of the pious predecessors said:

No man will violate the honour of his brother more than by helping him to

commit disobedience and then making him disdain it. The servant may live for forty years and then die, but his sins remain after him for a hundred years for which he will be punished in his grave, if he establishes (a sin) as a custom and it is followed until it (the custom) dies out or those who practise it die. Then the (punishment) will fall from him and he will be at rest from it.

It is said that the gravest of sins (is that of) the person who wrongs someone whom he does not know and has not seen from among those who preceded (him). For example, talking about the pious predecessors who were people of devotion and the leaders of those who fear God. All of these meanings are included in the one sin and are greater than it. Of this sort is the saying of God Most Exalted:

And We record That which they send
before And that which they leave
Behind. (36:12)

It is said that (this means) their customs which are acted upon after them.

In the tradition (it is said):

Whoever invents an evil custom which is acted upon after him, there is upon him a heavy load similar to that of the person who acts upon it (the evil custom), while their loads will not be diminished in any way.⁴³

Ibn 'Abbās, may Allāh be pleased with both of them (father and son), used to say:

Woe to the learned man on account of his followers, when he makes an error and then retracts it, but the people adopt it, and take it to distant places.

A certain man of letters said:
The mistake of the learned man is like the wreck of a ship which sinks and drowns the people together with it".

In Isrā'īlī tradition (it is said):

There was a learned man who used to lead the people astray with innovations. After that repentance overcame him and he turned repentantly to Allāh Most Exalted and undertook acts of improvement for a period (of time). Then Allāh Most Exalted revealed to their prophet:

Say to him, if your sin were between Me and you, I would forgive you, great as was your sin, but what of those people from amongst My servants whom you have seduced and caused to enter the Fire?.

As for seeking to legalise disobedience or making it lawful to others, it has no connection whatsoever with these matters, since this constitutes departure from the community and changing Islamic law (Sharī'a), and it is (committing) disbelief in Allāh Most Exalted, as has been narrated from the Prophet (P.B.U.H):

(p.375)
He does not believe in the Qur'an who
legalises what is prohibited by it.⁴⁴

Allāh Most Exalted called the evildoers the
ignorant, and the Most Exalted said:
If any of you did evil In ignorance.
(6:54)

and also:
Nay, but ye are A people (grossly)
ignorant!. (27:55)

It is said that the throne (of God) trembles
and that the Lord is angry at three deeds: Taking a life
for other than a life, a man lying with a man, and a
woman lying with a woman.

In a tradition (it is said):

If a homosexual were to ablute himself
with the oceans, nothing would purify
him except repentance.⁴⁵

If there were no misfortune in the
commission of a slight sin except for being deprived of
obedience, losing the sweetness of service (to God) and
the hatred of the Lord, this would be the greatest of
punishments, as Wuhayb b. al-Ward⁴⁶ said when he was
asked:

Is there the sweetness of obedience
for the one who is disobedient?

and he replied:

No, nor for the one who desires to be disobedient.

It is for this reason that Allāh Most Exalted called (the Prophet) John (Yaḥyā) a "chief" (sayyid) because he did not desire to be disobedient; and the title (lit: sign) of sayyid was used for those who did not desire to be disobedient, so that one who did not desire to be disobedient became a chieftain.

In the tradition (it is said), "Whoever wears the robe of fame" or in another version "Whoever admires himself and becomes conceited, Allāh Most Exalted will turn away from him, even though he is beloved to Him".⁴⁷ How, then, will it be, when going against Allāh causes estrangement, loneliness and cessation of contact.

A tradition has been related to us (which says): "When Adam, peace and blessing be upon him, ate from the Tree, his clothes flew from his body and his pudenda (‘awra) were bared, and he was ashamed that the crown and the diadem should be lifted from his face. Then Gabriel, peace be upon him, appeared to him and took the crown from his head and Michael untied the diadem from his brow and they (Adam and Eve) were addressed from above the throne: "Descend from My

presence, for whoever disobeys Me will not remain in My presence". Then Adam, weeping, turned to Eve, and said: "This is the first evil of disobedience. We have been excluded from the presence of the Beloved One".

We have been informed that when Solomon the prophet of Allāh (P.B.U.H) was punished for his fault with regard to the statue which was worshipped in his house for forty days, or according to another report, (because) when the woman asked him to judge in favour of her father against his enemy he replied: "Yes", but he did not do so; or, according to another report, he wished in his heart that the judgement should be in favour of her father against his enemy because of her position, he was robbed of his kingdom for forty days, and he fled, wandering aimlessly. He would beg with his hands but was not fed, and when he said, "Please feed me, I am Solomon the son of David", he was struck on the head and beaten.

I have been informed that he sought food from a house, but he was driven away and a woman spat on his face.

In another version he said this, and an old woman brought out a pot of urine and poured it on his head. Finally the ring came forth from the belly of the

fish and he put it on after forty days had elapsed, these being the days of his punishment. Birds came and bent down to him, and genies, devils and wild beasts came and assembled around him. When the (p.376) hunters recognised him they slaughtered (an animal) before him, sought forgiveness for having driven him away and struck him on the head. Solomon said:

I do not blame you for what you did before, and I do not praise you for what you are doing now. This is a command from Heaven which must be obeyed.⁴⁸

I have been informed that Solomon was travelling and the wind carried him amidst his armies. When he looked upon his shirt, and it was a new shirt that he was wearing, he seemed to be conceited because of it. Then the wind put him down on the ground and he said to it, "Why did you do this when I did not command you to do so?". And the wind replied, "We obey you as long as you obey Allāh Most Exalted".

One of the 'ulamā' said in this regard: Whoever fears Allāh Most Exalted, everything will fear him, and whoever fears other than Allāh Most Exalted, He will make him fear everything. Likewise, whoever obeys Allāh Most Exalted, He will subjugate everything to him, and whoever disobeys Him, He will subjugate him to everything or he will make everything his master. If there were no misfortune in persisting in disobedience other than that everything which afflicted the servant

would be punishment for him, so that even if it were kindness he would be punished, and would not be sure that he would be forgiven, while if it were hardship it would be a punishment for him, (that would suffice).

In the tradition (it is said):

The servant is deprived from (gaining) bounty because of the sinful act he has committed.⁴⁹

It has been said: "The bounty which comes from unlawful deeds contains little assistance for righteous deeds".

Ibn Mas'ūd,⁵⁰ may Allāh be pleased with him, used to say:

I consider that the servant will forget knowledge because of the sin which he has committed; and if there were no blessing from repentance, knowledge and remaining upright in obedience other than the fact that whatever befell the servant would be for his good, so that if it were comfort it would be generosity from Allāh Most Exalted upon him and kindness to him from (Allāh), and if it were hardship it would be a trial from Allāh Most Exalted and it would be good for His servant, so that he would find it sweet and delicious, because it would be for His sake and it would have befallen him as he stood firm in obedience to Him (that would suffice); and even if there were no greater misfortune (in being among) people and experiencing the deficiency caused by associating with them other than that the acts of disobedience are more severe with them, and are greater through them, then acts of wrongdoing would attach to their worldly and their religious affairs; thus whoever

has few (acquaintances) among them
will have few sins with them.

One of the pious predecessors said:

Allāh's curse is neither having one's face blackened nor a decrease of one's property. Being cursed is not to escape from one's sin without falling into another which is like it or worse than it. This is because being cursed is being driven away or kept distant, and when (a man) is driven away from obedience, it is no longer possible for him to perform deeds which bring him closer to Allāh. He is not granted success in these things. He is cursed.

It has been said as regards the meaning of the tradition which we related previously: "The servant is deprived from (gaining) bounty because of the sinful act he has committed" that lawful things are prohibited to him and he will not be granted success because he has fallen into disobedience. It has (also) been said that he will be debarred from the gathering of the 'ulamā' and that his heart will not be enlightened by associating with good people. It has (also) been said that pious people and those who possess knowledge of Allāh Most Exalted will detest him and turn away from him, and it has also been said that knowledge indispensable to action will be prohibited to him because of his remaining in ignorance, and dubious things will not be removed for him (p.377) because of his remaining (attached) to (his) lusts; indeed, matters

will become more obscure to him, and he will be more bewildered in them, without any protection from Allāh Most Exalted, and (he) will not be guided to what is truer and better.

Al-Fuḍayl⁵¹ used to say:

Your sin will cause you to inherit what you have disliked in the way of changes (wrought) by time and harshness (shown) by your brethren.

It is said:

Forgetfulness of the Qur'an after memorising it is one of the severest punishments. Being prevented from reading it, being unable to bear reciting it, and being distracted from it by its opposite, are the punishment for persistence in sin.

One of the Ṣūfīs of Syria said:

I looked upon a Christian lad who was fair of face, and I stood looking upon him. Then Ibn al-Jallā'⁵² of Damascus passed by me and he took my hand. I was ashamed before him, and I said: "O Abū 'Abd Allāh, praise be to Allāh! I was amazed at this beautiful form and this perfect creation, (and wondered) how it was created for the Fire? He touched my hand and said, "You will be punished for this after a while", and I was punished thirty years later.

One of them said:

I recognise the punishment for my sin in the misshapeness of my donkey.

and another said:

I recognise the punishment even in the fire of my house.

(The following story) has been related to us from Manṣūr the jurist (al-faqīh)⁵³ :

I saw Abū ‘Abd Allāh al-Sukkarī⁵⁴ in my sleep and I asked him, "What has Allāh done to you?" He replied: "He placed me before Him in a sweat until the flesh of my cheeks fell off". I asked: "Why was that?". He said: "I looked upon a lad coming and going, and the punishment for this is severe and hard".

The punishment for every servant is of the kind which is most severe for him. The people of this world are punished by being deprived of worldly bounty by way of difficulty in gaining wealth and the destruction of their property. But the people of the Hereafter are punished by being deprived of the bounty of the Hereafter by way of receiving little guidance to righteous deeds and experiencing difficulty in gaining mastery over true knowledge. "That is the decree of (Him) the Exalted in Might and the All-Knowing".

Abū Sulaymān al-Dārānī used to say:

Ihtilām⁵⁵ is a punishment.

and he also said:

A man will not lose his prayer in congregation except because of a sin

which he commits. The minute details of one's punishment are in accordance with a graded scale (depending on the kind of sin).

It was related in the tradition (akhbār):

Those things which you have disliked in your time are because of those of your deeds which you have changed.

In the tradition (it is said): Allāh Most Exalted says:

The least thing which I shall do to the servant when he prefers his passions to obedience to Me is that I will deprive him of the attainment of the sweetness of praying to Me.

This is the punishment for those who hope for reward (in the next world). If the change of heart which (takes place) when a sin is committed were to become apparent upon the sinner's face, his face would become black. But Allāh Most Exalted will save him by carrying him and concealing him. He will cover this within his heart; though it will make an impression upon it, it will veil (the heart's) owner and it will be hardened against remembrance, against seeking goodness and piety, and against hastening toward good. This is one of the greatest of punishments.

(p.378)

It is said that whenever the servant

disobeys, his heart become dark with a darkness from which there arises upon the heart a smoke which is beheld by faith. This is (in) the place of the sorrow of a servant who is grieved by a sin, and this smoke becomes a veil (which conceals) knowledge and enlightenment from him as the cloud veils the sun so that it cannot be seen, and it becomes a covering for his nature which he experiences in his lower soul. But when the servant repents and reforms, the veil will be removed and faith will become apparent and will command knowledge, just as the sun appears from beneath the veil. Allāh Most Exalted says on this subject:

By no means! But on their hearts Is
the stain of the (ill) Which they do!.
(83:14)

It has been said that it is one sin after another, until it (disobedience) holds sway over the heart and faith comes to be beneath a veil, so that it neither recognises the good nor denies the prohibited; and then, when it has become completely black, it is turned upside down, and at this moment it becomes audacious in hypocrisy, becomes smooth therein, at ease therein and firm, until Allāh Most Exalted looks upon it, and takes pity upon it by His grace.

Al-Ḥasan, may Allāh be pleased with him,
used to say:

Between the servant and his Lord, may He be praised and glorified, is a well-known barrier of sins, and when the servant reaches it, He places a seal upon his heart, and He will never guide him to righteousness thereafter.

In the tradition of Ibn 'Umar ⁵⁶ (it is said):

The seal is attached to the stand of the throne, and when sacred things are violated and prohibited things are made lawful, Allāh Most Exalted will send the seal and it will seal men's hearts together with what they contain.⁵⁷

In the tradition of Mujāhid⁵⁸ (it is said):

The heart is like an opened hand. Whenever it commits a sin, a finger will close until all the fingers are closed, and they compress the heart; this is the padlock.⁵⁹

It is said, "Every sin (engenders) a plant which grows on the heart. When sins have become numerous, the plant grows around the heart as the calyx grows around the fruit, and it encloses the heart; this is the covering (ghilāf). It is said that it is the awning which is one of the awnings⁶⁰ with which Allāh Most Exalted says that the heart will not hear or comprehend".

In (the course of) a long story one of this

group related the following to me from Abū 'Amr b. 'Ulwān⁶¹:

One day, I was standing to pray when my heart was overcome by a passion about which I thought for a long time until male passion was generated from it. I fell onto the ground and my whole body was blackened. Then I concealed myself in my house for three days and never came out, and I was trying to wash it away in the bathroom with soap and various cleansing substances, but it only grew blacker. Then it was removed from me after three days and the whiteness (of my skin) came back. Then I met Abu 'l-Qāsim al-Junayd, may Allāh have mercy upon him, who had sent for me and brought me from al-Raqqa.⁶² When I came up to him, he said to me, "Are you not ashamed before Allāh Most Exalted?. You were standing before Him, and you conversed with your lower soul in passion until it overcame you at al-Raqqa and it drove you away from the presence of Allāh Most Exalted. If I had not prayed to Allāh may He be praised and glorified on your behalf and repented to Him on your behalf, you would have met Allāh (Most Exalted) with that colour". I was very astonished as to how he knew that when he was in Baghdād and I was in al-Raqqa. Nobody was aware of this (p.379) but Allāh, may He be praised and glorified.

I told these stories to one of the 'ulamā' and he replied:

This was from the kindness and generosity of Allāh Most Exalted to him, since his heart was not blackened and the blackness appeared on his body. If it had been concealed in his heart, he would have been destroyed.

Then he said:

There is no sin which is committed by the servant who persists in it but that his heart is blackened because of it, just like the blackness of body which he mentioned, and it cannot be cleaned away except by repentance.

But not all servants will be treated like Ibn 'Ulwān, or will find someone who will be as kind to him as Abu 'l-Qāsim al-Junayd, may Allāh have mercy upon him. For every sin has a punishment unless it is forgiven by Allāh, and the punishment is not be measured by the sin, or by the extent of the servant's knowledge, but it is according to Divine decree and with the foreknowledge of the Deity. Sometimes it is in the heart and is one of the diseases of the heart, and sometimes it is in the body. It may be in property and family and it may be in a fall in standing and rank among the leading 'ulamā' of Islam and the believers. It may be postponed to the Hereafter, and this is the severest of punishments, which is for those who commit major sins leading to perdition, and who die without repenting, and for those who persist (in sin), arrogance and conceit, because if it were in this world it would be a light punishment in accordance with this world, while if it is postponed, it will be a severe punishment in accordance with the Hereafter.

In the tradition (it is said):

If Allāh Most Exalted wishes (to confer) a favour upon His servant He expedites for him the punishment of his sin, and if He wishes (to confer) disfavour, He postpones it until He fulfills it in the Hereafter.⁶³

Know that grief for worldly things which have eluded one, and eager covetousness for them, are (also) punishments; (know too) that joy and happiness in worldly things which have been attained, together with a lack of concern about departures from one's religion are (also) punishment. Prolonged good health and affluence may be a punishment for sins, if they are the means to disobedience. Sometimes the punishment for a sin may be a similar sin or one greater than it, just as the reward of obedience is similar obedience or better than it.

With regard to one of the aspects of the meaning of the saying of the Most Exalted:

And disobeyed it After He brought you
in sight (Of the Booty) which you
covet. (3:152)

This refers to affluence and good health, just as poverty and illness are from the mercy of Allāh Most Exalted if they are causes for protection (from sin), while both of them are sources of disobedience if they are the causes of it and the paths to it.

Know that the clemency (of Allāh) will not take away the punishment but it will delay it, for it is in the nature of the clement person not to expedite the punishment, but to punish after a while.

It has been related to us with regard to the meaning of the Most Exalted's saying:

But when they forgot The warning they had received, We opened to them the gates Of all (good) things. (6:44)

that this (refers to) comfort and ease. (As for the words)

Until, in the midst Of their enjoyment Of Our gifts, On a sudden, We called Them to account. (6:44)

it is said that (this means) after sixty years.

NOTES

1. This translation will rely on the edition of al-Makkī's Qūt al-Qulūb which was printed in Cairo, 1961. Another version has also been consulted. See Abū Ṭālib al-Makkī, Qūt al-Qulūb fī Mu'āmalat al-Mahbūb wa Wasf Tarīq al-Murīd ilā maqām al-Tawhīd, 2 vols., Cairo, 1961; *Idem*, Qūt al-Qulūb fī Mu'āmalat al-Mahbūb wa Wasf Tarīq al-Murīd ilā maqām al-Tawhīd, 4 vols., Cairo, 1932. The page number given in bracket refer to the pages of the Arabic text.
2. Al-Qur'ān al-Karīm, tr. Abdullah Yusuf Ali, The meaning of the Glorious Qur'ān, (2nd edition), London, 1983.
3. Maqāmāt is the plural of the word maqām which can be translated as mystical station. It is a stage of spiritual attainment on the pilgrim's progress to God which is the result of the mystic's personal effort and endeavour. See A.J. Arberry, Sufism: An account of the mystics of Islam, London, 1950, p.74; Kashf, p.370; Luma', pp.41-42.
4. Ahwāl is the plural of the word hāl which can be translated as denoting "rapid flashes of transitory experiences". Ahwāl depend not upon the mystic but upon God. In other words, they are a gift from God. See Tor Andrae, In the garden of myrtles, N.York, 1987, p.80; Kashf, p.367; Sufism, p.75; Luma', pp.41-42.
5. Those who are at the station of conviction.
6. i.e. the Ṣūfīs.
7. There are about eighty-seven derivations of the word tawba in the Qur'an. Most Ṣūfīs agree that tawba is the first station of the maqāmāt.
8. The word yuḥaddith is derived from the word ḥaddatha which means to take place, to happen, to speak foully (ḥadath), sully etc. As regards the sentence lā yuḥaddith nafsahu in the present translation, it will be translated as "one does not make up one's mind", "one does not entertain any thought of the lower soul", and "one does not think of one's lower soul". In addition to that, it can also be translated as to foul or sully (aḥdatha). Thus lā yuḥdith can be translated as "one does not foul himself". This latter interpretation influenced later Ṣūfī such as al-

Ghazālī (d.505/1111). Such a translation can be found in his chapter entitled "The secret of purification", Ihyā' 'Ulūm al-Dīn, Cairo,1967, 1,pp.170-189.

9. The text has al-tā'ib ḥabīb Allāh, wa 'l- tā'ib min al-dhanb ka man lā dhanb lahu. The first part of this tradition can not be traced but the second part of it is to be found in one of the six canonical ḥadīth collections. See Abū 'Abd Allāh Muḥammad Ibn Mājah, "Kitāb al-Zuhd", Sunan Ibn Mājah, no.4250,3,p.1419.

10. His full name is Abū Sa'īd b. Abi 'l-Ḥasan Yassār al-Baṣrī. He was born at Medina in 642 A.D and died in 728 A.D. He was noted for his asceticism and piety and his fearless speaking to the rulers of his time. He propagated the idea of fear of God. See Tadhkirat,p.19; M.Smith,Rābi'a the mystic, Cambridge, 1928, pp.13-15; Hilyat,1,p.131. H.Ritter, "Ḥasan al-Baṣrī",E.I²,3,pp.247-248.

11. He is one of the prominent Ṣūfīs of the 3rd/9th century. His full name is Abū Muḥammad Sahl b. 'Abd Allāh b. Yūnus al-Tustarī. He was born in Tustar in 815 A.D. He died in Baṣra in 896 A.D. He was noted for his piety, self-mortification, renunciation of this world and miracles. A thorough study of him has been made by G.Böwering and M.K.Ja'far. See Mystical,Berlin,1980; See also Tadhkirat,p.153; Tabaqāt,p.199; Kashf,p.139; Sālimiyya,E.I¹,4,p.115.

12. i.e every single moment.

13. Read ghayyarū instead of ghayyara.

14. Abū Sulaymān 'Abd al-Raḥmān b. Aḥmad b. 'Aṭīyya al-'Ansā died in 215/830. He was noted for his austerity, abstinence and self-mortification. See Wafayāt,3,p.131; Tārīkh,10, p.248; Hilyat,9,p.254; Tabaqāt,p.68.

15. See note 10.

16. His name is Jundub b. Junāda and he is generally known as Abū Dharr al-Ghiffārī. He was one of the prominent Companions of the Prophet (P.B.U.H) and was noted for his humility and asceticism. He is said to have matched Ibn Mas'ūd in religious piety. He died in 33/653. J.Robson, "Abū Dharr", E.I²,1,p.114; Hilyat,1,p.156.

17. This tradition is not in the six canonical

ḥadīth collections. Perhaps it is a weak tradition, or perhaps al-Makkī reported it in his own words.

18. His full name is Abū ʿAbd al-Raḥmān Muʿādh b. Jabal. He was one of the eminent Companions of the Prophet (P.B.U.H) from the ahl al-suffa. He was the most knowledgeable person in the knowledge of ḥalāl and ḥarām. He died in 18/639. See Hilyat, 1, pp. 228-244; Shadharāt, 1, p. 29; Huffāz, 1, pp. 19-21; Isāba, 4, p. 426.

19. This tradition is in one of the six canonical ḥadīth collections. See Abū ʿĪsa Muḥammad al-Tirmīdhī, Saḥīḥ Tirmīdhī, (explanation by Imām Ibn al-Aʿrābī al-Malikī), Cairo, 1934, Abwāb al-Birr wa ʿl-ṣillaḥ, no. 55, 9, pp. 154-155.

20. Lit.: What has been lost and has passed.

21. This is the view of Mujāhid. See Abū Jaʿfar Muḥammad b. Jarīr al-Ṭabarī, Jāmiʿ al-Bayān ʿan Taʾwīl āyī al-Qurʾān, Cairo, 1968, vol. 22, pp. 112-113.

22. This is also the view of Mujāhid. See al-Ṭabarī, Jāmiʿ al-Bayān, 22, pp. 112-113.

23. The text has ashyāʿihim.

24. His full name is ʿAbd Allāh b. al-ʿAbbās. He was born three years before the Hijra and died in 48/668. He was considered as one of the greatest ʿulamāʾ in Islam and was regarded as the father of Qurʾanic exegesis. He was also the ancestor of the Abbasid caliphs and the cousin of the Prophet (P.B.U.H). See L. Veccia Vaglieri, "ʿAbd Allāh b. al-ʿAbbās", E.I², 1, pp. 40-41.

25. It is uncertain to whom al-Makkī refers by using the term ʿārifūn. It presumably refers to all Ṣūfī masters, whereas it appears that such terms as imāmunā, ʿālimunā, baʿdu ʿulamāʾinā and shaykhunā, refer to either Muḥammad b. Sālim, Aḥmad b. Sālim or Sahl al-Tustarī. See Chapter one of this thesis, p. 8.

26. This saying is not in the six canonical ḥadīth collections.

27. Lit. of truth in his repentance on the part of the person repenting.

28. This kind of story can be seen often in the sciences of Quranic exegesis and of ḥadīth. The personalities who narrated this kind of stories

were Jewish or Christian converts to Islam. They are like 'Abīd/'Ubayd b. Sharyā al-Jurhumī, 'Abd Allāh b. Salam, Ka'ab b. al-Ahbar and later Wahb ibn Munabbih. Many Ṣūfīs and historians sometimes relied in their narrations upon this kind of story. Ibn Jarīr al-Ṭabarī, Ibn Kathīr, Ḥasan al-Baṣrī, Mālik b. Dinār, al-Muḥāsibī, Abū Nu'aym al-Iṣfahānī, Abū Ḥamid al-Ghazālī etc. are included in this category. See Muḥammad Ḥusayn al-Dhahabī, al-Isrā'īliyyāt fi 'l-tafsīr wa 'l-hadīth, Cairo, 1971, pp.20-30; cf G.Vajda, "Isrā'īliyyāt", E.I², 4, pp.211-212. A.A.Durī, The rise of historical writing among the Arabs, Princeton, 1983, pp.122-135.

29. Lit: from his movement and his rest.

30. His full name is Abu 'l-Ḥasan Ibn Mughallis al-Saqatī. He was born in 155/771 and died around 253/867 at the age of 98 years old. Al-Saqatī was a merchant and a dealer in second hand goods. He was noted for his piety and abstinence. He was a pupil of Ma'rūf al-Karkhī and was the teacher of al-Junayd. Al-Junayd is reported to have said:

"I have seen no one more bent on worship than al-Saqatī; in the whole ninety-eight years of his life it was unknown for him to lie down, except in his last illness".

Among his pupils apart from al-Junayd were al-Nūrī, Ibn Masrūq, Muḥammad ibn al-Faḍl al-Saqatī, Ibrāhīm al-Makhrāmī and al-'Abbās al-Shaklī. See Tadhkirat, p.166; Tārīkh, 9, pp.187-192; Hilyat, 10, p.116; Kashf, p.110; The Life, pp.8-9.

31. His name is Abū Zakariyya Yaḥyā Ibn Mu'adh al-Rāzī. He was a disciple of Ibn Karrām. His early education was at Rayy and he then left for Balkh. Thereafter he proceeded to Nīshāpūr where he died in 258/871. He was also a poet and was noted for his piety. See Wafayāt, 5, p.765; Tadhkirat, p.179; Tārīkh, 12, p.208; Hilyat, 10, p.51; Shadharāt, 2, p.138; Tabaqāt, pp.98-104; Kashf, p.123.

32. This tradition is not in the six canonical ḥadīth collections.

33. This tradition is in two of the six canonical ḥadīth collections, but the text is slightly different. This is presumably due to the attitude of al-Makkī who has the habit of narrating traditions with his own words. The translation of this ḥadīth is as follows:

"A believer sees his sins as if he were sitting under a mountain which he is afraid may fall on him, whereas the wicked person (al-fājir) considers

his sins as flies passing over his nose and he just drives them away like this".

See Muḥammad b. Ismā'īl al-Bukhārī, Saḥīḥ al-Bukhārī, tr. Muḥammad Muhsin Khan, Ankara, 1977, Kitāb al-Da'wat, 8, pp. 214-215; Abū 'Īsā Muḥammad b. 'Īsā al-Tirmīdhī, al-Jāmi' al-Saḥīḥ, ed. 'Abd al-Wahhāb 'Abd al-Laṭīf 'Uthmān, Medina, 1974, Kitāb ṣifat al-qiyāma, 4, pp. 69-70.

34. **Khabar mursal** is a tradition in which a Successor quotes the tradition of the Prophet directly without relying on a Companion. J. Robson, "Ḥadīth", E.I², 3, p. 26.

35. This tradition is not in the six canonical ḥadīth collections.

36. Bilāl b. Sa'd was a good orator and lived in Syria and Egypt where he was very famous and noted for his piety. He is said to have matched the rank of Ḥasan al-Baṣrī in Baṣra. He was one of the Successors (kāna maḥall Bilāl b. Sa'd bi 'l-Shām wa Miṣr ka maḥall al-Ḥasan b. Abi 'l-Ḥasan bi 'l-Baṣra). See Hilyat, 5, p. 221; Isāba, 1, p. 165.

37. This tradition is not an authentic tradition and cannot be found in the six canonical ḥadīth collections.

38. His name is Abu 'l-Ḥasan Maymūn b. Abi 'l-Ḥawārī. He was from Damascus and a friend of Sulaymān al-Dārānī, Sufyān b. 'Uyayna, Marwān b. Mu'āwiya and others. His father and he were noted for their asceticism, abstinence and piety. He died in 230/844. See Tabaqāt, pp. 88-90.

39. His full name is Abu 'l-Muhājir Rabāḥ/ Rayāḥ b. 'Amr al-Qaysī. He was noted for his devotion. See Hilyat, 6, p. 192.

40. His full name is Aḥmad b. Muḥammad b. Sahl b. 'Aṭā' al-Ādamī; generally known as Abu 'l-'Abbās b. 'Aṭā'. He was contemporary with al-Junayd and was noted for his deep learning in the science of al-Qur'an. He was put to death in 309/921. See Hilyat, 10, pp. 302-305; Tārīkh, 5, pp. 26-30; Tadhkirat, pp. 236-238.

41. Abu 'l-Qāsim al-Junayd Ibn Muḥammad al-Khazaz al-Qawārīrī al-Nihāwandī, son of a glass merchant and nephew of Sarī al-Saqāṭī. A profound study on al-Junayd has been made by Ali Hasan Abdel Kader whose work is entitled The Life, Personality and writings of al-Junayd. R.C Zaehner also discusses

him in Hindu and Muslim Mysticism, pp.135-161. Al-Junayd died in 298/910. See Tadhkirat, pp.199-213; Tabaqāt, pp.153-163; Hilyat, 10, pp.255-287; Tārīkh, 7, pp.241-249; Kashf, pp.128-130; A.J.Arberry, "Djunayd", E.I², 2, p.600.

42. This tradition is in one of the six canonical ḥadīth collections, but the text is slightly different. See al-Bukhārī, Sahīh al-Bukhārī, Kitāb al-Adab, no.95, 8, pp.60-61. The translation of the text is as follows:

All the sins of my followers will be forgiven except those of the mujāhirīn (those who commit a sin openly or disclose their sins to the public). A person commits a sin at night and though Allāh screens it from the public, then he comes in the morning and says: "I did so and so".

43. This tradition is in four of the six canonical ḥadīth collections, one of them that of Abū 'Abd Allāh b. Yazīd Ibn Mājah, Sunan Ibn Mājah, 2 vols., Cairo, n.d, bāb man sanna sunnatan sayyi'atan, no.203, 1, p.74.

44. This tradition is in one of the six canonical ḥadīth collections though it is a weak tradition. See Abū 'Isā Muḥammad al-Tirmīdhī, al-Jāmi' al-Sahīh, no.3065, 4, p.252.

45. This tradition is not in the six canonical ḥadīth collections.

46. Wuhayb b. al-Ward, whose full name is 'Abd al-Wahhāb b. al-Ward al-Makkī. Wuhayb was from the third generation of the inhabitants of Mecca, he was also contemporary with Fuḍayl b. 'Iyāḍ and was noted for his austerity of life and piety in worship. He died in 153/770. See Hilyat, 8, pp.140-161; Sifat, 2, pp.123-128.

47. This tradition is not in the six canonical ḥadīth collections.

48. The source of this story cannot be traced.

49. This tradition is in one of the six canonical ḥadīth collections. See Ibn Mājah, Sunan Ibn Mājah, Bāb al-Qadr, 1, p.35.

50. 'Abd Allāh b. Mas'ūd whose full name is 'Abd Allāh b. Ghāfil b. Ḥabīb b. Ḥudhayl is one of the famous Companions of the Prophet (P.B.U.H). He is

one of those well versed in the science of the Qur'an. See J.C. Vadet, "Ibn Mas'ūd", E.I², 3, pp.873-875.

51. Abū 'Alī al-Fuḍayl Ibn 'Iyāḍ al-Talaqanī was born in Khurasan. Before converting to the life of Sufism, he used to be a highwayman. After that he went to Kufa and later to Mecca and he died in 187/802. See Tabaqāt, pp.7-12; Hilyat, 8, pp.84-139; Kashf, pp.97-100; Tadhkirat, pp.52-61; Sifat, 2, p.140.

52. His full name is Abū 'Abd Allāh b. Yaḥyā b. al-Jallā'al-Dimashqī. He was counted among the outstanding Ṣūfī masters of Syria and was contemporary with al-Junayd and Sahl al-Tustarī. He died in 306/918. As regards this story, al-Ḥujwīrī relates similar details but the roles of the personalities in the story differ for in al-Ḥujwīrī's version Ibn al-Jallā' was the one who looked at the Christian lad and al-Junayd came to him. His account is as follows: "He (Ibn al-Jallā') tells the following story: "One day I saw a beautiful Christian boy. I was amazed at his loveliness and stood still opposite him. Junayd passed by me. I said to him: "O master, will God burn a face like this in Hell-fire?". He answered: "O my son, this is a trick of the flesh, not a look by which one takes warning. If you look with due consideration, the same marvel is existent in every atom of the universe. You will soon be punished for this want of respect. When Junayd turned away from me, I immediately forgot the Qur'an, and it did not come back to my memory until I had for years implored God to help me and had repented of my sin. Now I dare not pay heed to any created object or waste my time by looking at things". See Kashf, p.134.

53. The biography of this personality cannot be traced.

54. The biography of this personality cannot be traced.

55. Iḥtilām is a term which denotes erotic dreams leading to the emission of semen in sleep on reaching puberty.

56. Abū 'Abd al-Raḥmān 'Abd Allāh b. 'Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb, was born some ten years before the Hijra. He embraced Islam and migrated to Medina with his father. He was very pious and knowledgeable in religious matters to the extent that he practised whatever the Prophet (P.B.U.H) did without asking

any question. It was reported that the Prophet (P.B.U.H) did not allow him to join the battle of Uhud because of his young age. He died at Mecca at the age of 84 (74/693). Wafayāt,3,pp. 28-30.

57. This tradition cannot be traced in the six canonical ḥadīth collections.

58. Abu 'l-Ḥāj Mujāhid b. Jabr was born between 19-21/639-641. He was from the generation of the Successors. He is regarded by later scholars as the man among the Successors most knowledgeable in Quranic exegesis. This was because he was one of the pupils of Ibn 'Abbās. He died in 103-104/720-723 at the age of 83-84. See Jalāl al-Dīn 'Abd al-Raḥmān al-Suyūṭī, Al-Itqān fī 'Ulūm al-Qur'ān, Cairo, n.d., 4, p.210; Sīfat, 2, p.118; Hilyat, 3, pp.279-310.

59. This tradition is not in the six canonical ḥadīth collections.

60. cf. Al-Qur'ān, 6:25.

61. His full name is 'Abd al-Wāhid b. 'Ulwān.

62. A town in Syria. See Honigmann, "Al-Raqqa", E.I¹, 3, pp.1119-1110.

63. This tradition cannot be traced in the six canonical ḥadīth collections.

CHAPTER THREE

THE TRANSLATION OF AL-MAKKĪ'S KITĀB AL-TAWBA II.

(p.379)

In the tradition (it is said):

"Some sins are sins which cannot be atoned for except by the cares of earning a living" or in another version (p.380) "which cannot be atoned for except by cares and sorrows".¹

Concern about the lawful things of this world is a penance for the poor, it is graduated punishment for the believers for the meritorious acts for the hereafter which they have failed to perform, and it is punishment for love of this world, for amassing its goods and for avidity for them.

One of the pious predecessors said:

Love of this world is enough unforgivable sin for him (the servant).

Another said:

If the servant had no other sins than that he dwelt with the tribulations of this world to a greater extent than he dwelt with his portion of the Hereafter and with providing himself for it, which (should) not escape him, that would be sufficient.

In the tradition of 'Ā'isha², may Allāh be pleased with her, (it is said):

When the sins of the servant are many and he has not sufficient deeds which can act as penance for them, Allāh,

may He be praised and glorified, puts distress and sorrow into him, and this becomes penance for his sins.³

And it is said:

The distress, which appears in the heart at a time when the servant does not know its cause, is the penance for wrongdoing.

and it is also said:

it is the sorrow of the mind when it remembers (Allāh's) awareness and reckoning for the wrongdoing of the body. This grief clings to the mind and it appears to the servant as though he does not know the cause of his distress.

One of the traditions about Jacob (Ya'qūb P.B.U.H) is that Allāh Most Exalted revealed to him:

If it were not for My previous care for you which is in My knowledge, I should have made Myself the Most miserly of the misers toward you because of your frequent applications to Me, your long asking from Me and My delaying of a reply to you. However, because of My care for you, I have made Myself present in your heart (to let you know) that I am the Most Merciful of the merciful and the Most Just of the just. You have a position already with Me which cannot be attained by any of your knowledge except by your sorrow for Joseph. Therefore, I have desired to inform you of this position.

We have also been told (the following):

When Gabriel (P.B.U.H) met Joseph (P.B.U.H) in prison he (Joseph) asked him: "How did I leave the sorrowful old man (Jacob)?" He replied: "He sorrowed for you with the sorrow of a hundred bereaved mothers". He asked: "What reward has he with Allāh Most Exalted?" (Gabriel) replied: "The reward of a hundred martyrs".

In a tradition which has been related to us from the pious predecessors:

Every servant who disobeys asks permission from his place on earth that it will swallow him up, and from his roof of the sky that it will fall upon him and eclipse him. Then Allāh, may He be praised and glorified, says to the earth and sky: "It is enough for My servant; so grant him a delay, for you did not create him, and even if you had created him you would have had mercy upon him, so that he might repent to Me and I might forgive him, since perhaps he might change to righteousness and I might give him the reward for good deeds in exchange.

This is the meaning of the saying of the Most Exalted:

It is Allāh Who sustains The heavens and the earth, Lest they cease (to function). (35:41)

that is because of the disobedience of the servants, and:

And if they should fail, There is none -not one- Can sustain them thereafter; Verily He is Most forbearing. (35:41)

this means from their disobedient acts. "And oft forgiving" of their evil deeds.

It has been said in the interpretations of this verse: Whenever Allāh, may He be praised and glorified, beholds the sins of the servants He becomes angry. Then the earth quakes (p.381) and the heavens tremble. The angels of the heaven descend and hold the ends of the earths and the angels of the earths ascend and hold the ends of the heavens, and they recite "Say! He is Allāh, the One and the Only" (Qul Huwa Allāh Ahad) (112:1) continuously until His anger abates, may He be praised and glorified. This is (the meaning of) the saying of the Most Exalted:

It is Allāh who sustains the heavens
and the earth. (35:41)

One of the 'ulamā' said, "Whenever the bell is struck on the earth and the call of the Jāhiliyya is made, the anger of the Lord, may He be praised and glorified, becomes severe. Whenever He looks upon children at school and He sees people frequenting mosques, or (in another version) whenever He looks upon those who love each other for the sake of Allāh or those who visit one another for His sake, or He hears the voices of those who call to prayer, He becomes

forbearing and forgiving. This is (the meaning of) the saying of the Most Exalted:

Verily He is Most Forbearing; oft forgiving. (35:41)

Whenever the servant follows his sin with another sin and does not make repentance between the two sins, it is to be feared that he will perish, since this is the state of one who persists (in sin), and since also he has gone astray from his Master by neglecting to turn (repentantly) to Him and persisting in his station (associated) with the lower soul following his passions, for this is a station of hatefulness in farness (from Allāh).

The best (act) which the servant can perform is to cut off from the desires of the lower soul the sweetest passions which he has, since his (soul's) desires have no end which may be expected, just as they have no beginning which can be established; for if this is not cut off, it will have no end. If he is distracted (from these things) by an increase of obedience and he finds obedience sweet, (then so much the better), but if not, he must compel his lower soul to show patience and to strive, for this is the path of those who are true among the novices.

It has been said of the saying of the Most Exalted:
Pray for help from Allāh And (wait) in patience and constancy. (7:128)

that this means "pray to Him for help in obedience and be patient in striving against disobedience".

‘Alī, may Allāh bestow honour on him, said:

All good works beside the enjoining of what is good and the prohibiting of what is evil, are like spitting in the sea. The enjoining of what is good and the prohibiting of what is evil beside struggling in the way of Allāh Most Exalted are like spitting in the sea; and struggling in the way of Allāh Most Exalted, beside struggling against the lower soul (to turn it) from its passion in order to avoid that which is forbidden is like spitting in a deep sea.

The transmitted tradition:

You returned from the lesser struggle to the greater struggle, which is the struggle against the lower soul (self-mortification).⁴

has the same meaning.

Sahl b. ‘Abd Allāh used to say:

Patience is vindication of truthfulness. The best of the stages of obedience is patience (in abstaining from) disobedience, and after that patience in obedience.

It has been related to us in the Isrā’iliyyāt that a man married a woman in a village and

sent his servant to bring her to him. Then his lower soul tempted him and caused him to desire her. He strove against it and sought protection from Allāh. Then Allāh Most Exalted conferred prophethood upon him, and he was a prophet among the children of Israel.

In one of the stories of Moses (Mūsā P.B.U.H) (it is related) that he said to Khiḍr⁵ (P.B.U.H):

With what means did Allāh Most Exalted reveal (p.382) to you knowledge of that which is hidden?". He replied, "By my abandoning disobedience for the sake of Allāh Most Exalted".

for the reward is from Allāh, and He makes it the highest recompense, not for the value of the deed, but when a servant performs a work for His sake, He grants him His rewards without making a reckoning. He does not hold the penitent to account for a habitual sin, as a result of which his repentance would become impossible, for the habitual sin is one of the armies of Allāh Most Exalted without which all men would become penitents. If there were no temptation, the penitents would remain upright. Then one should work to cut off the habitual sin, if there is one, and then one should endure patiently in striving against the lower soul in its passion if one is tempted by it. These practices are among the virtuous and purest of the novices' action,

and with them the peaceful soul (al-nafs al-mutma'inna) is inspired with right guidance and fear of God, and through them, it departs from the attribute of (the lower soul) which commands to evil (al-ammāra bi 'l-sū') to the attribute of the soul which is at peace in the moral character (akhlāq) of faith. This is one of the interpretations of the tradition (in which it is said), "The best work is something which you force upon the lower soul against its wish".⁶ For the lower soul hates what is against its desire, and desire is the opposite of truth. Allāh Most Exalted loves the truth, and he who is mighty of soul is in disagreement with passion and in agreement with the truth. For love of truth is one of the best works, as Allāh Most Exalted says:

The balance that day Will be true (to
a nicety) Those whose scale (of good)
Will be heavy, will prosper. Those
whose scale will be light, Will find
their souls In perdition, for that
they Wrongfully treated Our Signs.
(7:8-9)

He excludes from "those whose souls are in perdition" those who enjoin one another to the truth and to patience. This is the first (stage) of conviction.

I have been told by a man of repute that he used to walk in the mud. He would guard against it, roll up his garment up from his shanks and walk at the side of the road, until his foot slipped in the mud, his legs

went into the middle of the mud and then he began to walk in the middle of the road. Then he wept. He was asked: "What are you weeping for?" He replied: "This is like the servant who always seeks to avoid sins and to keep away from them, but falls into a sin or two sins, whereupon he wades in sins".

It is incumbent upon the servant to repent from his heedlessness which has taken place. When he realises this, his repentance will never cease, for Allāh Most Exalted has made those who are heedless in this world into those whose souls are in perdition in the world to come. The Most Exalted said:

And they who take no heed. Without
doubt, in the Hereafter They will
perish. (16:108-109)

Moreover (it is) heedlessness beyond heedlessness and loss beyond loss, so do not regard heedlessness as trivial, for it is the start of disobedience, which according to the mūqinīn is the root of major sins.

‘Alī, may Allāh bestow honour on him, regarded heedlessness as one of the stations of disbelief and linked it to blindness and doubt. He regarded the person who commits it as having deviated from right guidance, he characterised it as sorrow and he spoke upon the tradition which was narrated from the

line of the ahl al-bayt. Then 'Ammār b. Yāsir⁷ stood up and said:

O Commander of the believers, tell us about disbelief. On what basis is it established? 'Alī said; "On four pillars; harshness, blindness, heedlessness and doubt. Whoever is harsh will disdain the truth publicly, expose (p.383) falsehood and hate the 'ulamā'. Whoever is blind will forget remembrance. Whoever is heedless will stray from right guidance and be tempted by desires and seized by regret and remorse. He will see from Allāh that upon which he did not count; and whoever doubts will be led astray in error".

One of the 'ulamā' said:

Whoever is sincere in abandoning passion and striving against his lower soul for the sake of Allāh Most Exalted seven times will not be tempted by it (thereafter).

And another one said:

Whoever repents from sin and keeps in uprightness for seven years will not ever return to it.

One of the 'ulamā' said:

The atonement for habitual sin, if you are able to do so, should (correspond to) the number of times you have committed it, so that every abandoning becomes an atonement for an act. This is the state of those among the penitents who are strong. It is not the path of those among the novices who are weak. Rather the state of those who are weak is flight and remoteness (from Allāh). Whoever is tempted by the idea of disobedience when (the occasion) is absent, will not be able to control his lower soul when it is present. Therefore, let the novice work to cut off the temptations

of the lower soul to (commit) sins, for if not he will fall into them. This is because when ideas grew strong they become temptations, and whenever temptations grow many, they become paths for the enemy (the Devil) by making (sin) seem fair and by seducing (him). And the most harmful thing to the penitent is for him to allow an evil idea to take root in his heart and to hearken to it, for it will pervade him and destroy him. Every cause which calls him toward disobedience or reminds him of disobedience is also disobedience itself, and every cause which ends in sin and leads towards it is also sin itself, even though it is permissible (mubāh). To cut (it) off is an act of obedience. This is one of the finer points of good deeds among the novices.

It has been said:

Whoever has attained forty years which is a lifetime, and has remained in sin, will scarcely repent of it, except for a few of those who realise the truth.

It has been related in the tradition:

The believer is every person who has committed many various (sins) and has repented: for the believer has a sin to which he is habituated, time after time.⁸

In the tradition (it is said):

All of the children of Adam are habitual sinners, and the best from amongst those who are habitual sinners are those who seek forgiveness.⁹

and in another version:

The believer is weak and a patcher. The best among them is he who dies in his patching.¹⁰

which means "weak with regard to (committing) sin and patching it by repentance and seeking forgiveness".

Allāh Most Exalted has described the believers as (those who) abandon the following of sins, and who follow evil with good, in His saying:

And turn off evils with good. (13:22)

and Allāh the Most Exalted describes those who make efforts (‘āmilīn) (and) who are patient, saying:

Twice will they be given Their reward,
for that they Have persevered, that
they avert Evil with good. (28:54)

The Most Exalted granted them two (types of) patience, patience to abstain from sin and patience in repentance, and thus He will confer two rewards upon them for it.

Allāh Most Exalted stipulated for the penitents from among the believers three conditions. He stipulated for the penitents from among the hypocrites four (conditions), for the latter have adduced the excuse of createdness for their deeds, and have thus made them co-partners (ashraku) with the Creator in ikhhlās¹¹. Allāh has therefore imposed out of severity an

additional stipulation upon them because of the enormity of what they have perpetrated ¹²; while others have adduced the excuse of His attribute, ¹³ and so He has lightened (their burden) by two conditions.(p.384) Thus He, may He be praised and glorified, said:

Except those who repent And make
amends And openly declare the truth.
(2:160)

The saying of the Most Exalted "those who repent" means that they returned to the truth from their passions. "Those who make amends" means that they amended what they had corrupted in their lower souls. As for "they openly declare the truth", there are two ways of taking this. The first is that they declared the truth which they had concealed and the true knowledge which they had hidden; this refers to those who disobeyed by concealing knowledge and confusing truth with falsehood. It has also been said that they declared their repentance until it was obvious in them, so that the ordinances of repentance become visible upon them. (Allāh) said in the other condition:

The Hypocrite will be In the lowest
depth Of the fire; no helper Wilt thou
find for them. Except for those who
repent, Mend (their life), hold fast
To Allāh, and purify their religion As
in Allāh's sight. (4:145-146)

This is because they used to hold fast to

people and to property and they dissembled in their deeds. For that reason He made it incumbent upon them that they should hold fast to Allāh and sincere belief in Him, may He be praised and glorified.

It is fitting that the repentance of every servant should be the opposite of his disobedience to a lesser or greater degree¹⁴ and that the penitent should be the opposite of what is most corrupt, so that he will become as Allāh Most Exalted says:

Never Shall We suffer the reward Of
the righteous to perish. (7:170)

The servant will not become a penitent until he becomes righteous and he will never become righteous until he practises righteous acts. Then he will be included among those who are righteous. Allāh Most Exalted has said:

And He will choose And befriend the
righteous. (7:196)

This is a description of the penitent, and he is the one who has achieved true repentance and is the beloved of Allāh Most Exalted, as He has said:

For Allāh loves those Who turn to Him
constantly. (2:222)

which means that He chooses those who turn to him from

their passions (and) purify themselves for Him from hateful deeds, as the messenger of Allāh (P.B.U.H) said: "The penitent is the beloved of Allāh".

Abū Muḥammad Sahl was asked, "when will the servant who repents become the beloved of Allāh Most Exalted?". He replied:

When he becomes as Allāh Most Exalted has said: "Those that turn (to Allāh) In repentance; that serve Him, (And praise Him; that wander In devotion to the Cause of Allāh, That bow down and prostrate themselves In prayer; that enjoin good And forbid evil and observe The limit set by Allāh (These do rejoice). So proclaim The glad tidings to the Believers) (9:112)".

Then he said:

The beloved will not enter into something which the lover does not like.

Then he said:

One's repentance is not valid until one repents of righteous acts.

Another of the gnostics said:

The generality turn repentantly from their evil acts, but the Ṣūfīs turn repentantly from their righteous acts.

which means from their falling short of fulfilling them, on account of the magnitude of (the bounty) which they see as forthcoming from the Almighty King, may He be praised and glorified, or from their view of themselves

in (performing) them. This is the gift of Allāh Most Exalted which reaches them.

Sahl used to say:

Repentance is one of the best works, because (good) works will not be considered valid without it. Repentance will not valid except by abandoning much which is lawful, for fear that it will bring them to other things. The seeking of forgiveness is the nourishment of the penitents, and the asylum for those who are sinful.

Allāh Most Exalted, who is the most true of those who speak, has said:

Ask Forgiveness of your Lord, And turn to Him (in repentance). (11:52)

and the Most Exalted has (also) said:

Why turn they not to Allāh And seek His forgiveness? (5:74)

Thus, begin repentance by seeking forgiveness and follow the seeking of forgiveness with repentance. The seeking of forgiveness associated with (committing) sin is asking for the concealment (of sin) from Allāh Most Exalted. The forgiveness of Allāh Most Exalted towards (p.385) His servant when he is in a state of sin is concealment (of sin) and forbearance toward him. It is said:

There is no sin which is concealed by Allāh Most Exalted for His servant in this world but for which He will not

forgive him in the Hereafter", for Allāh Most Exalted is too noble to reveal a sin which He has previously concealed. And there is no sin which has been revealed by Allāh Most Exalted in this world but that He will make that His servant's punishment in the Hereafter;

for Allāh is too noble to double His punishment for His servant.

The like of this has been related from 'Alī and Ibn 'Abbās, may Allāh be pleased with both of them. Both of them related it concerning the seeking of forgiveness after repentance. This is the servant's seeking his Master's exemption from censure, for the forgiveness by Allāh Most Exalted of His servant after repentance is His exemption of his bad deeds and His passing over them by His noble forgiveness. It is the substitution of evil deeds with good ones, as in the tradition which interprets the saying of the servant: "O You (who are) the Bountiful of Forgiveness" as meaning that He forgives evil deeds through His mercy, and substitutes for them good deeds through His generosity. Allāh Most Exalted has confirmed this in His saying:

So stand True to Him, and ask For His forgiveness. (41:6)

after His saying:

In the case of those Who say, "Our Lord Is Allāh" and, further, Stand

straight and steadfast, The angels
descend on them (From time to time)
"Fear ye not (they suggest) Nor
grieve. (41:30)

This means that they declared the tawhīd of Allāh Most Exalted, then they stood firm in the declaration of the oneness of Allāh and they never associated partners with Him. It has also been said that it means that they stood firm constantly in the Sunna and did not make innovations. It has also been said that it means that they stood firm in repentance and they never diverted from it. "Fear ye not" refers to the punishment of sins, for He has exempted you from them through tawhīd. "Nor grieve" refers to the good deeds which they omitted to perform; for Allāh has recompensed them for you through repentance and has caused you to attain the positions of those who are righteous through uprightness. Moreover, the Most Exalted has said:

But receive The Glad Tidings Of the
Garden (of Bliss) The which ye were
promised. (41:30)

i.e previously "We are your protectors" (41:31), namely We protect you and show you favour, "in the life of this world and in the Hereafter" (41:31) by making all of you firm in faith. "Therein shall ye have all that your souls shall desire" (41:31) that is, all your bodies (desire) of abiding bounty; "therein shall ye have all

that ye ask for" (41:31), that is, what you desire with your hearts in the way of looking upon the Most Merciful King.

In the tradition (it is said)

One who repents from sin is like one who has no sin and one who seeks for forgiveness for sin while he persists in it is like one who mocks the signs of Allāh Most Exalted.¹⁵

One of them used to say, "I seek Allāh's forgiveness for having said "I seek Allāh's forgiveness" with the tongue without repentance and regret in the heart".

In the tradition (it is said) "seeking forgiveness with the tongue without any repentance and regret in the heart is the repentance of those who are liars".

Rābi'a¹⁶ used to say:

This seeking of forgiveness on our part requires a seeking of forgiveness, for how many a repentance is there which requires repentance in order to make it valid, sincerity in contemplating it, and tranquillity in delivering it; and whoever follows bad deeds with good deeds and mixes righteous acts with bad acts, it may be desired that he will be saved and it may be hoped that he will find uprightness before he dies.

Allāh Most Exalted says:

They have mixed an act That was good
with another That was evil. Perhaps
Allāh Will turn unto them (in mercy).
(9:102).

This means He will turn (p.386) to them in sympathy and
look upon them. It has also been said that they mixed a
good work, that of acknowledgement of sins and renewed
repentance, with another which is evil, namely past
heedlessness and ignorance.

Ibn 'Abbās used to say:

(Allāh is) "Forgiving" to those who
repent and "Merciful" in that He is
indulgent to repentance.

Allāh Most Exalted has said:

(But without doubt) I am (Also) He
that forgives (Again and again) to
those Who repent. (20:82)

this means (those who repent) from associating (God with
others); "and believe" in oneness (of God) and "do
right" in fulfilling obligations and abstaining from
what is prohibited, "then receive true guidance" that
is, follow the Sunna. It has also been said (that this
means), "persist in repentance", for these are the
attributes of the believers. Allāh Most Exalted will not
send back those who are sincere to that to which He will
send back the hypocrites, that is to repentance, nor
likewise to that to which He will send back those who

make partners for God, since there is no way for all men except through it (repentance) and there is no means to reach (Allāh's) love and contentment except through it. Allāh Most Exalted, describing the hypocrites, has said:

There are (yet) others, Held in suspense for the command Of Allāh, whether He will Punish them, or turn in mercy To them. (9:106)

("He will punish them") means "for persistence in sin" and "or turn in mercy to them" means "(if they) seek forgiveness". He decreed that firmly and divided it in the way He stipulated, just as He said of the unbelievers:

But if they repent, And establish regular prayers And practise regular charity, Then open the way for them. (9:5)

Allāh Most Exalted linked the seeking of forgiveness in worship with the remaining of the Messenger (P.B.U.H) in the community, and He took away punishment through His presence as a grace and blessing from Himself. The Most Exalted has said:

But Allāh was not going To send them a Penalty Whilst thou was amongst them; Nor was He going to send it Whilst they could ask for pardon. (8:33)

One of the pious predecessors used to say:

There were two securities for us; one of them has gone and the other

remains. If the other were to go we would perish. This means that the one who has gone is the Messenger (P.B.U.H) and the one which remains is the seeking of forgiveness.

Sahl, may Allāh have mercy upon him, was asked about the seeking of forgiveness which can atone for sins. He replied:

The beginning of the seeking of forgiveness is to respond, then to turn (to Allāh), and then to repent. Responding (concerns) the actions of the limbs, turning to (God) involves the acts of the hearts and repentance is one's acceptance of one's Master and one's abandonment of His creatures. Then (the penitent) seeks forgiveness for the shortcomings in which he is involved, and for his ignorance of (Allāh's) bounty and for abandoning gratitude (for it); then He will forgive him and he will find his refuge with Him. After that he moves to solitude (al-infirād) then firmness (al-thabāt), then understanding (al-bayān), then proximity (al-qurb) then gnosis (al-ma'rifa), confidential conversation (al-munājāt), cordiality (al-muṣāfāt), intimate friendship (al-muwālāt), then the discussion of secrets (muḥādathat al-sirr), which is friendship. All of these will not be deep rooted in a servant's heart until knowledge becomes his nourishment, remembrance his sustenance, contentment his provision, total submission his aim and absolute reliance (upon Allāh) his companion. Then Allāh Most Exalted will look upon him and elevate him to the throne, whereupon his station will be that of those who bear the throne.

He (Sahl) used to say:

The servant cannot do without his Master in every state, and the best

state for him is to return to Him in every matter. Whenever he is disobedient he says: "O my Lord grant me repentance". Whenever he is free of disobedience he says, "O my Lord grant me Your forgiveness". Whenever he repents he says, "O my Lord grant me freedom from sin", and whenever he performs a (good deed) he says, "O my Lord accept this from me".

(p.387)

And among the best works which can follow sin after repentance and the untying of persistence (in wrongdoing), and from which atonement may be hoped, are eight actions; four from the acts of the limbs and four from the acts of the hearts.

The acts of the limbs are that the servant should pray with two prostrations, he should then seek forgiveness seventy times and should say "Praise be to Allāh the Great and in His honour" (subhān Allāh al-‘Azīm wa bi ḥamdih) a hundred times. Then he should give a supererogatory charity and fast for a day.

The acts of the hearts are that one should make a strong belief in repentance from it (sin), one should wish to depart from it, fear punishment for it and hope for forgiveness for it. After this one should seek the reward of Allāh Most Exalted by showing absolute, hopeful trust in God's kindness,¹⁷ and true certainty of the atonement of one's sin. These acts

have been mentioned in the tradition as being those which will atone for error and stumbling. It is stipulated in some of them that one should perform the ablution and perform it completely. One should then enter the mosque and pray with two prostrations. In some traditions (it is said) that one should pray with four prostrations. It is said that when the servant commits a sin, the angel of the right side who is his master, orders the angel of the left side to take away the pen (to record sin) from him for six hours. If he repents and seeks forgiveness, it will not be recorded against him, but if he does not it will be recorded. It is (also) said that night alms will atone for the sins of the day, and that secret alms will atone for the sins of the night.

In some of the traditions (it is said):

Whenever you commit a bad deed, follow it with a good one which will atone for it, the secret for the secret and the public for the public.¹⁸

In scattered traditions which we have brought together (it is said):

There is no day whose dawn rises and no night whose twilight disappears, but that two angels converse with one another with four voices. One of them says, "Would that these creatures had not been created", and the other says, "would that, when they were created, they had known why they were created".

Then another says, "Would that, when they knew why they were created, they had acted upon their knowledge" while in another version (the words are) "they had sat together and reminded one another of what they knew". Then the other says, "would that, whenever they did not act in accordance with their knowledge, they had repented of what they had done".¹⁹

The first thing which the servant must do for Allāh, may He be praised and glorified, is not to disobey Him in return for His bounties, so that his disobedience will not become ingratitude for His bounty. The parts of the servant's body and his property are amongst the bounties of Allāh Most Exalted to him, since the strength of man is (generated) from the parts of his body, the firmness of these is through movement, and the benefits of these are through good health (bestowed by Allāh). When one disobeys Him in return for His bounty, He will have turned it into blasphemy, as the Most Exalted says:

(Hast thou not turned The vision to those who Have) changed the favour of Allāh Into blasphemy. (14:28)

It has been said that (this means that) they have sought help from it (His bounty) in order to disobey Him. Then He has threatened them with severe punishment for this substitution, and He has said:

But if anyone, After Allāh's favour Has come to him, Substitutes

(something else), Allāh is strict in punishment. (2:211)

Sometimes the punishment for requiting His bounty with disobedience will be expedited in this world, and sometimes it will be postponed to the Hereafter. Sometimes the punishment will lie in worldly matters and sometimes it will lie in being deprived of matters of the Hereafter, because this is (the sinner's) place of return and abode, while sometimes it will be in both of them. Sometimes disobedience in return for bounty will itself be the punishment (p.388), or sometimes ignorance of the bounty, neglecting to be grateful for it, or belittling it, or reliance upon it, or haughtiness, arrogance, or acquisitiveness in it. All of these things are punishments.

Moreover, He makes it incumbent on the servant when he disobeys Him, to return to his Master. This is the repentance which succeeds his remaining associated with his lower soul, which is the agreement of passion with sin. If he postpones repentance and persists in sin, this constitutes two more sins added to the (original) sin. Whenever he repents of his sin and repents firmly of it he will embrace uprightness in obedience and prolonged need of Allāh Most Exalted for protection. Then he will repent forever of minor sins,

(turning to) concern (al-hamm) and hope (al-tamannī), (he will also repent) of fear and desire for created things, which are sins particular to the eye and the lower soul, and of acceptance of something or acquiescence in something, which are the sins of those who are brought nigh, until there remains no disobedience in the servant as far as he knows, and until his knowledge testifies to his faithfulness. After this there remain his sins coming from his acquaintance with the knowledge of Allāh Most Exalted concerning him, arising from His knowledge of his unseen deeds which He reserves to Himself, and which He will reveal to him, and from the meaning of submission (‘ubūdiyya) itself, and (the fact) that creation, with its attribute and its greatness, (comes about) through the empowerment of Lordship. This fear will become a reward for him, when he who knows himself seeks refuge in the sins of those who are brought nigh. These (sins) cannot be spoken and he does not know how to divulge them; they are the good deeds of the people of the right hand, since they are not witnessed by the common people, who are ignorant of the knowledge of their stations, so that the state of the one brought nigh (al-mutaqarrab) becomes one of apprehension of remoteness (from Allāh), at every moment and breath, until the time of meeting (with God), and of fear of (Allāh's) turning away and veiling (Himself) in every movement, as long as he is in this world, until

(he goes) to the eternal world.

There has been related to us, in a gharīb²⁰
tradition:

Allāh, may He be praised and glorified, revealed to Jacob (P.B.U.H), "Do you know why I have made a distinction between you and Joseph?". He replied, "No", and Allāh said, "It is because you said to his brothers:

I fear lest the wolf Should devour him. (12:13).

Why did you fear that the wolf (would devour) him but did not hope in Me on his behalf? And why did you see the heedlessness of his brothers but did not see My preserving of him? This is the meaning of the saying of Joseph to the water carrier:

Mention me to thy lord. (12:42)

Allāh Most Exalted has said:

But satan made him forget To mention him to his lord: And (Joseph) lingered in prison A few (more) years. (12:42)

This is one of the things for which people are specifically reproved, i.e. concealing their trust (in Allāh) and turning their sight away to others than Allāh Most Exalted. Some of the Successors were denied

that increase (of God's benefit), and did not find the sweetness of repentance, because they were indifferent to the state of (Allāh's) care, and because they were too easy-going in failing to pay proper attention to the evidence of (His) supervision (murāqaba). That is due to a lack of thoroughness in carrying out repentance, for if they were to properly perform repentance from a single sin, and thoroughly to establish the state of a penitence among those who are sincere in their repentance, they would not have been denied that increase by Allāh Most Exalted, because they would be righteous and in a state of renewal. Allāh Most Exalted has said:

And (We shall) increase (the portion of) Those who do good. (2:58)

Thus whenever see yourself upright in repentance, and performing good deeds, but you do not find yourself in possession of that increase of benefit in the way of finding sweetness, good nature, displays of asceticism or praiseworthy attributes, then you should return to the chapter of contemplation (murāqaba) or the position of care (ri'āya), and inspect them and perfect their stations, for it is through them that you will (advance).

(p.389)

One of the 'ulamā' said:

Whoever repents of ninety-nine sins, but does not repent of one (other) sin, he will not become, according to us, amongst the penitents. And do not ignore inspection and the reviving of repentance at the end of prayers, for loss enters upon workers (for salvation) in ways that they do not know, through their abandoning inspection and holding themselves to account, and through being too easy-going in what they do.

Know that the truth of each sin is ten acts, and that the servant will not become a penitent whom Allāh Most Exalted loves, and that his repentance will not become pure, which Allāh Most Exalted has stipulated and which prophethood has interpreted, unless the servant observes ten repentances for every sin: the first is to abandon returning to the act of sin; then one should repent of acknowledging it, then, one should repent from associating with the cause of the sin, then one should repent of performing its like, then one should repent of looking upon it, then one should repent of listening to those who talk about it, then one should repent of wilfulness, then one should repent of falling short in what is due to repentance, then one should repent of not having desired the face of Allāh sincerely with all that one has abandoned for His sake, then one should repent of looking upon repentance or of being complacent in it and relying upon it. Thereafter one should testify to one's shortcomings in performing that

which is due to the Lordship, because of the greatness of what one perceives by means of one's increased contemplation of the tawhīd of Allāh and of the great majesty and immense grandeur of Allāh Most Exalted. After that, one's repentance will be of one's shortcoming in contemplating Him truly. One's seeking of forgiveness will be for the fact that one's heart was too weak, and one's ambition too deficient, to contemplate Him, because of His high station and the prolonged increase and instruction which He confers. For there is no end to the repentance of the gnostic, nor to the extent of his description of that in which he is engaged, and there is no description which can recount the fine details of his being put to the test (balā'). No prophet, and no one beneath him, is too great for repentance. For every station there is a repentance, for every state of a station there is a repentance and for every contemplation and unveiling there is a repentance. This is the state of the penitent who turns repentantly (to Allāh), who is brought close to Allāh Most Exalted and held dear by Him. This, then, is the station of one who has committed many various (sins) and has repented, that is, one who has experienced things, has been tested by them and has repented of them to Allāh Most Exalted, in order that he may behold his Master, either beholding Him or it (repentance) through his heart or busying himself with his attention to Him or to it (repentance)

or trusting in Him or in it (repentance) because of their (sins) existence or seeking Him in flight from them (sins) or seeking it (repentance).²¹ For there is a sin for him in every contemplation of everything other than Him,²² and there is a reproach for him in every reliance upon anything other than Him, just as there is knowledge in every contemplation, and a verdict in every manifestation in the universe. His sins are innumerable, and his repentances to Allāh Most Exalted are unlimited. This is the true nature of the repentance which is pure (al-tawba al-naṣūh). He who performs it has surrendered his face to Allāh Most Exalted, he has acted well in soul and found tranquillity, his faith is upright in the eyes of Allāh Most Exalted, and his station and state in relation to Allāh Most Exalted are safe, for the Messenger of Allāh (P.B.U.H) has said, "For Allāh loves every one who has committed many various sins and has repented".

Know that sins are of seven categories, some of them greater than others, each category of them having degrees (p.390) and every degree of sinners having levels; among them are sins with which the servant occupies himself which are (properly) aspects of the attributes of Divinity, such as pride, glorifying, insolence, and love of praise and eulogy, and the

attribute of might and wealth; these are sins which lead to perdition (muhlikāt).

There are also, among the common people, (sins of) various degrees, and sins which are aspects of the innate character of devils, such as envy, injustice, cunning, deceit, and commanding others to (perform) corrupt deeds. These are sins which lead to perdition (mūbiqat).

There are also, among the people of this world, (sins) of various degrees, and sins which are in opposition to the Sunna. This is what is against it (the Sunna) and leads to innovation and new and heretical things and these are major sins; among them are that which drives away the faith and engenders hypocrisy.

There are six major heresies which drive (those who embrace them) out of the community.²³ These are the Qadariyya, the Murji'ah, the Rāfidiyya, the Ibādiyya, the Jahmiyya and amongst those who leads others into error those who utter ejaculated sayings (al-shātiḥūn)²⁴; these are people who do not acknowledge morality, customs or authority, by transgressing limitations and going beyond knowledge, and they are the unbelievers (zanādiqa) of this community.

And there are sins which are related to mankind, by way of committing wrongs against their religion and leading them astray from the way of the believers; this is that with which (the sinner) causes (the believer) to go astray from guidance, diverts him from customary practice, deflects him from the Book, and leads him by false interpretation away from the Sunna; then he proclaims that publicly and calls men to it. They accept it from him and follow him in it.

One of the 'ulamā' said:

There is no repentance for these sins, just as some of them have said of the murderer that there is no repentance for him; (this is) in order to cause men to know that God's threat (wa'id) is immutable and His truth is fully uttered.

The fifth category of disobediences is that which is related to wrongs committed by servants in worldly affairs, such as striking people, abusing their honour and seizing their property, lying and slandering. These are sins which lead to perdition (mūbiqāt) and they must (entail) the agreed punishment (qisās), (received) before a just judge who delivers a decisive judgment, unless it (the sin) should be proclaimed lawful or unless the culprit asks the victims to seek the forgiveness of Allāh, may He be praised and glorified, in the world to come through His grace, so

that He will recompense those wronged with His generosity.

In the tradition (it has been said):

Law-courts are of three (types): A court which forgives, a court which does not forgive and a court which does not neglect. As for the court which forgives, the servant's sins are between him and Allāh Most Exalted. As for the court which does not forgive, this is associating (something) with Allāh Most Exalted (shirk). As for the court which does not neglect, it (deals with) wrongdoings against the servants.²⁵

This means that it does not neglect to demand restitution and to exact punishment.

The sixth type of sin is that which is between the servant and his Master, from himself to himself, which is related to the passions and to following habitual custom; these are the lightest sins, and the nearest to forgiveness.

(p.391)

These sins are of two types: Major sins (kabā'ir) and minor sins (ṣaghā'ir). As for the major sins, they are those for which the wa'id has been prescribed and for which the hudūd sentence is compulsory. As for the minor sins, they are below this in regard and seriousness. Pure repentance applies to

all of them by taking the general application of the saying of the Most Exalted:

He turned to you And forgave you.
(2:187)

and His information, may He be praised and glorified, about His judgment when He said:

Then He turned to them That they might repent. (9:118)

and the external meaning of the Most Exalted's saying:

Those who persecute (or draw into temptation) The believers, man and woman, And do not turn In repentance.
(85:10)

and similarly:

But verily thy Lord,- To those who leave their home After trials and persecutions,..... Thy Lord, after all this Is Oft-Forgiving, Most Merciful. (16:110)

(fatanū)²⁶ is the way of reading used by the people of Syria, pronouncing the fā' and the tā' with fatha, since the purpose of repentance, when it takes place, is forgiveness of sin and escape from the Fire. We are not of the opinion that the wa'īd applies eternally to those who commit major sins, but we regard them as being subject to the will of Allāh and we tolerate that which Allāh Most Exalted tolerates from

them amongst the inhabitants of Paradise, as is related in the tradition concerning the interpretation of the Most Exalted's saying:

his recompense Is Hell, to abide therein (For ever). (4:93)

that is, if He wills to punish them.

As it was related to us from the Messenger (P.B.U.H):

Whoever has been promised a reward by Allāh Most Exalted for a good work, He will grant it to him, and whoever has been promised punishment for a work, He will reserve the option; if He wills He will punish him, and if He wills He will forgive him.

As Ibn 'Abbās, may Allāh be pleased with him, said:

He forgiveth whom He pleaseth" (This refers to) the great sin, and "He punisheth whom He pleaseth" (refers to) the minor sin. Allāh Most Exalted says:

Allāh forgiveth not That partners should be set up With Him, but He forgiveth Anything else, to whom He pleaseth. (4:48)

There is no sin which is not forgiven except associating partners (with Allāh),²⁷ and Allāh has left Muslims subject to His will as regards other sins. Scholars may argue (against this) basing themselves on

the tradition which was related directly (from the Prophet-ma'thūr) concerning (Allāh's) refusal to accept the repentance of the heretic,

Allāh Most Exalted refuses to (accept) the repentance of every person who commits heresy.

but this is directed specifically to those who do not repent among those upon whom He has pronounced the verdict of being overtaken by His misfortune.

Do you not see that he never said that Allāh Most Exalted refuses to accept repentance from whomsoever repents? In fact, he has informed us of the decree of Allāh Most Exalted against those who do not repent, in that Allāh Most Exalted has withheld repentance from them. Thus we are also of the opinion (in the case of) the killer for whom an evil end has been pre-ordained in that he will die without (acknowledging) tawhīd, and likewise (in the case of) the innovator, if his name has been listed amongst the inhabitants of the Fire, that killing and innovation are the signs of that. The reason is that both of them are forbidden repentance, for it (repentance) is barred to both of them.

The same applies to whomsoever deserves the word of punishment by having been pre-ordained to an evil end, for even if he were to repent with seventy repentances, this would not deliver him from the Fire. His repentance would be no more than the saying of (the Prophet) (P.B.U.H):

The servant may practise the works of the inhabitants of Paradise for seventy years so that people say that he is one of its people, and that there is no greater gap between him and it than a span, and then he will be overtaken by misfortune.

or in another version,

then he will find that the book (which will show that he has) practised the deeds of the inhabitants of the fire has already been written, and he will enter into it".

(p.392)

Repentance will have been included in his good and virtuous deeds, then they will be brought to nothing, among all his good deeds, by the fact that the book decreeing his misfortune has already been written.

As for those for whom an evil end has not been pre-ordained and to whom Allāh has granted pure repentance (al-tawba al-naṣūh), and who will not be overtaken by misfortune, repentance will not be withheld from them. Allāh Most Exalted will forgive them through the repentance which He has granted them, as the Most Exalted has said about the hypocrites:

Whether He will Punish them, or turn
in mercy To them. (9:106)

Hypocrisy is not less than heresy, not all hypocrites have had their repentance accepted by Allāh, and He has not caused all of them to end in it. The general statement is found in the words of the Most Exalted:

But He turned to you And forgave you.
(2:187)

which is addressed to whomsoever does repent, while the tradition is specifically directed to whomsoever does not repent, for which one should refer to the saying of the Most Exalted:

Then He turned to them, That they
might repent. (9:118)

and the other saying of the Most Exalted:

Perhaps Allāh Will turn unto them (in
mercy): For Allāh is Oft-Forgiving
Most Merciful. (9:102)

Moreover, with regard to repentance people are in four categories; in every category there is a group and for every group there is a station. Among them is he who repents of the sin, who is strictly upright in repentance and in returning (to God), and whose lower soul never tempts him to return to disobedience

throughout the days of life, but who works to substitute good works for his bad deeds. It is he who is pre-ordained to goodness. This is pure repentance (al-tawba al-naṣūh), and the soul of this man is peaceful and content (al-muṭma'inna al-mardiyya). The tradition which was narrated concerning such a man is:

Go, you have been preceded by those who have detached themselves, who are passionately fond of remembering Allāh and whose burdens remembrance has cast down, so that they approach the doomsday unladen.²⁸

The one who comes after this man in nearness (to Allāh) is a servant whose compact is repentance and whose intention is constant uprightness. He will never perform sin nor will he intend it, nor will direct himself to it or concern himself with it. He may be tempted by the entering of sins into him without any intention on his part, and he may be tested by trouble and small faults (al-hamm wa 'l-lumam), for this is (among) the attributes of a believer for whom uprightness is to be hoped, because he is in its path, and he is one of those of whom Allāh Most Exalted says:

Those who avoid Great sin and shameful deeds, Only (falling into) small faults, Verily thy Lord is ample In forgiveness. (53:32)

and he is included in the description of those who fear God, of whom Allāh Most Exalted has said:

And those who, Having done something
To be ashamed of, Or wronged their own
souls Earnestly bring Allāh to mind,
And ask for forgiveness For their
sins- And who can forgive Sins except
Allāh? And are never obstinate In
persisting knowingly In (the wrong)
they have done. (3:135)

The soul of such a person is the self-reproaching spirit
(al-lawwāma) by which Allāh Most Exalted has sworn. Such
a person is from amongst those who observe due
proportion; for these sins enter upon men's souls by way
of their attributes, the nature of their instincts, the
beginning of their lineage from the growth of the earth,
from the compounding of their various forms in the womb,
generation after generation, and from the intermixing of
the mingled sperms, some with others. It is for this
reason that Allāh Most Exalted followed this with His
words:

He knows You well when He brings You
out of the earth, And when ye are
hidden In your mother's womb,
(Therefore justify not yourselves. He
know best who it is That guards
against evil) (53:32)

and for this reason He prohibited men from justifying
the soul which is grown from the earth and which is
compounded in the womb by mingled sperm for crookedness.
The Most Exalted says: "Therefore justify not
yourselves" (meaning) that this is their description of

the beginning of their growth. In the same way He has described the mingled sperm of His creation as being tried (with temptation) when He says:

Verily, We created Man from a drop Of
mingled sperm, In order to try him; So
We gave him (the gifts) Of Hearing and
Sight. (76:2)

The explanation of this would take a long time and would enter into the science (p.393) of the compounding of souls and the shaping of their nature. We have mentioned its fundamentals in some of the chapters of this book.²⁹ On the subject of such a servant is the meaning of the tradition which says:

The believer is a person who has committed many various (sins) and he has repented, and the believer is like an ear of wheat, which sometimes gives a good return and sometimes does not.³⁰

Therefore, the servant should despise his lower soul, should hate it on account of his knowledge of it, should abandon looking upon it, and should be content with good if it should appear in it, since these are the ways toward the atonement of his sins, for this comes from pondering upon the exhortation which is in the saying of the Most Exalted:

Therefore, justify not yourselves, He knows best who it is That guards against evil. (53:32)

The third servant is he who is very close to the second in state (hāl). (He is) a servant who commits a sin, then repents, then returns to the sin, then he grieves because of it, in that he has sought it out, striven to perform it, and preferred it to obedience; but he procrastinates in his repentance, urges himself to act uprightly, loves the positions of the penitents, and his heart is pleased with the stations of those who are sincere; but his moment does not come near and his station does not come to light, because lust is still motivating him, habit is still attracting him and heedlessness is still overwhelming him, except that he turns repentantly throughout the sins, but returns to his preceding customary act. Thus the repentance of such a man is lost from time to time, and it is to be wished for such a man that he will find uprightness in his good deeds and atone ³¹ by them for his previous misdeeds.

It is to be feared that he may revert to persistence in his wrongdoing, for the soul of such a man is misled by the Devil (musawwila). He is one of those who combine a righteous deed with another evil deed. Perhaps Allāh will grant him forgiveness, so that he will stand firm in uprightness and he will join those who came earlier. Such a man is between two states, between being overcome by the attributes of the lower soul, in which case that of which we have spoken above

(pre-ordained misfortune) will be his due, and between (the possibility) that his Lord will look upon him with a look which will mend everything broken, will enrich every poverty for him, will overtake him with a previous grace and cause him to reach the positions of those who are brought nigh, because he has trodden their path, through His nobility and His mercy, so that his end will be the Hereafter.

The fourth servant is the worst servant with regard to state, the greatest of them in mischief to his lower soul, and the least in receiving gifts from Allāh. (He is) a servant who commits a sin and then follows it with a similar sin, or one greater than it. He remains in it persistently, entertaining the thought of it whenever he has power to do so, never intending to repent, never expressing firm belief in constant uprightness, never hoping for Allāh's promise of His good opinion and never fearing His threat in order to obtain His security (after this life), for this is the real persistence (in sin) and a station between conceit and arrogance. Concerning the like of this man there is a tradition:

Those who persist (in sin) have perished, from time immemorial, in the Fire.

The soul of such a man is commanding to evil (al-ammāra), his spirit flees eternally from goodness, and it is to be feared for the like of such a man that he will have an unfavourable ending, because he is in its beginning and he is treading its path, and a bad fate and the attainment of misery are not far from him. Of such a man it has been said:

Whoever procrastinates repentance to Allāh, Allāh will expose him as a liar.

Indeed, the curse lies in proceeding from one sin to another greater than it. This group is found in the generality of Muslims and being amongst those who commit major sins , they are subject to (p.394) Allāh's will, as the Most Exalted has said:

There are (yet) others, Held in suspense for the command Of Allāh.
(9:106)

which means those who are delayed for His sentence, when He will either punish them "or He will turn them in mercy" with (His) previous pre-ordained favourable choice. We take refuge in Allāh Most Exalted against His punishment, and we seek His bounty in His reward. This is the end of the Book of Repentance.

NOTES.

1. This tradition is not in the six canonical ḥadīth collections.
2. 'Ā'isha bint Abī Bakr, the third wife of the Prophet (P.B.U.H), was born at Mecca about 8 years before the Hijra/ 614 A.D. She was generally known by her kunya, Umm 'Abd Allāh. She was noted for her beauty and piety. It is reported that she narrated 1210 traditions of the Prophet (P.B.U.H). She died in 58/678. See W.M.Watt, "'Ā'isha bint Abī Bakr", E.I², 1, pp.307-308; Kubrā, 2, pp.374-378.
3. According to al-'Irāqī, this version of the tradition is not authentic. There is, however, another tradition which is quite similar to this tradition, "idhā kathurat dhunūb al-'abd wa lam takun lahu a'māl tukaffiruhā ibtilāhu Allāh bi 'l-ḥuzn al-'iyāl li yukaffiruhā. See the criticism made by al-'Irāqī in the footnote of al-Ghazālī's Ihyā', 2, p.41.
4. This tradition is unauthentic traditon but it becomes the authentic basis for the Ṣūfīs to claim that the struggle against the lower soul is superior to physical war.
5. The prophet Khidr is one of the prophets in Islam. He is a popular figure and plays a prominent part in legend and Jewish and Muslim stories. For information about Khidr, see A.J. Wensinck, "Al-Khaḍīr", E.I², 4, pp.902-904; See also al-Qur'ān, 18:59-81.
6. This tradition is unauthentic tradition. It is, according to al-Subkī in his Ṭabaqāt al-Shāfi'iyya, the saying of 'Umar b. 'Abd al-Azīz who says: "The best faith is something which you force upon the lower soul against its wish". See Shāfi'iyya, 6, p. 358.
7. His full name is 'Ammār b. Yāsir b. Mālik, Abu 'l-Yaqzān, a companion of the Prophet. He was among the early converts to Islam and suffered severe tortures. He was also among those who migrated to Abyssinia in avoiding severe torture but, eventually returned to Medina after the Hijra. He was noted for his excellent knowledge of the tradition of the Prophet. He died in the battle of Ṣiffīn in which he was the partisan of 'Alī. See H.Reckendorf, "'Ammār b. Yāsir", E.I², 1, p.448; Iṣāba, 2, p.512.

8. This tradition is unauthentic tradition, perhaps al-Makkī narrated it with his own word base on another tradition which is as follows "Lā budda li 'l-mu'min min dhanb ya'tīhi al-fayna ba'da 'l-fayna". See the criticism given by al-'Irāqī in footnote of the Ihyā', 4, p.56.
9. This tradition is in one of the six canonical ḥadīth collections. See Ibn Mājah, Sunan Ibn Mājah, "Zuhd", no.4251, 2, p.1420.
10. This tradition is not authentic.
11. Asserting oneself to be clear of believing in any beside God. See Lane, Arabic-English lexicon, pp.785-786.
12. Lit: because of the severity of their entrance into hatred.
13. The meaning of the term waṣfihi in this context is not very clear. Possibly the text is corrupt.
14. Lit: Little by little or much by much.
15. This tradition is not authentic.
16. Rābi'a al-'Adawiyya or al-Qaysiyya al-Baṣriyya was born probably about 95-99/715-717 in Baṣra. It is reported that her father was also a Ṣūfī in Baṣra and died when Rābi'a was very young. She was noted for her celibate life which she claimed she surrendered totally to God. She was counted as being among the outstanding Ṣūfīs during her time. Many Ṣūfī masters, including Ḥasan al-Baṣrī and 'Abd al-Wāḥid b. Wāḥid, proposed to her, but she refused. She propagated the idea of "love of God". She died nearly 90 years old in 185/801. See M.Smith, Rābi'a the mystic, Cambridge, 1914.
17. Husn al-zann. For a definition of this term, cf. A.M.Schimmel, Mystical dimensions of Islam, p.118.
18. This tradition is not authentic. According to al-Subkī, this tradition is perhaps copied from one narrated by Abū Hurayra: Wa mā 'amilta min sū' fa aḥdatha lillāh tawbatan, al-sirr bi 'l-sirr, wa 'l-'alāniyyat bi 'l-'alāniyyat. See Shāfi'iyya, 6.p. 357.
19. This tradition is not authentic. See Shāfi'iyya, 6, pp. 357-358.

20. **Gharīb** in the science of ḥadīth means a tradition which was narrated by one companion or from one man only. It may apply to the isnād (the chain of the tradition) or the matn (the text). See J. Robson, "Ḥadīth", E.I², 3, p. 25.

21. This translation is extremely tentative and problematic. The text is very unclear and may well be corrupt. Liberties have been taken in order to make some sense at least of the passage and the pronoun suffix hā has been interpreted sometimes to refer to dhunūb and sometimes to tawba.

22. Reading li siwāhu instead of li sawā'.

23. For a description of these well-known groups, cf. Abū Maṣṣūr 'Abd al-Qāhir Ibn Ṭāhir al-Baghdādī, Al-Farq bayna 'l-Firaq, Tr. Kate Chambers Seelye, Muslim Schisms and sects, New York, 1966; Muḥammad b. 'Abd al-Karīm al-Shahrastānī, Kitāb al-Milal wa 'l-Nihal, Tr. A.K. Kazi and J.G. Flynn, Muslim sects and divisions, London, 1984; Abū Muḥammad al-Ḥasan b. Mūsā al-Nawbakhtī, Kitāb Firaq al-Shī'a, ed. H. Ritter, Istanbul, 1931; Formative period, Edinburgh, 1976.

24. The **Shātiḥūn** are those in a state of ecstasy who utter ejaculated sayings which go against the **Sharī'a**. See Luma', pp. 453-458.

25. This tradition is not authentic.

26. This is the reading of Ibn 'Āmir who is one of the Imams of the seven **qirā'āt** (the arts of reading the Qur'an). See Fakhr al-Dīn al-Rāzī, Mafātiḥ al-Ghayb, 5, p. 357.

27. The text is possibly corrupt.

28. According to al-'Irāqī, this tradition is authentic. See the footnote of Iḥyā', 4, p. 55.

29. See for instance Chapter 25, pp. 174-181.

30. This tradition is not authentic. See the criticism made by al-'Irāqī in the Iḥyā', 4, p. 56.

31. Reading **takfīr** instead of **tafkīr**.

CHAPTER FOUR

THE ORIGINALITY OF AL-MAKKĪ'S WORK.

Since al-Makkī's chapter of repentance is not clearly sub-divided and its arrangement is therefore rather chaotic, a rough schema of its contents is given below.

4.0 THE PLAN OF AL-MAKKĪ'S CHAPTER OF REPENTANCE.

4.0.1 DEFINITION OF TAWBA.

- a.Explanation of the Quranic verse, chapter 4:31.
- b.Explanation of the Quranic verse, chapter 66:8.
 - (i). The derivation of the word naṣūha.
 - (ii).The relation between the word naṣūha and tawba.
- c.The definition of tawba which was given by Ḥasan al-Baṣrī.

4.0.2 THE OBLIGATION OF REPENTANCE.

- a.The quotation of Sahl al-Tustarī: (Repentance)' is regretfulness in the heart, seeking forgiveness with the tongue, abandoning sin with parts of the body and making the intention not to return to it (sin).
- b.The position of those who abandon repentance; the quotation of 'Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib:"Abandoning repentance is a stage of blindness..."
- c.The quotation of Sahl al-Tustarī: "There is nothing more obligatory on this people than the act of repentance".

4.0.3 THE DEFINITION OF ISTIQAAMA.

- a. The truth of istiqaama.
- b. Compensating for previous dilatoriness.
 - (i) The importance of age.
 - (ii) The importance of a righteous deed which can obliterate a bad deed.
- c. The importance of regret: The quotation of Abū Sulaymān al-Dārānī.

4.0.4 RECOMMENDED ACTIONS WHICH ARE RELATED TO TAWBA.

- a. Not to disobey God.
- b. Not to indulge in sin.
- c. Not to persist in sin.
- d. To express firm belief in commitment to obedience until death.
- e. Fear of punishment.
- f. Hope of forgiveness.
- g. Acknowledging sin which has been committed.
- h. To express firm belief that Allāh Most Exalted pre-ordained those things for him.
- i. To proceed constantly with righteous deeds.

4.0.5 THE STORY OF THE ANGEL OF DEATH.

- a. The truth of repentance.
- b. The interpretation of the Quranic verses;
 - (i) Chapter 34:45.
 - (ii) Chapter 34:54.
 - (iii) Chapter 63:10.
 - (iv) Chapter 4:18.

4.0.6 THE ACCOUNT OF TWO TRUSTS WHICH ARE BESTOWED BY GOD.

- a. The importance of age.

- b. The importance of amāna.
- c. The importance of the "forgiveness of Allāh".
- d. The interpretation of the Quranic verses;
 - (i) Chapter 2:40.
 - (ii) Chapter 8:58.

4.0.7 THE VALIDITY OF REPENTANCE.

- a. An explanation of valid repentance.
- b. The signs of valid repentance:
 - (i) The bitterness of self-mortification becomes sweet for one who repents.
 - (ii) Allāh does not accept one's repentance because the sweetness of sin remains in one's heart.
- c. The definition of repentance.
 - (i) The quotation of Sahl al-Tustarī: "That is the transformation of blameworthy behaviour to praiseworthy behaviour...".
 - (ii) Al-Makkī's definition of tawba.

4.0.8 THE CONDITIONS (SHURŪT) OF REPENTANCE.

- a. The quotation of Sarī al-Saqatī.
 - (i) Neglecting disobedience.
 - (ii) Avoiding the company of disobedient people.
 - (iii) Not to return to sin.
- b. The quotation of Yaḥyā b. Mu'ādh al-Rāzī:
 - "For all of his life he is between two days; the day which is past and the day which remains.."
 - (i) The importance of regret.
 - (ii) The importance of seeking forgiveness.
 - (iii) The importance of attending the congregation of penitence.

4.0.9 THE REASONS WHY A MINOR SIN BECOMES A MAJOR SIN.

- a. Belittling a small sin.

- b. Forgetting sin: two views;
- (i) Forgetting is better.
 - (ii) Remembering sin is better.
- Al-Makkī says: These are two paths for those who are in different maqāms.
- (iii) The difference between maqām shahāda al-tawhīd and maqām shahāda al-ta'rif.
 - (iv) The story of the prophet David. Those who are weak cannot remember sin.
 - (v) Novices are not allowed to remember the bounty of Paradise.
 - (vi) Two servants who repent, one of whom undergoes self-mortification, and another one repents easily.
- The view of Aḥmad b. Abī al-Ḥawārī.
 -The view of the 'ulamā' of Baṣra.
- (vii) Two servants who were asked to sacrifice property; one of them undergoes self-mortification before sacrificing, another one sacrifices easily.
 - (viii) The position of the penitent who still feels the sweetness of sin.

c. Disdaining sin.

d. Displaying one's sin, Allāh's concealing one's sin.

e. Causing someone to commit sin.

f. Helping someone to commit sin.

g. Wronging someone whom he does not know.

h. One's sin which becomes a custom and is practised by other people.

i. Seeking to legalise disobedience or making it lawful to others.

4.0.10 THE IMPORTANCE OF TAWBA.

- a. Quoting the tradition which is about someone who commits homosexual acts. He will not be forgiven, even if he performs ablution with the water of the ocean except by repentance.
- b. One who commits acts of disobedience will not feel the sweetness of tawba.

- c. The prophet John (Yaḥyā) is called "chief" (sayyid) because he is not interested in disobedience.
- d. The story of the prophet Adam who ate the fruit of the forbidden tree.
- e. The story of the prophet Solomon who was punished because of his fault.

4.0.11. THE SERVANT WILL BE DEPRIVED OF BOUNTY BECAUSE HE COMMITS SIN.

- a. The bounty which comes through unlawful means contains little guidance from God.
- b. The implication of the curse of Allāh, which sometimes will make one indulge in sin and become remote from guidance.
- c. Forgetting to memorise the Qur'an after remembering it by heart is amongst the gravest sins.

4.0.12. THE PUNISHMENT OF SIN.

- a. The story of the Ṣūfī who looked at a Christian lad.
- b. The quotation which is about someone who knows the punishment of his sin even from the misshapen form of his donkey.
- c. The story of Maṣṣūr al-Faqīh who saw a boy.
- d. The quotation of Abū Sulaymān al-Dārānī: "Ihtilām is a punishment".

4.0.13. THE DANGER OF SIN

- a. It will darken one's heart.
- b. The quotation of Ḥasan al-Baṣrī about the barrier between man and God.
- c. The quotation of Ibn 'Umar.
- d. The quotation of Mujāhid.

e. Every sin will engender a stain on the heart.

f. The story of Abū 'Amr b. 'Ulwān.

**4.0.14. THE PUNISHMENT OF ONE'S SIN WILL
BE EXACTED IN THIS WORLD.**

a. Sorrow is punishment.

b. The clemency of Allāh will not nullify punishment but will merely postpone it.

**4.0.15. HOW TO COMPENSATE FOR PREVIOUS
SINS.**

a. Feeling distress at earning one's living.

b. The sin which is not forgiven is love for this world.

c. The importance of sorrow.

d. The story of the prophet Jacob who sorrowed at the loss of the prophet Joseph.

e. Allāh's anger against disobedient people.

**4.0.16. HOW TO CUT OFF THE DESIRE OF THE
LOWER SOUL AND THE VIRTUES OF SUCH
A PROCEDURE.**

a. Patience.

b. Self-mortification.

c. The importance of patience.

d. The story of a man who married a woman and asked his servant to fetch her to him.

e. The story of the prophet Moses who asks Khiḍr through what means Allāh reveals hidden knowledge.

f. The story of a reputable man who walks in mud.

**4.0.17. THE DANGER OF DILATORINESS
(GHAFLA).**

- a. The quotation of ‘Alī: Ghafla is the station of unbelief (al-kufr).
- b. The importance of regret and sorrow.
- c. The importance of self-mortification.
- d. The importance of tawba.

4.0.18. THE ATONEMENT OF SIN.

- a. Sin can be atoned through repentance.
- b. Seeking forgiveness (istighfār).
- c. Following a bad deed with a good one.
- d. Allāh will grant one two kinds of patience:
 - (i) Patience in not committing sin.
 - (ii) Patience in performing repentance.
- e. The condition of repentance for one who is a believer.
- f. The conditions of repentance for one who is a hypocrite.

**4.0.19. THOSE THINGS WHICH REQUIRE
REPENTANCE.**

- a. Acts of disobedience.
- b. When one is regarded as the beloved of Allāh.
- c. The significance of tawba.

**4.0.20. THE IMPORTANCE OF SEEKING
FORGIVENESS.**

- a. One who seeks forgiveness while he persists in sin is one who mocks the signs of Allāh.
- b. The quotation of Rābi‘a.
- c. The tradition about two trusts which are left to the Muslims:

- (i) The prophet Muḥammad (P.B.U.H) who has gone.
- (ii) Seeking forgiveness which remains.

d. The seeking of forgiveness which can atone for sin. The quotation of Sahl.

4.0.21. THE WAY TO UNTIE PERSISTENCE IN SIN.

- a. Four of the actions of the limbs.
- b. Four of the actions of the heart.
- c. The tradition which is about two angels conversing with each other.

4.0.22. WHAT SHOULD A SERVANT DO IN REPENTANCE.

- a. Not disobeying God through His bounty.
- b. The punishment of replacing bounty with disobedience will be exacted in this world.
- c. Turning to God.
- d. The story of the prophet Jacob who has been separated from his son, the Prophet Joseph.
- e. Ten actions which a servant should perform after committing a sin.

4.0.23. THE CLASSIFICATION OF SINS.

- a. The divine attributes (rubūbiyya).
- b. The devilish attributes (shaytāniyya).
- c. Sins which go against Sunna.
- d. Major sins which are innovation (transgression from true religion). Sins which are related to men, and which involve committing wrongs against their religion and leading them astray.

e. Sin which is related to wrongs committed by the servant in worldly affairs.

f. Sin which is between the servant and his Master, which is related to the passions and to following one's usual ways.

(i) The definition of minor sin.

(ii) The definition of major sin.

4.0.24. STAGES OF MEN WITH REGARD TO REPENTANCE.

a. One whose soul is at the stage of nafs al-mutma'inna.

b. One whose soul is at the stage of nafs al-lawwāma.

c. One whose soul is at the stage of nafs al-musawwila.

d. One whose soul is at the stage of nafs al-ammāra.

From the above summary of the contents of the Kitāb al-tawba, it is obvious that al-Makkī's material is presented in a disorganised and unsystematic way.

4.1 ANALYSIS OF THE CHAPTER.

4.1.1 Contents of the Chapter.

A careful study of al-Makkī's chapter of repentance shows that it contains more than fifty quotations from the Companions of the Prophet (P.B.U.H) and from outstanding early Ṣūfī figures. Of these quotations, more than thirteen are attributed to Sahl al-Tustarī. Indeed, Sahl is the authority most frequently cited in this chapter.

As has been pointed out earlier¹, al-Makkī sometime prefaces quotations by attributing them to "one of our 'ulamā'" or "one of the 'ulamā'" or "our leader". In this chapter, eight such quotations are attributed to "one of the 'ulamā' ". As already mentioned in Chapter one, such an attribution refers either to Muḥammad b. Sālim or Aḥmad b. Sālim.

There are five quotations from Ibn 'Abbās who was the Companion of the Prophet (P.B.U.H) and was well-versed in the science of Quranic exegesis. Four quotations come from 'Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib and from al-Junayd whom al-Makkī holds in high regard.

There are three quotations from Abū Sulaymān al-Dārānī on the subject of the importance of age and the danger of sin. Ḥasan al-Baṣrī is cited twice in this chapter in connection with the definition of tawba and the danger of sin. There are also two quotations from Sarī al-Saqāṭī on the conditions of tawba.

Quotations from Mu'ādh b. Jabal, Yaḥyā b. Mu'adh al-Rāzī, Aḥmad b. Abī al-Ḥawārī, Ibn Mas'ūd, al-Fuḍayl b. 'Iyāḍ, Rābi'a al-'Adawiyya, Rabāḥ b. 'Amr al-Qaysī, Ibn 'Aṭā' and others appear once each. From the spread of these quotations, it seems probable that al-

Makkī is well-versed in some areas of religious knowledge and very selective in choosing the views of scholars on the subject of Tafsīr, Hadīth and Sufism. It is obvious that he prefers to use the views of Ibn ‘Abbās, Ibn Mas‘ūd and Mujāhid on the subject of Tafsīr, and the views of well-known Ṣūfī masters on the subject of Sufism. On the subject of Hadīth, al-Makkī prefers views which are attributed to ‘Ā’isha and Ibn ‘Umar. In general, although he narrates some of the traditions using his own words, al-Makkī is a learned traditionist who tries to justify many problems of Sufism in the light of the Sunna. It can also be assumed that al-Makkī strictly adheres to the views of the salaf.²

There are about thirty traditions of the Prophet (P.B.U.H) in this chapter. Most of these traditions (about twenty-three) cannot be traced in six canonical hadīth collections. Three Isrā’īlī narrations have also been used by al-Makkī in this chapter. As has been pointed earlier³, al-Makkī has his own attitude towards narrating traditions. The chapter also quotes around seventy Quranic verses.

From the above analysis of the contents of the chapter, it is clear that it contains around eighty quotations, including alleged traditions of the Prophet (P.B.U.H), and the sayings of the Companions and

outstanding early Ṣūfīs. It seems probable that in his writing, although al-Makkī is much influenced by Sahl and the Sālimiyya school of thought, he also has high regard for other Ṣūfī groups such as those in Baghdād, Syria and others.

This chapter lays great emphasis on the doctrine of self-mortification (mujāhada). Conceivably, while writing this chapter, al-Makkī was himself practising self-mortification. This is in agreement with the views of al-Baghdādī⁴, Ibn Khallikān⁵ and al-Yāfi‘ī⁶ who say that al-Makkī was a man who observed self-mortification (mujāhada) strictly.

4.1.2 The method of presentation and style used by al-Makkī.

The following analysis will concentrate on the style that al-Makkī used in writing the chapter of repentance. Al-Makkī has his own arrangement for his material. He begins by adducing as many related Quranic verses as possible. He also quotes the views of the Companions and the Successors which are related to the verses. After elucidating the Quranic verses, al-Makkī adduces traditions of the Prophet (P.B.U.H) which are relevant to the subject. The views of the pious predecessors (salaf) are also highlighted thereafter. Al-Makkī then quotes sayings of outstanding Ṣūfīs from

Baṣra, Baghdād, Syria, Khurasān and elsewhere.

Careful study of this chapter also shows that al-Makkī never uses methods of analogy and syllogism. It is obvious that al-Makkī makes arguments from the Qur'an, Sunna and the views of pious predecessors prevail over any form of reasoning and analogy. This is the standard stance of the Ṣūfī and traditionist. Al-Makkī severely criticises the way of the theologians who make the use of reasoning prevail over the Qur'an and Sunna and he quotes in this context the view of Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal who says:

Verily, knowledge is that which comes from heaven (fawq), that is an inspiration which is without studying. He also said: The scholars of Kalām are zandaqa⁷.

The definition of tawba is very clear and it is explained at length by al-Makkī⁸. By observing the above method, he also explains in detail the relationship between the word naṣūh and tawba.⁹ Although this task is undertaken by al-Makkī successfully, this kind of explanation can be seen for these two words only and does not extend to other parts of this chapter.

A general lack of accompanying explanation makes this chapter difficult to understand. Indeed, many quotations are left without any proper explanation at

all. This approach is perhaps an inevitable result of al-Makkī's aim of dealing with every subject in a summarised manner,¹⁰ as for example the quotation of Abū Sulaymān al-Dārānī who says that ihtilām is a punishment.¹¹ This quotation and others like it are left without comment by al-Makkī.

The materials are not organised systematically. They are scattered throughout the chapter. For example, under the definition of istiḡāma, al-Makkī elaborates the importance of age which can compensate for previous dilatoriness.¹² He repeats this discussion in another place, under the account of two trusts which are bestowed by God¹³. Under the topic of istiḡāma he discusses the importance of regret by quoting a saying of Abū Sulaymān al-Dārānī¹⁴. He repeats this point in other places such as under the account of two trusts which are bestowed by God,¹⁵ and in the discussion of the conditions of repentance¹⁶. Such repetition of points can be found frequently in this chapter.

Al-Makkī elaborates the subject of how a minor sin becomes a major sin¹⁷ earlier than the discussion of the stages and definition of sin¹⁸. In fact he talks about sins in a special chapter which appears a long time after the chapter of repentance.¹⁹ However, al-Makkī never mentions this special chapter so that the

reader can refer easily to it.

To sum up, although al-Makkī approaches the subject by straight explanations which are to the point, because of the shortcomings outlined here, reading this chapter become a tedious task.

4.1.3 A brief comparison between al-Makkī's chapter of repentance with similar chapter on this topic written by his predecessors and his contemporaries.

The 3rd/9th and 4th/10th centuries mark an important period in the development of Sufism. Figures such as al-Muḥāsibī, Ibn Abī al-Dunyā, Abū Sa'īd al-Kharrāz, Abū Naṣr al-Sarrāj, al-Kalābādhī, al-Qushayrī and others whose teachings are produced by themselves or dictated to their disciples enrich the literature of Sufism.

Since repentance is one of the stations (maqāmāt), it is a main topic for almost all Ṣūfīs in their writings. Many of them speak in different places in their works about repentance, although they do not always devote a special chapter to this topic. The aim of this section is to make a brief comparison between al-Makkī's chapter of repentance with similar chapters of repentance on this topic which can be found in the works of other Ṣūfīs.

Among the earliest Ṣūfī writers is Abū ‘Abd Allāh al-Ḥārith b. Asad al-Muḥāsibī (d.243/857) who writes a long chapter related to the subject of repentance.²⁰ This chapter deals with the stages of penitents, which al-Muḥāsibī classifies into three stages. The first stage consists of those who live in uprightness and never commit disobedience, like the messengers and the prophets of God. The second stage is for those who commit sin, repent of it and never commit sin thereafter. The third stage is for those who persist in sin and commit disobedience for a long time. Eventually, they repent and seek Allāh’s forgiveness. After the three stages al-Muḥāsibī discusses the importance of fear (khawf) and hope (rajā’)²¹ and the importance of fulfilling the obligations laid down by Allāh.

In general, although there are a number of similar points which are discussed by al-Muḥāsibī and al-Makkī, their chapters of repentance are completely different. A distinct difference between al-Muḥāsibī and al-Makkī is that the former gives his own opinion in many areas whereas the latter always adheres to the view of a certain group. It is safe to say that al-Makkī is not influenced by al-Muḥāsibī whom al-Makkī includes as one of the theologians.²²

Although Abū Bakr ‘Abd Allāh b. Muḥammad al-Qarshī, generally known as Ibn Abi ‘l-Dunyā (d.281/894), was not a Ṣūfī, he produced a chapter which is entitled Kitāb al-tawba. This chapter has been studied in depth by A.J.Arberry in his article "Ibn Abi ‘l-Dunyā on penitence".²³ From the analysis made by Arberry, as well as a reading of other works of Ibn Abi ‘l-Dunyā,²⁴ it seems that the chapter of repentance by Ibn Abi ‘l-Dunyā adopts the author's usual method of quoting a large number of traditions of the Prophet (P.B.U.H). This is completely different from al-Makkī's way of presentation. Since al-Makkī never refers to Ibn Abi ‘l-Dunyā in the chapter of repentance, it may be concluded that the former was not influenced by the latter.

The same holds true for al-Kharrāz (d.247/861). In contrast to al-Makkī who allocates a special chapter to the subject of repentance, Abū Sa‘īd al-Kharrāz, in his book entitled Kitāb al-Ṣiḡa²⁵, simply discusses this subject in a very short and concise way which takes a few sentences only. Although al-Kharrāz was one of the teachers of al-Junayd, to whom al-Makkī refers in his Qūt and ‘Ilm,²⁶ their treatment of the subject of repentance is totally different.

Abū Naṣr al-Sarrāj (d.378/988), whose work is entitled Kitāb al-Luma‘ fi ‘l-Taṣawwuf, also allocates a

special chapter to the subject of repentance.²⁷ Unlike al-Makkī who treats this chapter in depth, al-Sarrāj simply presents the views of al-Junayd and Sahl on the essence of repentance, relying solely on these two sources. Not surprisingly al-Sarrāj's chapter of repentance is shorter than al-Makkī's.

Another outstanding Ṣūfī figure who is contemporary with al-Makkī is Abū Ishāq Muḥammad b. Ibrāhīm al-Kalābādhī (d.385/995) who wrote the work entitled al-Ta'arruf li Madhhab ahl al-Taṣawwuf. Al-Kalābādhī also has a chapter of repentance.²⁸ This chapter consists of eight sayings about repentance which are attributed to al-Junayd, Sahl, Rābi'a and others. These sayings are presented without a proper explanation. Although both al-Makkī and al-Kalābādhī quote the same sayings of al-Junayd and Sahl, the presentation of al-Kalābādhī is very brief and staccato. In general, his chapter is very short in comparison to al-Makkī's. It can be assumed that al-Makkī does not rely on al-Kalābādhī's chapter of repentance.

It is also useful to investigate a possible relationship between al-Makkī and a slightly later figure, Abu 'l-Qāsim 'Abd al-Karīm al-Qushayrī (376/986-465/1072), who also elucidates the subject of repentance in his work entitled al-Risāla al-Qushayriyya.²⁹ With the

exception of al-Makkī's chapter, al-Qushayrī's chapter of repentance is longer and more enlightening than those of al-Sarrāj, al-Kharrāz and al-Kalābādhī. However, al-Qushayrī's chapter of repentance is shorter than al-Makkī's. In terms of adducing proofs from the Qur'an, the traditions of the Prophet (P.B.U.H) and sayings of outstanding Ṣūfīs, al-Qushayrī uses the same technique as al-Makkī does. He also quotes the same verses about repentance and the same tradition of the Prophet (P.B.U.H) who says "One who repents from sin is like one who has no sin". A minor difference between al-Qushayrī and al-Makkī in quoting this tradition is that the former does not quote the unauthentic part quoted by the latter, i.e. "one who repents is the beloved of Allāh."³⁰ With the exception of this small point, their choice of quotations in their chapters is completely different.

Al-Qushayrī's chapter lacks the weight of explanations provided by al-Makkī. Another interesting contrast between al-Makkī and al-Qushayrī is that the former is influenced by Sahl and the wider ideas of Ibn Sālim whereas the latter is influenced only by the teachings of al-Junayd and al-Sulamī.³¹ It seems safe to assume that al-Qushayrī did not draw on al-Makkī's chapter of repentance.

Who then were the sources of inspiration for

al-Makkī in his chapter of repentance? Since al-Makkī had the opportunity to meet and study under Ibn Sālim who had received his spiritual education directly from Sahl and Muḥammad b. Sālim, it can be assumed therefore that al-Makkī's sources of information were these two men. According to Böwering, since al-Makkī had direct contact with Sahl's group of disciples, much information in the Qūt is copied from Sahl's tafsīr.³²

In his Qūt, al-Makkī explicitly mentions that one of his masters was Abū Sa'īd ibn al-A'rābī who was a disciple of al-Junayd. He wrote the work entitled Tabaqāt al-Nussāk, now no longer extant, which al-Makkī mentions in his Qūt.³³ As has been pointed out earlier,³⁴ al-Makkī presumably became a disciple of this man and studied the Tabaqāt al-Nussāk while he was in Mecca. It is highly probable that this lost work exerted great influence on al-Makkī's work, and especially on the Qūt.

In his Qūt, al-Makkī also refers to Abū Muḥammad Ja'far Nuṣayr al-Khuldī (d.348/959)³⁵ who was one of the Baghdād Ṣūfīs. This man was one of the most eminent and oldest of al-Junayd's pupils and was said to have produced a treatise entitled Hikāyāt al-Mashāyikh.³⁶ Conceivably, al-Makkī had also had the opportunity to meet Ja'far al-Khuldī and to study his works, including the Hikāyāt al-Mashāyikh. It can be assumed therefore

that al-Makkī also had direct contact with people who had studied under al-Junayd directly.

Apart from Tabaqāt al-Nussāk, Sahl's Tafsīr and direct contact with both the major Ṣūfī groups during his time, perhaps the work of Jaʿfar al-Khuldī also became a primary sources for al-Makkī.

4.1.4 A brief comparison between the Qūt and the ʿIlm al-Qulūb.

Mention has already been made of the work entitled ʿIlm al-Qulūb.³⁷ This section aims at drawing a brief comparison between al-Makkī's two extant works. The Qūt al-Qulūb can be confidently attributed to al-Makkī. However, the work entitled ʿIlm al-Qulūb, normally attributed to al-Makkī, presents problems.

Unlike the Qūt, most of the ʿIlm appears to have been written in the third person. There are many sentences which can be translated as follows; "Abū Ṭālib al-Makkī said", "Abū Ṭālib al-Makkī said in explaining this verse", "Abū Ṭālib al-Makkī used to say" ³⁸ and so on. Moreover, in one place in the ʿIlm, there is a problematic passage which reads as follows:

Abū Ṭālib mentioned in detail in his book, Qūt al-Qulūb, every branch of these kinds (of knowledge) and sciences, illustrating thereby (these topics) in summary and in depth. I have omitted that prolixity, so

whoever wishes to know about it, let
him go through his (Abū Ṭālib's)
book.³⁹

This way of referring to al-Makkī in the third person arouses doubts about the authenticity of this work. Perhaps, al-Makkī dictated his sayings to a disciple or disciples and it was compiled thereafter. Perhaps, someone interpreted the sayings of al-Makkī on the same sheet of the text and later on, the writings became mixed together. In its present form, it is not possible to make any distinction between the text itself and its interpretation by later generations.

Positive evidence pointing to al-Makkī's possible authorship of 'Ilm al-Qulūb may be found in the fact that this work adduces proofs in the same way used by al-Makkī in Qūt. Moreover, according to al-Baghdādī, al-Makkī wrote many works on tawhīd⁴⁰ and this present one may be amongst them.

On the other hand, there are significant differences between the Qūt and the 'Ilm which will be discussed below. Some of the interesting contrasts between the Qūt and the 'Ilm are as follows. The theme of 'Ilm is clearly wisdom (ḥikma) and how to attain it, whereas the theme of the Qūt deals with self-mortification (mujāhada).

The 'Ilm is also different from the Qūt with regard to its quotations. Unlike the Qūt where the majority of references came from Sahl, those in the 'Ilm are attributed largely to al-Junayd and Abū Yazīd al-Bisṭāmī.⁴¹ In fact the author accumulates the sayings of Abū Yazīd al-Bisṭāmī in a special section of this book,⁴² whereas the sayings of Sahl are not numerous.

This selection of quotations is entirely appropriate for the themes of the two books. Since the theme of 'Ilm is tawhīd, wisdom (hikma) and gnosis (ma'rifa), it is not therefore surprising that its author quotes the sayings of al-Junayd and Abū Yazīd al-Bisṭāmī who were well known for their deep knowledge in those subjects. Similarly, since the theme of the Qūt is self- mortification, there are not surprisingly many sayings of Sahl, who was well known for his abstinence and self- mortification.

Another salient difference is that the points which are elaborated in the 'Ilm are much more organised than in the Qūt. A good example is to be found in the first chapter of the 'Ilm which concerns the subject of wisdom (hikma). It starts with the definition of the word hikma from various kinds of people. Then, the difference between the word hikma and the word

knowledge (‘ilm) is discussed. He who possesses hikma is distinguished from one who is learned. Generally speaking, although there is some repetition of points in the ‘Ilm, this does not occur as frequently as in the Qūt. This better organisation stems from the fact that the points to be discussed have been arranged more systematically.

There is also a marked difference in style between the two works. The style of the ‘Ilm is much simpler than that of the Qūt. On present evidence it is difficult to decide on the authorship of the ‘Ilm. If al-Yāfi‘ī's statement that al-Makkī was initially a man who observed self-mortification and that at the end of his life he attained esoteric knowledge and witnessed God⁴³, is to be believed, it is conceivable that al-Makkī wrote this book. Moreover, since the Qūt al-Qulūb is mentioned in the ‘Ilm, it is clear that the ‘Ilm was composed after the Qūt, as ‘Aṭā’ suggests.⁴⁴ To sum up, it would appear likely that the ‘Ilm was written in the circle of al-Makkī but it is impossible to attribute the work specifically to al-Makkī personally.

4.2 THE CONTRIBUTION OF AL-MAKKĪ.
4.2.1 Al-Makkī's attitude towards
innovation.

There are some scholars who point out that al-Makkī was among the first Ṣūfīs who tried to harmonise Sufism and the Sharī'a. This is borne out by the evidence of his work. One of al-Makkī's beliefs was the importance of holding fast to the Sunna of the Prophet (P.B.U.H). Indeed, he is of the opinion that every action should be based on the Sunna. Moreover, in his view, novices who embark on the path of Sufism must walk in accordance with the Sunna of the Prophet (P.B.U.H) in every aspect. Al-Makkī holds that the Sunna should prevail over habitual acts and customs.⁴⁵

In emphasising the supremacy of the Sunna, al-Makkī who is a traditionist completely rejects the way of the theologians who, according to him, commit innovation. In contrast to Sahl's way whose argumentation, according to Massignon, is pure dialectic like that of the mutakallimūn,⁴⁶ al-Makkī is of the opinion that theologians are zandaqa. In this connection, al-Makkī writes a special chapter in which he condemns the way of theologians and the importance of following the Sunna and the way of the salaf.⁴⁷ His arguments are based primarily on those of Aḥmad b.

Ḥanbal.

On the same point, al-Makkī is deeply concerned at practices of rampant innovation. This covers 'ilm al-kalām and the art of argumentation, the science of comparison by analogy and observation, and the science of deducing the traditions of the Prophet (P.B.U.H) by reasoning and rationalism.⁴⁸ In particular al-Makkī criticises such groups as al-Jahmiyya, al-Rāfidiyya, al-Nazzāmiyya, al-Mu'tazila and al-Murji'a ⁴⁹ whose misguided innovative practices have become rampant during his time. According to al-Makkī, all these sects had plunged into innovation.

In addition to that, al-Makkī is of the opinion that the actions of the Ṣūfīs which go against the Sharī'a should be regarded as innovation (bid'a). One of the actions which al-Makkī severely criticises are the saying of Ṣūfīs uttered in an ecstatic state (al-shathiyyāt). He obviously condemns this group by saying:

The extremists (ghālūn) are those who utter ejaculated sayings. (This is because) they have not paid attention to knowledge and have diminished the tradition. Therefore they have disregarded legal opinion (ḥukm).⁵⁰

Although he strongly condemns those who utter ejaculated sayings, al-Makkī has a high opinion of Abū

Yazīd al-Bisṭāmī whose ejaculated sayings are severely criticised by Ibn Sālim.⁵¹ In this case, according to al-Makkī who agrees with al-Junayd's view, Abū Yazīd al-Bisṭāmī has attained a higher station.⁵² It is noteworthy also that al-Makkī does not condemn al-Ḥallāj (d.309/922).

As mentioned earlier, al-Makkī is of the opinion that before embarking on the Ṣūfī path, a novice must observe the Sharī'a which is prescribed by God in His saying:

Then We put thee on the (right) Way of religion (Sharī'a): so follow thou that way. (45:18)

The Sharī'a, according to al-Makkī, is the name of the right path. The Sharī'a consists of twelve characteristics which are the accumulation of the descriptions of faith (īmān).⁵³ For al-Makkī, therefore the Sharī'a embraces the pillars of Islam, the precepts of the Islamic faith and enjoining good and forbidding wrong. In fact, he frequently emphasises that all these obligations are essential for every Muslim. Nor surprisingly, almost all chapters of the second volume of the Qūt discuss the basic teaching of Islam in depth.

From the above discussion, it can be assumed therefore, that al-Makkī is a moderate Ṣūfī who observes

Islamic law. Moreover, his attitude towards the science of kalām and tradition is in line with that of Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal whose scholarship al-Makkī equates with the river Tigris.⁵⁴

4.2.2 Al-Makkī's attitude towards Sahl, al-Junayd and Abu Yazīd al-Bisṭāmī.

A careful study of al-Makkī's works shows that he has a high regard for Sahl, al-Junayd and Abū Yazīd al-Bisṭāmī. The work of al-Makkī may be viewed as a compromise between the teaching of Sahl, who represents the Baṣra Ṣūfīs, and the doctrine of Abū Yazīd al-Bisṭāmī and al-Junayd who represent the Baghdad Ṣūfīs.

As has been pointed out earlier,⁵⁵ a clear example of this sort is the doctrine of fasting on which the followers of Sahl rely on assured food at the break time, whereas al-Junayd's teaching enjoins no such reliance on assured food. In this case, al-Makkī is of the opinion that the teaching of Sahl is suitable for the novice, whereas the teaching of al-Junayd is suitable for those who are at a higher station.⁵⁶

Another clear example is the definition of the essence of repentance. According to Sahl, the truth of repentance is to remember sin, whereas according to

al-Junayd, the truth of repentance is to forget sin. In this case, al-Makkī tries to compromise between these views in the same way by saying that the teaching of Sahl is for the novice and the teaching of al-Junayd is for those who are at a higher station.⁵⁷

With regard to Abū Yazīd al-Bisṭāmī, al-Makkī believes that he was a Ṣūfī who succeeded in attaining the station of tawhīd. His ejaculated sayings were uttered while he had attained this station in which he deserved to be called a muwahhid.⁵⁸ On another occasion al-Makkī describes Abū Yazīd al-Bisṭāmī as the one who has attained the highest knowledge (ishāra) of starvation (jū'). Al-Makkī says:

Abū Yazīd al-Bisṭāmī who was the most enlightened of this group (al-a'lā hādhihi 'l-ṭā'ifa ishārat) was asked: Through what means have you attained this knowledge (ma'rifa)?. He replied: Through a hungry belly and a deprived body.⁵⁹

It can be assumed therefore that, although al-Makkī is a loyal adherent of Sahl's teaching, he tries in fact to harmonise the teaching of Sahl whose theme is self-mortification, with that of al-Junayd and Abū Yazīd al-Bisṭāmī who are concerned with tawhīd. No wonder that al-Makkī quotes their sayings extensively in his treatises. It is clear al-Makkī was influenced by both the Ṣūfī groups, Baṣra and Baghdād, the adherents of

which had studied under Sahl and al-Junayd directly.

NOTES.

1. Chapter one.
2. Qūt, 1, pp. 385-391.
3. Chapter one.
4. Tārīkh, 3, p. 89.
5. De Slane, 3, pp. 23-24.
6. Mir'āt, 2, p. 430.
7. Qūt, 1, p. 282.
8. Ibid, 1, pp. 364-365.
9. Ibid.
10. Ibid, 2, p. 442.
11. Ibid, p. 377.
12. Ibid, 1, pp. 365-366.
13. Ibid, pp. 368-369.
14. Ibid, p. 366.
15. Ibid, pp. 368-369.
16. Ibid, p. 370.
17. Ibid, pp. 370-375.
18. Ibid, pp. 390-391.
19. Ibid, 2, pp. 303-304.
20. Ri'āya, pp. 19-72.
21. Ibid, pp. 21-22.
22. Qūt, 1, pp. 343, 264.
23. A. J. Arberry, "Ibn Abi 'l-Dunyā on penitence", JRAS, 1950, pp. 48-63.

24. See for instance Kitāb al-Samt wa Hifz al-Lisān, ed. Muḥammad Aḥmad ʿĀshūr, Cairo, 1986; Idem, Muḥāsabat al-Nafs, Cairo, n.d.
25. Abū Saʿīd al-Kharrāz, Kitāb al-Sidq, tr. A.J. Arberry, The book of Truthfulness, London, 1937, pp. 10-11.
26. Qūt, 2, p. 336, see also ʿIlm, p. 247.
27. Lumaʿ, pp. 68-69.
28. Abū Ishāq Muḥammad al-Kalābādhī, al-Taʿarruf li Madhhab ahl al-Taṣawwuf, Cairo, 1960, pp. 94-95.
29. Abu ʿl-Qāsim ʿAbd al-Karīm al-Qushayrī, al-Risāla fī ʿIlm al-Taṣawwuf, Cairo, 1346 A.H, pp. 45-48.
30. Ibid, p. 45; cf Qūt, 1, p. 365.
31. There are about five quotations attributed to al-Junayd. He also refers to Abū ʿAbd Allāh al-Qarshī who is perhaps Ibn Abī ʿl-Dunyā. see Risāla, p. 47.
32. Mystical, p. 34.
33. Qūt, 1, p. 330. Another work written by Ibn al-Aʿrābī is Kitāb al-Wajd. See the introduction of al-Lumaʿ written by Nicholson, p. xii.
34. Chapter one.
35. Qūt, 2, p. 427; See also ʿIlm, pp. 20, 80, 88, 97, 119, 121, 122.
36. Kashf, pp. 155-156; Sezgin, 1, p. 661; see also Mystical, pp. 20-21; Lumaʿ, p. xvii.
37. Chapter one.
38. There are about 48 such sentences.
39. ʿIlm, p. 80.
40. Tārīkh, 3, p. 89.
41. There are about 36 quotations attributed to Abū Yazīd al-Bisṭāmī, 18 quotations attributed to al-Junayd and 19 quotations attributed to Sahl.
42. ʿIlm, pp. 230-247.
43. Mirʿāt, 2, p. 430.

44. ‘Ilm, p.9.
45. Qūt, 2, p.336.
46. L.Massignon, "Sahl al-Tustarī", E.I¹, 4, p.63.
47. Qūt, 1, pp.297-331; see also pp.326-327.
48. Ibid, 1, pp.334-336.
49. Ibid, 1, pp.390, 484,
50. Ibid, p.356.
51. Luma^c, p.472.
52. Qūt, 2, pp.148, 346.
53. Ibid, 2, p.286. The detail is as follows: Firstly acknowledging the existence of God and the prophethood of Muḥammad (P.B.U.H) (shahādatān) which is natural instinct (fitra), then five prayers which is religion (milla), then, alms giving which is purification (tahāra), then fasting which is the shield (junna). Then, pilgrimage to Mecca (hajj) which is perfection (kamāl), then strife for the sake of Allāh (jihād) which is victory (naṣr). Then enjoining the good (amr bi ‘l-ma‘rūf) which is evidence (hujja). Then forbidding wrongs (nahy ‘an al-munkar) which is prevention (wiqāya). Then, community (jamā‘a) which is intimacy (ulfa), then constant committment in uprightness (istiḳāma) which is hindrance (‘isma), then consuming the lawful which is abstinence (wara‘), then love and hate for the sake of Allāh (al-ḥubb wa ‘l-baghd fi Allāh) which are firmness (wathīqa). Qūt, 2, p.286.
54. Ibid, 1, p.289.
55. Chapter one.
56. Ibid, 2, p.243.
57. Ibid, 1, p.371.
58. Ibid, 2, p.148; see also 2, p.346; 1, p.371.
59. Ibid, 2, p.346.

CHAPTER FIVE

THE INFLUENCE OF AL-MAKKĪ ON AL-GHAZĀLĪ

5.0 INTRODUCTION

The teaching of al-Makkī influenced not only some of the Baṣra Ṣūfīs during his own time, but also those who lived several hundred years thereafter. As has been pointed out earlier,¹ figures such as al-Ghazālī, Ibn ‘Abbād al-Rundī and Jalāl al-Dīn Rūmī mention al-Makkī in their writings.

The impact of al-Makkī on Ibn ‘Abbād al-Rundī has been studied by P.Nwyia in his book entitled Ibn ‘Abbād De Ronda and elsewhere in his writings. He expresses the view that Ibn ‘Abbād began his studies on Sufism by studying the Qūt.² According to Brockelmann, al-Bayān al-Shāfī of al-Makkī exerted great influence on Ibn ‘Abbād.³

As has been pointed out earlier, al-Ghazālī who lived over a century later than al-Makkī, acknowledges his indebtedness to al-Makkī in his seeking of true knowledge. As far as it is possible to ascertain, although many scholars have mentioned that al-Ghazālī was influenced by al-Makkī, no profound comparative study on this area has been done.

In his al-Munqidh min al-Dalāl, al-Ghazālī states that he studied the works of al-Muḥāsibī and those of al-Junayd, al-Makkī, al-Shiblī and Abū Yazīd al-Bisṭāmī. Although of all these people al-Muḥāsibī is the earliest and the most prolific, and to him al-Ghazālī owes much,⁴ it cannot be denied that al-Ghazālī also has a great debt to the Qūt of Abū Ṭālib al-Makkī.

Without denying the profound influence of al-Muḥāsibī (d.243/857),⁵ the aim of this chapter is to study the influence of al-Makkī on al-Ghazālī with special reference to the "Book of Repentance". This task was not undertaken even by Susanna Wilzer who concentrated her studies on the "Kitāb al-Tawba" of al-Ghazālī in 1952⁶ in her unpublished Ph.D thesis which is entitled Untersuchungen Zu Ghazzālīs Kitāb al-Tawba.

For the purpose of this study, the Ihyā' 'Ulūm al-Dīn which was published in 1968 in Cairo will be used as a reference.⁷ The other editions of the Ihyā'⁸ will also be consulted. As for al-Makkī, this study will rely on the edition of the Qūt which was published in 1961.⁹ The other versions of the Qūt will also be consulted.¹⁰

5.1 COMPARISON BETWEEN AL-MAKKĪ AND AL-GHAZĀLĪ WITH SPECIAL REFERENCE TO THE KITĀB AL-TAWBA.

The Kitāb al-Tawba provides an excellent model for an analysis of al-Ghazālī's dependence on al-Makkī. It should be noted that in forming the Kitāb al-Tawba, al-Ghazālī combines two chapters of al-Makkī's. They are Chapter 32 which is called "The book of repentance" and Chapter 37, entitled "The explanation of major sins which can diminish and destroy good deeds".¹¹

In contrast to the chapter of al-Makkī, al-Ghazālī arranges his chapter of repentance in an organised way so that the reader can understand it easily. The arrangement of his chapter is as follows:

- 5.1.1 GENERAL INTRODUCTION.
- 5.1.2 THE FIRST PILLAR; REPENTANCE.
- 5.1.3 Repentance and its virtues.
- 5.1.4 The obligation of repentance which should be performed immediately.
- 5.1.5 The obligation of repentance is a general injunction to every Muslim.
- 5.1.6 The explanation of repentance; whenever its conditions are fulfilled, it will definitely be accepted.
- 5.1.7 THE SECOND PILLAR, THOSE THINGS FOR WHICH REPENTANCE IS REQUIRED, MINOR SINS AND MAJOR SINS.
- 5.1.8 The explanation of the categorisations of sins in connection with man's behaviour.

- 5.1.9 One's achievement in the hereafter is in accordance with one's achievement in this world.
- 5.1.10 The explanation of a minor sin that will become a major sin.
- 5.1.11 **THE THIRD PILLAR; THE PERFECTION OF REPENTANCE, ITS CONDITION AND ITS PERSISTENCE TO THE END OF TIME.**
- 5.1.12 The division of men who repent continuously (fī dawām al-tawba).
- 5.1.13 The remedy for those who intentionally and unintentionally commit sin after repentance. (Recommended actions which should be performed after committing sin, or when overcome by desire).
- 5.1.14 **THE FOURTH PILLAR; THE MOTIVATION OF REPENTANCE AND THE WAY OF HEALING BY UNTYING PERSISTENCE IN SIN.**

5.2 ANALYSIS OF THE CHAPTER.

It is worth emphasising that large sections of al-Ghazālī's chapter on repentance are copied word for word from al-Makkī's Qūt al-Qulūb. Although al-Ghazālī mentions his indebtedness to al-Makkī only once explicitly in the chapter on tawba, it is quite clear from a close scrutiny of both works that al-Ghazālī has leaned heavily on his predecessor in this section. This is true for al-Ghazālī's citations from the Qur'an, the ḥadīth, the sayings of Sahl al-Tustarī and of Abū Sulaymān al-Dārānī, the stories of prophets, the story of the angel of death and numerous other examples.¹²

The following analysis will concentrate on four major ways in which al-Ghazālī's chapter differs from that of his source, the Kitāb al-Tawba of al-Makkī.

5.2.1. GENERAL INTRODUCTION.

Firstly, al-Ghazālī begins his chapter with a general introduction explaining the arrangement he has adopted. This approach is lacking in al-Makkī's treatment of the topic.

In order to make the general concept of tawba clearer, al-Ghazālī divides this concept into four pillars. The first pillar concerns the true definition of tawba. At this stage al-Ghazālī confirms that since it is an obligation, repentance should be performed by all Muslims immediately.¹³ The second pillar for al-Ghazālī is concerned with those things for which repentance is required. According to al-Ghazālī, with regard to this matter, one should recognise the categorisation of sins into major and minor offences.¹⁴

The third pillar for al-Ghazālī discusses the explanation of the conditions of repentance and how one may amend bad deeds which have been committed previously. In this section he also discusses the

explanation of the stages of penitents. As for the fourth pillar, it considers the motivation for repentance and how to find a solution for those who persist in sins.¹⁵ Al-Ghazālī asserts that if one understands all these requirements, one will be blessed by Almighty God.

5.2.2 Summarising al-Makkī's material.

Secondly, al-Ghazālī often uses the technique of shortening and summarising al-Makkī's material. Instead of many scattered references to the meaning of tawba which are to be found in the Qūt, al-Ghazālī gives a clear definition of tawba in one place, providing a shortened version of the definition of it attributed to Sahl al-Tustarī which is also cited by al-Makkī:

Repentance is transformation (tahwīl) of blameworthy behaviour by praiseworthy behaviour and that is only achieved by keeping oneself in seclusion and silence and by consuming lawful food.¹⁶

It should be noted that al-Makkī's quotation of Sahl is much longer. Al-Ghazālī sees no need to quote Sahl in full. A minor difference between the definition of al-Makkī and al-Ghazālī is that the latter uses the term tahwīl rather than the word tabdīl preferred by al-Makkī. Moreover, al-Ghazālī chooses to omit the sentence

"one's repentance will not be valid except by consuming" used by al-Makkī.

In contrast to al-Makkī's approach, al-Ghazālī also summarises the definition of the word naṣūh, that is one who surrenders himself wholeheartedly to Allāh Most Exalted (al-khālīs li Allāh ta'ālā).¹⁷ The word naṣūh, according to al-Ghazālī, is derived from the word al-nash. He also quotes the tradition of the Prophet (P.B.U.H), which says:

"The penitent is the beloved of Allāh
and one who repents from sin is like
one who has no sin".

It seems probable that al-Ghazālī copied this tradition from al-Makkī since they are both quoting this tradition in the same form, (al-tā'ib ḥabīb Allāh) the first part of which is not authentic tradition.¹⁸

In explaining the importance of istiḳāma (constant commitment), al-Ghazālī simply summarises from al-Makkī in a few sentences referring to the sinner who then repents to the end of his life thereafter.¹⁹

Al-Ghazālī also simplifies the general definition of repentance in his conclusion by saying that repentance is to make up one's mind to neglect the act of disobedience both straightaway and in the future.²⁰

5.2.3 Enlarging al-Makkī's material.

At other times al-Ghazālī enlarges and expands on a topic from al-Makkī. Such a method can be seen throughout al-Ghazālī's chapter on repentance and it becomes the major part of this chapter. In view of the widespread use of this technique by al-Ghazālī a few relevant examples have been chosen to illustrate it in the following discussion.

In order to expound the concept of repentance, al-Ghazālī asserts that repentance is based on three elements, knowledge (‘ilm), condition (hay'a), and actions (af'āl). Through knowledge one will know the dangers of sin which might become a hindrance between a man and God.²¹ Once one knows the dangers of sin, one will make up one's mind to abandon it. At the same time one will also regret what one has done previously. Therefore, one will make the intention to repent. The stages in the process which take place before repentance are called hay'a and the intention and repentance are called af'āl.²² This discussion by al-Ghazālī is not to be found in the relevant sections of the Qūt.

Al-Ghazālī goes on to expand another point: the obligation of repentance under the sub-topic

entitled "The obligation of repentance and its virtues". He asserts that the obligation of repentance is prescribed by God in His verses and is also to be found in the traditions of the Prophet (P.B.U.H). Al-Ghazālī quotes many verses of the Qur'an in this connection, including chapter 14:31;

And o believers, turn ye all together
towards Allāh, that ye may attain
bliss.

and chapter 66:8;

O ye who believe, turn to Allāh with
sincere repentance; in the hope that
your Lord will remove your ills and
admit you to gardens beneath which
rivers flow.

He then argues that if the Quranic verses and traditions of the Prophet (P.B.U.H) were not available, the obligation of repentance could still be realised by men using their own minds. Although al-Makkī also emphasises the subject of the obligation of repentance, this kind of reasoning as adduced by al-Ghazālī is never put forward by al-Makkī.²³

Al-Ghazālī elaborates further by saying that repentance should be performed immediately without procrastinating. Therefore, after knowing the danger of sin, turning to God from it is a virtuous act. Al-Ghazālī equates this situation with one who swallows poison. In this situation, it is necessary to vomit in

order to remove its deadly effect. However, one who swallows poison needs time in order to vomit. According to al-Ghazālī, this period of time corresponds to the respite which needed by one who wishes to atone for previous vices.²⁴ In the case of al-Makkī, he also discusses this point in a very short and concise way by quoting a saying of Abū Sulaymān al-Dārānī:

If the intelligent man were to weep for the rest of his life only for his previous disobedience, it would be fitting that this should make him grieve until his death. So how will it be for someone facing the rest of his life still retaining his previous ignorance?²⁵

Al-Ghazālī expands his chapter of repentance with a new section, entitled "An explanation of the fact that the obligation of repentance is a general (injunction) for every individual and situation. Nobody at all may abandon it". Al-Ghazālī commences this section by quoting the Quranic verse, chapter 14:31;

And O believers, turn ye all together towards Allāh, that ye may attain bliss.

He elaborates this point further by saying that repentance is an individual obligation (fard 'ayn) because every person is prone to commit sin and follow his lust.²⁶

In order to emphasise this obligation, al-Ghazālī goes to the root of the problem by asserting that desire is the army of devils, whereas the intellect ('aql) is the army of angels. Desire comes very early in life whereas one's intellect reaches its maturity at the age of forty. Therefore, since desire prevails in a person from a very early age, one is prone to commit sin. Hence, the obligation of repentance is essential for every individual.²⁷

Al-Ghazālī further states that perfect repentance is to be attained not only by abandoning sin but also by compensating for one's past dilatoriness. He goes on to quote the tradition of the Prophet (P.B.U.H), which says: "Follow a bad deed with a good one which will obliterate it".²⁸ As for al-Makkī, he treats this whole topic by simply citing the above Quranic verse and hadīth quotations without a proper commentary.

Al-Ghazālī continues his discussion by explaining the dangers of procrastinating. According to him, there are two risks which result from such a practice. Firstly the darkness which results from acts of disobedience will engender a stain on one's heart. Secondly if death approaches, one would have no opportunity to repent. Such an explanation by al-Ghazālī is not to be found in the relevant section of the Qūt.²⁹

Al-Ghazālī goes on to remind the reader that man's heart and life are trusts which are bestowed on him by God. If man makes full use and takes good care of them Allāh will grant him mercy; if not, He will punish him. In order to strengthen this argument, al-Ghazālī relates an account which is reported by one of the gnostics ('ārifūn) concerning two mysteries which are confided by God to man. The first mystery is when one is born and emerges from one's mother's womb and the second mystery is at the departure of one's soul. Although this account is also to be found in the Qūt, al-Makkī leaves it without explanation.³⁰

Al-Ghazālī then embarks on a wider-ranging discussion about the nature of man. He points out that he has elaborated this topic in greater length elsewhere in the Ihyā', in the section entitled "The Book of the wonders and pitfalls (ghawā'il) of the heart". He asserts that there are four attributes which are to be found in man. They are divine attributes (al-ṣifāt al-rabbāniyya), devilish attributes (al-ṣifāt al-shaytāniyya), bestial attributes (al-ṣifāt al-bahīmiyya) and predatory attributes (al-ṣifāt al-sab'iyya).³¹

Divine attributes include pride, glory, arrogance, love of praise, eulogy, might and wealth, and

the desire to live forever. It is as if man has arrogated to himself the attribute of God. Al-Ghazālī goes on to say that man will claim "I am your almighty God". From this emanate a group of major sins which are neglected by men and not considered as sin by them. They are, however, major sins which lead to perdition and are the sources of many acts of disobedience just as he (al-Ghazālī) has discussed in the quarter (rubʿ) which deals with sins leading to perdition (

الكبر والفخر وحب المدح والعز والغني وحب دوام
البقاء وطلب الاستعلاء على الكافة حتى كأنه يريد
أن يقول: أنا ربكم الاعلى، وهذه يتشعب منه جملة
من كبائر الذنوب غفل عنها الخلق ولم يعدوها
ذنوباً وهي المهلكات العظيمة التي هي كالامهات
لاكثر المعاصي كما استقصيناه في ربع المهلكات

32)

In the Qūt, al-Makkī lists man's divine attributes as follows: pride, glory, arrogance, love of praise and eulogy, and the attribute of might and wealth. He then concludes that these are sins which lead to perdition. (

الكبر والفخر والجبرية وحب الحمد
والمدح ووصف العز فهذه المهلكات

33)

This is all that al-Makkī says in section 32 of the Kitāb al-tawba about man's divine attributes. Moreover, he does not include any discussion of the divine attributes in his treatment of major sins

(section 37) on which as already mentioned, al-Ghazālī draws for his analysis of repentance.³⁴

Al-Ghazālī's second group of attributes are devilish. Such attributes cover envy, injustice, cunning, deceit, commanding others to perform corrupt deeds and to conspire, which includes incitement to innovation, hypocrisy and going astray الحمد والبغى والحيلة

(). In
الخداع والامر بالفساد والمكر وفيه يدخل الغش والنفاق والدعوة الي
البدع والضلال
this section al-Ghazālī makes his discussion almost as brief as that of al-Makkī.

Al-Ghazālī's categorisation is also quite similar to that of al-Makkī who defines the devilish attributes as follows: envy, injustice, cunning, deceit and commanding others to perform corrupt deeds. These are grave offences (mūbiqāt) (

الحسد والبغى والحيلة والامر بالفساد فهذه موبقة) .³⁵

Al-Ghazālī goes on to explain bestial attributes. These include greed, (the attribute of) the dog, and the urge to satisfy the appetite of the belly and the pudenda. From this there result adultery, homosexuality, theft, squandering the property of orphans and accumulating the ephemeral things (of this world) for the sake of (different) appetites. (

الشه والكلب والحرص على قضا شهوة البطن والفرج،

ومنه يتشعب الزنا واللواط والسرقة واكل مال الايتام وجمع الحطام لاجل الشهوات) .

Al-Makkī's explanation of bestial attributes is shorter than al-Ghazālī's and is found not in the Kitāb al-tawba at all but in section 25 (The explanation of the definition of the lower soul and the change of rapture of gnostics). The bestial attributes are love of eating, drinking and marriage (حب الاكل والشرب والنكاح).³⁶ Al-Makkī categorises the bestial attributes listed by al-Ghazālī as offences which are included under major sins (kabā'ir). These are engendered by the belly (batn), pudenda (farj) and limbs (jawāriḥ).³⁷

The fourth categorisation of attribute for al-Ghazālī is predatory. Such attributes embrace anger, hatred, attacking people by striking, abusing their honour, murder, seizing property. From these will spring various kinds of sins. (الغضب والحقد والتهجم على الناس)

بالضرب والشتم والقتل واستهلاك الاموال ويتفرع عنها
جمل من الذنوب)³⁸ This seems to be a further elaboration of al-Makkī who describes these attributes as sins committed by man in this world. In this category he includes striking people, abusing their honour, usurping their property, lying and slandering, all of which lead to perdition (ضرب الانسان وشتم)

39. (الاعراض وأخذ الاموال والكذب والبهتان فهذه موبقات)

Al-Ghazālī asserts that all these four categories of attributes will emerge naturally in man by degrees. The bestial attributes appear first. These are followed by the predatory ones. The devilish attributes will emerge thereafter. The last group to appear are the divine ones. This discussion on man's nature in relation to four kinds of attribute is not derived from al-Makkī.

From these categorisations, al-Ghazālī elaborates further and develops a wider analysis of sins, which he divides into two. The first group of sins are those which concern the relationship between man and God, and the second group spring from man's dealing with other human beings. Amongst the sins which concern man's relationship with God are neglecting prayer or fasting and abandoning the prescribed obligations which are related to Him. The second group of sins which affect man's relations with his fellows include neglecting of alms giving, murder, seizing property, summoning people to commit bid'a, distorting the true teaching of religion and abusing honour.⁴⁰

Within al-Makkī's chapter of repentance, there are six categories of sins. Al-Ghazālī takes al-Makkī's sixth category (mā kāna bayna al-ʿabd wa mawlāhu) and uses it as the basis of his discussion about the first group of sins which concern man's

relationship with God. He then adapts al-Makkī's third category (ma'āsin takūnū min didd al-sunna) to become his second section dealing with sins affecting man's relationship with his fellow-man. It should be noted that al-Makkī's third and sixth categorisation of sins are left without any explanation.⁴¹

Later on, al-Ghazālī formulates his own classifications of sins. According to him, there are three stages of sin. Firstly, there is infidelity (kufr) which can deter one from knowing God and His messenger.⁴² This stage covers such sins as despair of His mercy, associating partners with God, arrogance and pride.

The second stage of sin is that which concerns the soul. According to al-Ghazālī, once the soul is protected, it enables one to know God and His messenger. This stage embraces such practices as murder, suicide, amputating one's limb, adultery, homosexuality, abusing one's honour and attacking and striking people.⁴³

The third stage covers sins which are related to property, which is people's sustenance. These sins include theft, robbery, cheating, taking usury, squandering the property of orphans, fabricating witness

in gaining property and the use of force against other people to gain their property. Al-Ghazālī also includes such practices as giving false witness in gaining property.⁴⁴ This kind of classification is not to be found in al-Makkī's chapter.

When al-Ghazālī begins his third pillar, which is entitled "The perfection of repentance, its condition and perpetuity to the end of time", he explains that repentance will be perfect through regret, which is a feeling caused by hatred of sin. Perfect repentance can also be achieved through perpetual sorrow and tenderness of heart. There is always an abundance of tears which accompanies those who practise remembrance.⁴⁵ In contrast to al-Ghazālī, in order to explain same point al-Makkī simply cites the saying of Yaḥyā b. Mu'ādh al-Rāzī who says:

For all of his (man's) life he is between two days, the day which is past and the day which remains, and he sets them aright with three things. As for the past, it is by regret and asking forgiveness (from Allāh), and as for that which remains it is by abandoning confusion and those who practise it, keeping to the company of novices, and sitting with those who practise remembrance (of God). The third thing is keeping to purifying one's nutrition and persistence in practising (good) deeds. A sign of true repentance is tenderness of heart and abundance of tears.⁴⁶

Moreover, according to al-Ghazālī, the sign of true repentance is that the bitterness of sin which is absorbed in one's heart will be replaced by the feeling of sweetness after abandoning it.⁴⁷ One should also replace the feeling of leaning towards sin with the feeling of hatred of it and substitute for the feeling of wishing to commit it the effort to avoid it. Al-Ghazālī notes that there are some sins which cannot be atoned for except by feeling distress at one's worldly life and hatred of luxurious ways. He quotes a tradition as follows:

Some sins are sins which cannot be atoned for except by feeling distress in earning (one's) life" or in another version "which cannot be atoned for except by feeling distress at (one's) life.⁴⁸

In order to emphasise that sorrow can atone for sins, al-Ghazālī goes on to relate a story of the prophet Joseph (P.B.U.H) with the angel Gabriel when he was in prison. Joseph asked about his father and the angel replied that Jacob was sorrowing for the loss of Joseph. The angel said that Allāh had granted Jacob a reward equal to that of a hundred martyrs.⁴⁹ This kind of explanation is lacking in al-Makkī's chapter.

Furthermore, to strengthen his argument that sin can be expiated through regret, sorrow and repentance, al-Ghazālī adduces a saying which concerns

those who are sincere in abandoning passion and who strive against their lower soul for the sake of Allāh. If they do so seven times, they will not be tempted by it thereafter. He also cites another saying which is about one who repents from sin and keeps in uprightness for seven years. He will never return to sin.⁵⁰

He elaborates this point further by suggesting the ways to atone for sins. According to al-Ghazālī, one should keep on busying oneself with seeking the forgiveness of God even if one does not understand what one utters or one utters it in dilatoriness. Finally, al-Ghazālī suggests that, when one begins to commit sin, one should occupy oneself with uttering the words "I take refuge in Allāh". These suggestions are not to be found in al-Makkī's chapter.⁵¹

Later on al-Ghazālī raises the problem of the truth of repentance. He highlights two views regarding this issue: one is that the essence of repentance is to remember sin, and the other view is that it is to forget sin. Al-Ghazālī elaborates this issue at greater length and he comes to the conclusion that remembrance of sin is the path of novices who have to practise such an action in order to encourage them to experience regret and sorrow. If the novice is not absorbed in such a practice, it is to be feared that he

will not regret and repent. Al-Ghazālī is also of the opinion that forgetting sin is the path of those who attain a higher station.⁵² This kind of interpretation cannot be found in al-Makkī's chapter.

5.2.4 Summarising and enlarging al-Makkī's material.

Another method which al-Ghazālī utilises in forming his Kitāb al-tawba is to summarise some of al-Makkī's point and thereafter to re-elaborate these at greater length. In view of the importance of this technique employed by al-Ghazālī, one relevant example has been chosen to illustrate it, although many others could be mentioned. In the section which is entitled "The explanation of a minor sin which becomes a major sin" al-Ghazālī says that a small sin can also become a major one after committing seven actions; namely persistence in sin, belittling sin, concealing God by one's sin, displaying one's sin, causing other people to commit sin, helping other people to commit sin and the learned man who invents a sin which is followed by other people thereafter.

In the equivalent section in al-Makkī's work, al-Makkī lists nine reasons. Al-Ghazālī reduces these to seven only. However, having retained those seven reasons he then re-elaborates all these at

length.⁵³ He asserts that a major sin is surrounded by many small sins; therefore one may commit small sins first before committing a major sin. According to al-Ghazālī, the first reason why a minor sin becomes a major sin is through persistence in sin. Another reason which makes a small sin become a major one is belittling a sin . According to al-Ghazālī, even though it is a small sin, if a person regards a sin as big, it is small to Allāh Most Exalted.⁵⁴ He quotes the tradition of the Prophet (P.B.U.H) who says:

The believer is he who feels that his sin as big as a mountain which is above him, and fears that it will fall upon him, (whereas) the hypocrite is he who feels that his sin is as small as a fly which passes before his nose and he swats it away.⁵⁵

After quoting this tradition, al-Ghazālī reproduces the passages from al-Makkī's Qūt with some modification.

Another factor which can make a small sin become a major one is the feeling of pleasure which can be aroused after committing a small sin. He equates this situation with a salesman who feels very happy after cheating his customer. According to al-Ghazālī, this attitude will engender dilatoriness and persistence in it. Such a cause is discussed by al-Makkī without any example.⁵⁶

Belittling Allāh's concealing of one's sins and belittling Allāh's clemency are two causes which make a small sin into a major one. Here al-Ghazālī re-elaborates in greater detail the points which are discussed by al-Makkī.⁵⁷

Another factor is a situation in which a learned man commits a sin, and this is then followed by other people. The sin will be regarded as a major one after it has been committed by other people. Therefore, according to al-Ghazālī, there are two tasks for the learned man. Firstly, to avoid committing sin and the second is to conceal sins. This is because, if the layman sees the sin of a learned man, he will follow it.⁵⁸ After pointing out all these reasons, al-Ghazālī then copies many passages extensively from the Qūt. Careful study of this section shows that al-Ghazālī reproduces from al-Makkī the reasons which make a small sin into a major one. Unlike al-Makkī, however, al-Ghazālī presents his case in a systematic way so that the reader can understand it easily.

5.2.5 New material added by al-Ghazālī.

It is interesting to note that there are

also completely new materials introduced by al-Ghazālī in this chapter. A few relevant examples have been chosen to illustrate this in the following discussion.

One of the new parts of al-Ghazālī's chapter is the section entitled "An explanation of how to classify the stages of one's achievement in the hereafter with regard to good and bad deeds in this world".⁵⁹ Al-Ghazālī commences this section by defining the term "hereafter" (al-ākhirā) and "this world" (al-dunyā). According to him, al-ākhirā is after death and al-dunyā is before death. There will be four stages of men in the hereafter, those who will perish (hālikūn), those who will be punished (mu'azzabūn), those who will be safe (nājūn) and those who will succeed (fā'izūn). Those who will perish are those who despair of the blessing of Allāh, commit disobedience, stray from the injunctions of Allāh, His messenger's teaching, the Book and so on.⁶⁰ The second stage is for those who will be punished. They are the believers (mu'minūn) who do not observe the injunctions of Allāh, and who do not pay full attention to the precepts of Islam after uttering the tawhīd.⁶¹

The third stage is for those who are safe. Al-Ghazālī means that they are merely safe from punishment without attaining happiness or victory.

Amongst these people are the insane, the children of unbelievers and those who have not been called to Islam. They are neither the inhabitants of Paradise nor are they the victims of hellfire. They will be placed in al-A'rāf (the place which is between Paradise and hellfire).⁶² The fourth stage is for those who have succeeded. They are those who are knowledgeable and attain gnosis. Their place will be in Paradise. Al-Ghazālī concludes this section by saying that this world is a veil between the true and the false, reality and unreality. After one departs from this world, one will be able to distinguish between the true and the false.⁶³

Since there is no borrowing or copying from al-Makkī in this section, it can be assumed that al-Ghazālī took these ideas from another source or sources or that he is incorporating material of his own.

In one of the sections, "The perfection of repentance, its condition and perpetuity to the end of time" al-Ghazālī puts forward his own opinion on the three kinds of repentance which are possibly accepted by God. The first is to repent of some sins only. The second is to repent of some major sins only, and the third is to repent of minor sins whereas one persists in major ones.⁶⁴ This new material has been included by al-Ghazālī, probably to clarify further his chapter of

repentance. By highlighting the stages of man in the hereafter, if one does not repent of one's sin, the reader now realises more acutely his position in the hereafter and will be encouraged thereby to repent.

Al-Makkī on the other hand is of the opinion that such kinds of repentance will not be accepted by God. He quotes a saying of one of the 'ulamā' who says:

Whoever repents of ninety-nine sins,
but does not repent of one (other)
sin, he will not, according to us, be
amongst the penitents.⁶⁵

These two examples and many others indicate that al-Ghazālī does not copy al-Makkī slavishly or merely re-organise al-Makkī's material. Indeed, al-Ghazālī is capable, as in the last example discussed, of disagreeing strongly with al-Makkī.

5.2.6 STYLISTIC APPROACH.

As already suggested at various points in this chapter, generally speaking, al-Ghazālī's method is more organised and systematic than that of al-Makkī. He presents the chapter in a way in which the reader can understand what tawba is. The material is dealt with systematically, not in the scattered, disordered way in which it is treated in al-Makkī's chapter. A few

examples have been chosen to illustrate this difference in approach. One of the styles adopted by al-Ghazālī is to accumulate al-Makki's points and to put them under a new section.

One of the sections in al-Ghazālī's chapter is entitled "The motivation of repentance and the way of healing in untying perpetuity in sin". He classifies people into two categories. The first includes people who do not have any inclination toward sinful acts and the second is for those people who do commit sin. The second category is divided into two; those who persist in sin, and those who repent.⁶⁶ From these categorisations, al-Ghazālī suggests ways of untying persistence in sin by accumulating points from al-Makkī.

There are four remedies. The first is to remember the threat of punishments which are prescribed in the Qur'an and the traditions. Here he cites the tradition about two angels conversing with four voices.⁶⁷ Under the second remedy, al-Ghazālī relates stories from al-Makkī about prophets and pious predecessors (salaf) who were punished for their sins. This remedy includes stories of the prophet Adam who was expelled from Paradise, Solomon who was punished for his fault, Moses and Khidr, Solomon travelling on the wind, and Jacob's separation from Joseph.⁶⁸ In contrast

to al-Ghazālī's method, all these stories can be found scattered throughout al-Makkī's chapter.

Under the third kind of remedy which is to tell the sinner that punishment of his sin will be exacted in this world, al-Ghazālī accumulates traditions and stories from al-Makkī. Such stories and traditions include the tradition which concerns a servant who will be deprived of bounty because of committing sins, a saying of one of the pious predecessors about the curse of Allāh, and the story of one of the gnostics who walks in the mud.⁶⁹ The fourth kind of remedy is to relate what has been prescribed in the Qur'an about punishment for sins. Unlike al-Ghazālī who allocates a separate section to these, all these traditions, stories and sayings are cited by al-Makkī's chapter in a scattered way.

In order to make the discussion more lively, al-Ghazālī sometimes presents his points in a question and answer style, as for example in his treatment of the two servants, one of whom repents easily and the other who has to struggle against his lower soul. This discussion is also found in al-Makkī's work but is treated differently. Al-Ghazālī says:

If you said: If we postulate two penitents, one of whom is free from struggling against sins and the other in whose soul the struggling remains

and he fights and struggle against it,
which one of them is superior?...

Al-Ghazālī then replies to the question he poses by giving two conditions. Firstly, if the one who repents easily without striving against his lower soul does not have any desire because of old age or impotence, then the one who struggles against his lower soul is superior.⁷⁰ Secondly, if the one who repents after striving against his lower soul has strong desire and succeeds in striving against it because of his strong faith, then he has attained the highest station of mujāhada. Although al-Makkī has also pointed out this issue, this kind of explanation is lacking in his chapter.⁷¹ Another example of the same sort is:

What is your opinion about two penitents, one of whom has forgotten sin and has never occupied himself with thinking about it, and the other who keeps sin in front of his eyes and continues thinking about it so that the feeling of regret is in his (heart), which one of them is superior?...

Al-Ghazālī replies to this question by saying that remembering sin is the path of the novice. Such a practice will encourage him to repent. If one does not observe such a practice, it is to be feared that one will not repent. As for forgetting sin, it is the path of those who are in a higher station. This kind of approach can be seen throughout al-Ghazālī's chapter

of repentance⁷² as indeed in his other philosophical and theological works.⁷³

Other techniques employed by al-Ghazālī are comparison and syllogism. The method of comparison can be seen at the beginning of almost every section. One of the images used by al-Ghazālī is in the case of persistence in small sin which becomes a major one. He compares this situation to drops of water which continuously fall on rock. These drops of water will eventually erode and dent the rock. Persistence in small sins is like the drops of water which fall on the rock. They will eventually cause major damage.⁷⁴

In order to emphasise the importance of knowledge of sins, al-Ghazālī uses the technique of syllogism. He says:

Know that repentance is abandoning sin. It is impossible to abandon something except by having knowledge of it. If repentance is obligatory, (then) the only way of gaining access to it (repentance) is also obligatory. The knowledge of sins therefore, is an obligation.⁷⁵

In order to lay stress on the obligation of repentance which is incumbent on each Muslim, al-Ghazālī argues that repentance is abandoning sin. Since desire prevails over intellect in every person at an early age, one is prone to commit sins, therefore, repentance is

incumbent on every individual.⁷⁶ Such techniques cannot be found in the relevant sections of al-Makkī's work.

5.3 GENERAL COMMENTS AND CONCLUSIONS.

Almost all the material in al-Ghazālī's chapter of tawba is taken from al-Makkī's chapter, including the conclusion. Frequently the material is copied verbatim. On other occasions, al-Ghazālī makes minor changes,⁷⁷ either to the wording itself or to the order of the sentences.⁷⁸ Al-Ghazālī's presentation is more organised and the material is dealt with systematically. His ideas are not presented in the scattered and disordered way which is found in al-Makkī's chapter.

This difference of approach is probably because al-Ghazālī's chapter of repentance is meant to be an extensive commentary on al-Makkī's chapter of repentance. The resultant version of al-Ghazālī is definitely more organised and enlightening than al-Makkī's text.

Looking back to his historical background, al-Ghazālī, before devoting himself to Sufism, had studied in depth many branches of knowledge, such as philosophy, 'ilm al-kalām, Islamic law and Ismā'īlī

thought. Al-Ghazālī can draw on the methods and knowledge he has acquired to argue his case, using particularly the methods of analogical reasoning of the mutakallimūn and the syllogistic arguments of the philosophers.

Al-Makkī's presentation is unorganised and disordered. His Qūt al-Qulūb was probably intended as a brief handbook of Sufism and was produced only for Ṣūfīs, not for laymen. This is borne out by the theme of the book which specifically addresses the Ṣūfī who treads the path towards the highest station, that of tawhīd. In fact in his book al-Makkī clearly mentions that his aim is to deal with every subject in a concise way.⁷⁹

It is not our intention to accumulate (al-jam') (all the traditions), since we have related in accordance with our inclination towards concision in every field.

Unlike al-Ghazālī who displays competence in many fields of knowledge, al-Makkī is skilled in certain branches of religious knowledge only, such as tradition, the science of the Qur'an, and Sufism. From his extant work al-Makkī is obviously against the use of the syllogistic method.⁸⁰

Many of the traditions in al-Ghazālī's chapter of repentance are copied from al-Makkī's. Both

are prepared to use traditions which have been criticised as "weak" by later scholars such as al-Subkī, al-‘Irāqī, al-Murtaḍā and more recently Zakī Mubārak.⁸¹

It is noteworthy that al-Ghazālī's chapter is twice as long as al-Makkī's. A close analysis of the chapters on repentance of al-Makkī and al-Ghazālī reveals that al-Ghazālī has used the version of the Qūt which has come down to us, not a different text. If the statement of Massignon who says that the text of the Qūt was "purified" at an early date,⁸² is to be believed, it seems probable therefore that al-Ghazālī also studied and commented on the "purified" version of the Qūt. Conceivably the process of "purification" of the text had been undertaken immediately after the death of al-Makkī during the early years of the eleventh century. To sum up this chapter, al-Ghazālī's treatment of the chapter of tawba is more successful than al-Makkī's.

NOTES.

1. See chapter 1.
2. P.Nwyia, "Ibn 'Abbād al-Rundī", E.I², 3, pp.670-671; see also L.Massignon, "Abū Ṭālib al-Makkī", E.I², 1, p.153.
3. G.A.L, 1, p.217.
4. Margaret Smith, "The forerunner of al-Ghazālī", JRAS, (Jan) part 1, 1936, pp.65-67.
5. Ibid.
6. Susanna Wilzer, Untersuchungen Zu Ghazzālīs Kitāb at-Tauba, unpublished Ph.D thesis, University of Erlangen, 1952. It should be noted in passing that recent research has further indicated the debt which al-Ghazālī owes to Ibn Abi 'l-Dunyā (d.281/894). See T.J.Winter, The Remembrance of death and the afterlife, (The translation of al-Ghazālī's Kitāb dhikr al-mawt wa mā ba'dahu, book XL of The revival of the religious sciences), Cambridge, 1989, pp.xix-xx.
7. Ihyā', 5 vols. (edited by Zayn al-'Ābidīn al-Faḍl al-Ḥusayn al-'Irāqī), Cairo, 1968.
8. Ihyā', 4 vols., Cairo, n.d.; Ihyā', 4 Vols., Cairo, 1346 A.H.
9. Qūt, 2 vols., Cairo, 1961.
10. Qūt, 4 vols., Cairo, 1932. Unfortunately, the Kitāb al-tawba is not included in the manuscript of the Qūt (BL, MS.no.7726 and Chester Beatty, MS.no.3698).
11. Qūt, 2, pp.304-318.
12. The following examples illustrate al-Ghazālī's dependence on al-Makkī:
 - (1) The saying of Abū Sulayman al-Dārānī: If the intelligent man were to weep for the rest of his life only for his previous disobedience, it would be fitting that this should make him grieve until his death. So how will it be for someone facing the rest of his life still retaining his previous ignorance. Ihyā', 4, p.15; cf Qūt, 1, p.370.

Abū Sulaymān al-Dārānī, may Allāh be pleased with him, used to say: The iḥtilām is a punishment. Ihyā', 4, p.68; cf Qūt, 1, p.377.

(ii) The story of the angel of death who comes to one who is dying:

Then appear so much regret and sorrow on his face that if all the contents of the world from its beginning to its end were his, he would forego it if he could add another hour to that hour in order to seek (Allāh's) favour in it or to seek a substitute for it, (but) he will find no way to do that. This is the interpretation of the saying of Allāh Most Exalted: "And between them and their desire is placed a barrier". (34:54). Ihyā', 4, p.15; cf Qūt, 1, p.367.

(iii) Two mysteries bestowed by God on man:

"He (Allāh Most Exalted) says to him: O my servant, verily I have sent you to the world clean and chaste. I have entrusted you with your life, and have committed it to you. So see to it that you will preserve that trust and see to it that you meet Me (again). Allāh (says): O my servant, what have you done with My trust (which was committed) to you? Did you preserve it until you meet me (i.e. died) with close observance, (in which case) then I will discharge My obligation to you, or did you neglect it, (in which case) I shall meet you with a calling to account and punishment". Al-Ghazālī then quotes two Quranic verses, chapter 2:40 and 23:8. Ihyā', 4, p.16; cf Qūt, 1, p.368.

(iv) A tradition which is about two angels conversing with each other:

"There is no day whose dawn rises and no night whose twilight disappears but that two angels converse with one another with four voices; one of them says: "would that these creatures had not been created", and the other says: "Would that, when they were created, they had known why they were created". The first one says: "Would that, when they knew why they were created, they had acted upon their knowledge". Here, al-Makkī's version

compares well with al-Ghazālī's whose text in the printed edition, at any rate, contains an otiose lam which makes little sense. Ihyā', 4, p.65; cf Qūt, 1, p.387.

(v) The acceptance of repentance:

"One of them said: "I know when Allāh Most Exalted will forgive me". He was asked: "When", he replied: "When He bestowed repentance upon me". Another person said "For me the withholding of repentance is more dreadful than the withholding of forgiveness". Ihyā', 4, p.19; cf Qūt, 1, p.369.

13. Ihyā', 4, p.4.
14. Ibid.
15. Ibid.
16. Ihyā', 4, p.5; cf Qūt, 1, p.369.
17. Ihyā', 4, p.6; cf Qūt, 1, p.365.
18. This tradition is not in the six canonical hadīth collections. In fact al-‘Irāqī criticises the first part of the hadīth as not being an authentic tradition. Ihyā', 4, p.6.
19. Ihyā', 4, p.55; cf Qūt, 1, pp.365-366.
20. Ihyā', 4, p.7.
21. Ibid, 4, pp.4-5.
22. Ibid., 4, p.4-5.
23. Ibid., 4, p.6; cf Qūt, 1, p.364.
24. Ihyā', 4, p.11.
25. Qūt, 1, p.366; cf Ihyā', 4, p.15.
26. Ibid., 4, pp.11-12.
27. Ibid, p.12.
28. Ibid., 4, p.15; cf Qūt, 1, p.366.
29. Ihyā', 4, p.16.
30. Qūt, 1, pp.367-368; cf Ihyā', 4, p.16.

31. Ibid., 4, pp. 19-20. According to A. Quasem, the first two attributes of man's nature are copied by al-Ghazālī from al-Makkī and the last two attributes are copied from philosophers. It seems that A. Quasem does not acknowledge that al-Ghazālī copies the bestial attributes from al-Makkī who also lists the description of bestial attributes in his Qūt. A. Quasem, The ethics of al-Ghazālī, Petaling Jaya, 1975, pp. 48-50; cf Qūt, 1, p. 177. Elsewhere in his writings, al-Ghazālī repeats the attributes of the nature of man, for example in Mishkāt al-Anwār and in Majmū'at Rasā'il al-Imām al-Ghazālī, Beirut, 1986, p. 39.

32. Ihyā', 4, pp. 19-20.

33. Qūt, 1, p. 390.

34. Ibid., 2, pp. 304-306.

35. Ibid., 2, p. 304.

36. Ibid., 1, p. 177. Apart from three categories of attributes, al-Makkī has others. These are the attributes of servanthood (awṣāf al-'ubūdiyya) which cover fear, modesty and humility (al-khawf wa 'l-tawādu' wa 'l-dhull), and the attributes of men of spirituality (awṣāf al-rūḥāniyyīn).

37. Ibid., 1, p. 390; see also vol. 2, p. 304.

38. Ihyā', 4, p. 20.

39. Qūt, 1, p. 390.

40. Ihyā', 4, p. 21.

41. Ibid., 4, pp. 21-23; cf Qūt, 2, p. 304.

42. Ihyā', 4, p. 25.

43. Ibid., 4, p. 25.

44. Ibid., 4, pp. 25-26.

45. Ibid., 4, p. 43; cf Qūt, 1, p. 370.

46. Ibid., 1, p. 370.

47. Ihyā', 4, p. 43; cf Qūt, 1, p. 369.

48. Ihyā', 4, p. 45; cf Qūt, 1, pp. 379-380. This tradition is unauthentic tradition and has been criticised by al-'Irāqī.

49. Ihyā', 4, p. 45; cf Qūt, 1, pp. 379-380.
50. Ihyā', 4, p. 49; cf Qūt, 1, p. 383.
51. Ihyā', 4, p. 52; cf Qūt, 1, pp. 372-373.
52. Ihyā', 4, p. 53; cf Qūt, 1, p. 371.
53. Ihyā', 4, p. 4.
54. Ibid., 4, p. 40; cf Qūt, 1, p. 370.
55. Ihyā', 4, p. 41; cf Qūt, 1, p. 370.
56. Ihyā', 4, p. 41; cf Qūt, 1, p. 373.
57. Ihyā', 4, p. 41; cf Qūt, 1, p. 373.
58. Ihyā', 4, p. 42.
59. Ibid., 4, p. p. 31-33.
60. Ibid., 4, pp. 31-33.
61. Ibid., pp. 33-38.
62. Ibid., pp. 38-39.
63. Ibid., pp. 39-40.
64. Ibid., pp. 49-52.
65. Qūt, 1, p. 389.
66. Ihyā', 4, pp. 62-64.
67. Ibid., 4, p. 65; cf Qūt, 1, p. 387.
68. Ihyā', 4, p. 66; cf Qūt, 1, pp. 375-376, 381-382, 386.
69. Ihyā', 4, pp. 65-67; cf Qūt, 1, pp. 375-376, 381, 386.
70. Ihyā', 4, pp. 52-53.
71. Ibid., 4, p. 52; cf Qūt, 1, pp. 372-373.
72. This style can be seen clearly, for example, in Ihyā', 4, pp. 7, 9, 13, 20, 27, 28, 43, 44, 45, 51, 52, 53 etc.
73. E.g. Tahāfut al-Falāsifa, al-Iqtisād fi 'l-I'tiqād etc.

74. Ihyā', 4, p.40.

75. Ibid, 4, p.20.

76. Ibid, 4, p.12.

77. For example:

(i) The saying of 'Umar and others:

"'Umar said: Sit (all of you) with penitents, for they are the tenderest of heart".

The only difference between al-Makkī and al-Ghazālī is that the former prefers the word "shay'" (something) before the word "af'ida" (heart) whereas the latter omits it. Ihyā', 4, p.19; cf Qūt, 1, p.370.

One of them said: "I recognise the punishment (for my sins) in the misshapen form of my donkey", and another said "I recognise the punishment (for my sins) even in the rat (fā'r) in my house".

A minor difference between al-Makkī and al-Ghazālī is that the former prefers the word nār (fire) instead of rat (fā'r) employed by the latter. Ihyā', 4, p.68; cf Qūt, 1, p.377.

78. For example:

"The Companions and the Successors disagreed on the number of major sins; (the number ranged) from four to seven, to nine, to eleven and to more than that (number). Ibn Mas'ūd said: "They are four". Ibn 'Umar said: "They are seven" and 'Abd Allāh b. 'Amrū (said): "They are nine". Whenever the saying of Ibn 'Umar reached Ibn 'Abbās, he used to say: "They are closer to seventy than to seven". He said: "Whatever is forbidden by God is a major sin". Others said: "Whatever is prescribed by Allāh with hellfire is amongst the major sins". One of the pious predecessors (salaf) said: "Whatever is prescribed by Allāh in this world with punishment (hadd) is a major sin". It has been said: "They are uncertain and their number cannot be ascertained just like the Night of Power (laylat al-qadr) and the (special) moment on Friday". Ibn Mas'ūd said at the time when he was asked about that: "Read from the beginning of chapter al-Nisā' until the thirtieth verse when He says "in tajtanibū kabā'ir mā tunhawna 'anhu". Whatever is forbidden by God in this chapter up to here (verse 31) is a major sin".

Obviously, al-Ghazālī simply omits some of

the sentences or changes the word order of al-Makkī's Qūt; for example al-Ghazālī prefers to use the sentence "The Companions and the Successors disagreed on the number of major sins" rather than "There was disagreement among the 'ulamā' from the Companions and the Successors" employed by al-Makkī. Iḥyā', 4, pp. 21-23; cf Qūt, 2, p. 304

79. Ibid., 2, p. 442.

80. Ibid., 1, p. 282.

81. Al-Subkī in his Ṭabaqāt al-Shāfi'iyya al-Kubrā lists all weak traditions which are related by al-Ghazālī in his Iḥyā'. See Shāfi'iyya, 6, p. 215.

Al-ʿIrāqī is the one who edited the Iḥyā'. One may see his criticisms in the footnotes of the Iḥyā'. As for example his criticism of the tradition "al-tā'ib ḥabīb Allāh". His book which is specifically devoted to this topic is al-Mughnī 'an ḥaml al-asfar fī takhrīj mā fi 'l-Iḥyā' min 'l-akhbār.

Al-Murtaḍa's full name is Sayyid Muḥammad al-Ḥusaynī al-Zabīdī al-Murtaḍā whose book is entitled Ithāf al-sādāt al-muttaqīn bi sharḥ Iḥyā' 'Ulūm al-Dīn.

Zakī Mubārak, al-Akhlāq 'inda 'l-Ghazālī, Cairo, 1391 A.H.

82. 'Sālimiyya', E.I¹, 4, p. 115.

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

PRIMARY SOURCES

Al-‘Asqalānī, Shihāb al-Dīn Ibn Ḥajar, Lisān al-Mizān, 6 vols., Hyderabad, 1331,

_____, Al-Isāba fī Tamyīz al-Sahāba, 4 vols., Baghdād, 1328 A.H.

‘Aṭṭār, Farīd al-Dīn, Tadhkirat al-Awliyā, tr. A.J. Arberry, Muslim Saints and Mystics, London, 1966.

Al-Baghdādī, Abū Bakr Aḥmad al-Khaṭīb, Tārīkh Baghdād, 14 vols., Cairo, 1931.

Al-Baghdādī, Abū Maṣṣūr ‘Abd al-Qāhir Ibn Ṭāhir, Al-Farq bayna al-Firaq, tr. Kate Chambers Seelye, Muslim Schisms and Sects, New York, 1966.

Al-Bukhārī, Muḥammad b. Ismā‘īl, Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī, tr. Muḥammad Muhsin Khan, 10 vols., Ankara, 1977.

Al-Dhahabī, Shams al-Dīn, Al-‘Ibar fī Khabar Man Ghabar, 4 vols., Kuwayt city, 1960.

_____, Kitāb Tadhkirat al-Huffāz, 4 vols., Hyderabad, 1955.

Al-Farrā’, Muḥammad b. Abī Ya‘lā, Al-Mu‘tamad fī Uṣūl al-Dīn, Beirut, 1974.

Al-Ghazālī, Abū Ḥāmid Muḥammad, Al-Munqidh Min al-Dalāl, tr. W.M. Watt, The Faith and Practice of al-Ghazali, London, 1953.

_____, Ihyā’ ‘Ulūm al-Dīn, 4 vols., Cairo 1968.

- Al-Ḥujwīrī, 'Alī b. 'Uthmān, Kashf al-Mahjūb, tr. R.A.Nicholson, The Kashf al-Mahjub: The Oldest Persian Treatise on Sufism, Lahore, 1982.
- Ibn Abī al-Dunyā, Abū Bakr 'Abd Allāh b. Muḥammad al-Qarshī, Kitāb al-Ṣamt wa Ḥifz al-Lisān, ed. Muḥammad Aḥmad 'Āshūr, Cairo, 1986.
- _____, Muhāsabat al-Nafs, Cairo, n.d.
- Ibn al-Athīr, Al-Kāmil fi 'l-Tārīkh, ed. C.J. Tornberg, 13 vols., Leyden and Uppsala, 1864.
- Ibn al-Jawzī, 'Abd al-Raḥmān, Talbīs al-Iblīs, Cairo, n.d.
- _____, Ṣifat al-Ṣafwa, 4 vols., Hyderabad, 1355 A.H.
- _____, Al-Muntazam fī Tārīkh al-Mulūk wa 'l-Umam, 10 vols., Hyderabad, 1358 A.H.
- Ibn Kathīr, Abu 'l-Fidā', Al-Nihāya wa 'l-Bidāya, 12 vols., Riyāḍ, 1966.
- Ibn Khaldūn, Abū Zayd 'Abd al-Raḥmān, Shifā' al-Sā'il wa Tahdhīb al-Masā'il, Beirut, n.d.
- Ibn Khallikān, Aḥmad b. Muḥammad, Wafayāt al-A'yan wa Anbā' Abnā' al-Zamān, ed. Iḥsan 'Abbās, 8 vols., Beirut, 1968.
- _____, _____, tr. M. De Slane, Ibn Khallikan's Biographical Dictionary, 4 vols., Paris, 1842-48.
- Ibn Mājah, Abū 'Abd Allāh Muḥammad, Sunan Ibn Mājah, 2 vols., Cairo, n.d.

- Ibn Manẓūr, Jamāl al-Dīn Muḥammad, Lisān al-‘Arab, ed. Yūsūf Khiyāṭ, 3 vols., Beirut, n.d.
- Ibn Miskawayh, Abū ‘Alī Aḥmad, Kitāb Tajārib al-Umam, ed. H.F. Amedroz, Oxford, 1921. Tr. D.S. Margoliouth, The Experience of Nations, 5 vols., Oxford, 1922.
- _____, Tahdhīb al-Akhlāq wa Taḥhīr al-A‘rāq, Beirut, n.d.
- Ibn Sa‘d, Abū ‘Abd Allāh b. ‘Abd al-‘Azīz, Tabaqāt al-Kubrā, 8 vols., Beirut, 1978.
- Ibn Taymiyya, Taqī al-Dīn Aḥmad, Majmū‘ Fatāwā, 38 vols., Riyāḍ, 1381 A.H.
- Al-‘Imād al-Ḥanbalī, Abū ‘l-Falāḥ Ibn, Shadharāt al-Dhahab fī Akhbār Man Dhahab, 8 vols., Cairo, 1350 A.H.
- Al-Iṣfahānī, Abū Nu‘aym, Hilyat al-Awliyā’, 10 vols., Cairo, 1932.
- Jalāl al-Dīn Rūmī, Mathnawī, tr. R.A. Nicholson, The Mathnawi of Jalaluddin Rumi, London, 1937.
- Jāmī, ‘Abd al-Raḥmān, Nafahāt al-Uns, Tehran, n.d.
- Al-Jīlānī, ‘Abd al-Qādir, Al-Ghunya li Tālib Tarīq al-Ḥaqq, Cairo, n.d.
- Al-Kalābādhī, Abū Ishāq Muḥammad, Al-Ta‘arruf li Madhhab Ahl al-Taṣawwuf, Cairo, 1960.
- Al-Kharrāz, Abū Sa‘īd, Kitāb al-Ṣidq, tr. A.J. Arberry, The Book of truthfulness, London, 1937.
- Al-Makkī, Abū Tālib Muḥammad b. ‘Alī, ‘Ilm al-Qulūb, ed. ‘Abd al-Qādir Aḥmad ‘Aṭā’, Cairo, 1964.

_____, Qūt al-Qulūb fī Mu‘āmalat al-Mahbūb wa Waṣf Tarīq al-Murīd ilā Maqām al-Tawhīd, 2 vols., Cairo, 1961.

_____, _____, 4 vols., Cairo, 1932.

_____, _____, Manuscript, British Library, no. 7726, 2, 1351 ff. Manuscript, Chester Beatty, no. 3698, 1, 195 ff.

Al-Muḥāsibī, Abū ‘l-Ḥārith Asad, Al-Ri‘āya li Huqūq Allāh, ed. Margaret Smith, London, 1940.

Al-Nawbakhtī, Abū Muḥammad al-Ḥasan b. Mūsā, Kitāb Firaq al-Shī‘a, ed. H. Ritter, Istanbul, 1931.

Al-Qur’ān al-Karīm, tr. Abdullah Yusuf Ali, The Meaning of the Glorious Qur’ān, London, 1983.

Al-Qushayrī, Abū ‘l-Qāsim ‘Abd al-Karīm, Al-Risāla fī ‘ilm al-Taṣawwuf, Cairo, 1346 A.H.

Al-Rundī, Ibn ‘Abbād, Al-Rasā’il al-Ṣuḡhrā, ed. P. Nwyia, Beirut, 1974.

Al-Rāzī, Fakhr al-Dīn, Mafātiḥ al-Ghayb, 8 vols., n.p., 1328 A.H.

Al-Ṣafadī, Ṣalāḥ al-Dīn Khalīl b. Aybak, Kitāb al-Wāfī bi ‘l-Wafayāt, 22 vols., Cairo, 1974.

Al-Sarrāj, Abū Naṣr, Kitāb al-Luma‘ fi ‘l-Taṣawwuf, ed. R.A. Nicholson, London, 1914.

Al-Shahrastānī, Muḥammad b. ‘Abd al-Karīm, Kitāb al-Milal wa ‘l-Nihal, tr. A.K. Kazi and J.G. Flynn, Muslims Sects and Divisions, London, 1984.

Al-Shaʿrānī, ʿAbd al-Wahhāb b. Aḥmad, Al-Tabaqāt al-Kubrā, Cairo, 1954.

Al-Subkī, Tāj al-Dīn Abū Naṣr ʿAbd al-Wahhāb b. ʿAlī, Tabaqāt al-Shāfiʿiyya al-Kubrā, 10 vols., Cairo, 1964.

Al-Sulamī, ʿAbd al-Raḥmān, Tabaqāt al-Sūfiyya, Leyden, 1960.

Al-Suyūṭī, Jalāl al-Dīn ʿAbd al-Raḥmān, Al-Itqān fī ʿUlūm al-Qurʾān, 4 vols., Cairo, n.d.

_____, Tagrīr al-Istinād fī Tafsīr al-Ijtihād, (ed. Fuʾād ʿAbd al-Munʿim Aḥmad), Alexandria, 1983.

Al-Ṭabarī, Abū Jaʿfar Muḥammad b. Jarīr, Jāmiʿ al-Bayān ʿan Taʾwīl āyī al-Qurʾān, 30 vols., Cairo, 1968.

Al-Tirmīdhī, Abū ʿĪsā Muḥammad, Sahīh al-Tirmīdhī, explanation by Imām Ibn al-Aʿrābī al-Malikī, 14 vols., Cairo, 1934.

_____, Al-Jāmiʿ al-Sahīh, ed. ʿAbd al-Wahhāb ʿAbd al-Laṭīf ʿUthmān, 5 vols., Medina, 1974.

Al-Yāfiʿī, Abū Muḥammad ʿAbd Allāh b. Asad, Mirʾāt al-Janān wa ʿIbrat al-Yaqzān, 4 vols., Medina, 1338 A.H.

SECONDARY SOURCES

- Anawati, G.C. Mystique Musulmane, Paris, 1961.
- Arberry, A.J. An introduction to the history of Sufism, London, n.d.
- _____, Sufism: An account of the mystics of Islam, London, 1950.
- _____, "Djunayd", E.I², 2, p.600.
- _____, "Ibn Abi 'l-Dunyā on penitence", JRAS, 1950, pp.48-63.
- _____, Revelation and reason in Islam, London, 1957.
- Baldick, J. Mystical Islam: An introduction to Sufism, London, 1989.
- Böwering, G. The mystical vision of existence in classical Islam (The hermeneutics of the Sūfī Sahl al-Tustarī), Berlin, 1980.
- Brockelmann, C. Geschichte Der Arabischen Litteratur, Leyden, 1934.
- Danner, V. "The early development of Sufism", Islamic spirituality (Foundation), ed. S.Hosseini Nasr, London, 1987, pp.239-264.
- Al-Dhahabī, Muḥammad Ḥusayn. Al-Isrā'īliyyāt fi 'l-Tafsīr wa 'l-Hadīth, Cairo, 1971.
- Duri, A.A. The rise of historical writing among the Arabs, Princeton, 1983.
- Encyclopaedia of Islam, Old Edition, Leyden, 1913-1936.
- _____, New Edition, Leyden, 1954- .

- Goldziher, I. "Die dogmatische Partei der Salimijja", Gesammelte Schriften, Hildesheim, 1970, vol. 5, pp. 76-85.
- Iqbal, A. The life and works of Jalal-ud-Din Rumi, London, 1983.
- Juynboll, G.H.A. The authenticity of the tradition literature, Leyden, 1969.
- Kadeer, A.H.A. The life, personality and writings of al-Junayd, London, 1962.
- _____, "The Rasā'il of al-Junayd", I.Q., (1), 1954, pp. 70-89.
- _____, "The doctrine of al-Junayd", I.Q., (1), 1954, pp. 167-177.
- _____, "Al-Junayd's theory of Fanā'", I.Q., (1), 1954, pp. 219-228.
- Lane, E.W. Arabic-English Lexicon, ed. Stanley Lane-Poole, 8 vols., Edinburgh, 1863-1893.
- Massignon, L. "Sālimiyya", E.I¹, 4, p. 115.
- _____. "Abū Ṭālib al-Makkī", E.I², 1, p. 153.
- _____. La passion de Husayn Ibn Mansur Hallaj, 4 vols., Paris, 1975.
- _____. "Sahl al-Tustarī", E.I¹, 4, p. 63.
- Momen, M. An introduction to Shī'ī Islam, Yale, 1985.
- Nakamura, K. Al-Ghazālī: Invocation & supplication, (tr. Kitāb al-adhkār wa 'l-Da'wāt), Cambridge, 1990.

- Nasr, S.H. Sadr al-Dīn Shīrāzī and his transcendent theosophy, Tehran, 1978.
- _____, Islamic Spirituality (Foundation), London, 1987.
- Nwyia, P. Ibn 'Abbād De Ronda: Lettres de direction spirituelle al-Rasā'il al-Ṣuḡhrā, Beirut, 1986.
- _____, "Ibn 'Abbād al-Rundī", E.I², 3, pp. 670-671.
- _____, Ibn Abbad de Ronda, Beirut, 1957.
- Pedersen, J. "Ḥulmāniyya", E.I², 3, p. 570.
- Quasem, A. The ethics of al-Ghazālī, Petaling Jaya, 1975.
- Reckendorf, H. "Ammār b. Yāsir", E.I², 1, p. 448.
- Robson, J. "Abū Dharr", E.I², 1, p. 114.
- _____, "Ḥadīth", E.I², 3, pp. 25-26.
- Schimmel, A. Mystical Dimensions of Islam, (3rd edition), Chapel Hill, 1975.
- Sellheim, R. "Al-Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī", E.I², 4, pp. 1111-1112.
- Sezgin, F. Geschichte Des Arabischen Schrifttums, 9 vols., Leyden, 1961.
- Shukri, M.A. The mystical doctrine of Abū Tālib al-Makkī as found in his book Qūt al-Qulūb, unpublished Ph.D thesis, University of Edinburgh, 1976.

Smart, N. The religious experience of mankind, Glasgow, 1970.

Smith, M. An early mystic of Baghdād, London, 1935.

_____, Readings from the mystics of Islam, London, 1950.

_____, Rābi'a the mystic and her fellow Saints in Islam, Cambridge, 1928.

_____, "The forerunner of al-Ghazali", JRAS, (Jan) part 1, 1936, pp. 65-78.

Tabataba'ī. Shi'ite Islam, Houston, 1971.

Vaglieri, L.V. "Abd Allāh b. al-'Abbās", E.I², 1, pp. 40-41.

_____, "Alī Ibn Abī Ṭālib", E.I², 1, p. 381.

Vajda, G. "Isrā'īliyyāt", E.I², 4, pp. 211-212.

Walzer, R. "Akhlāk", E.I², 1, pp. 325-329.

Watt, W.M. The faith and practice of al-Ghazali, (tr. of al-Munqidh min al-Dalāl), London, 1953.

_____, The formative period of Islamic thought, Edinburgh, 1976.

_____, Islamic philosophy and theology, (extended survey), Edinburgh, 1985.

_____, "Ā'isha bint Abī Bakr", E.I², 1, pp. 307-308.

_____, Muslim intellectual: A study of al-Ghazālī, Edinburgh, 1971.

Wensinck, A.J. "Al-Khaḍīr", E.I², 4, pp. 902-904.

_____, Concordance et indices de la tradition Musulmane, 7 vols., Leyden, 1969.

Wilzer, S. Untersuchungen Zu Ghazzālīs Kitāb at-Tauba, unpublished Ph.D thesis, University of Erlangen, 1952.

_____, "Untersuchungen Zu Ghazzālīs Kitāb at-Tauba", Der Islam, (32), 1955-57, pp. 237-309, (33); 1957-58, pp. 51-120.

Winter, T.J. Al-Ghazālī: The remembrance of death and the afterlife, (tr. Kitāb dhikr al-mawt wa mā ba'dahu, Ihya' 'Ulūm al-Dīn), Cambridge, 1989.

Zaehner, R.C. Hindu and Muslim Mysticism, London, 1969.